DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 154 161 08 CE 015 748

AUTHOR Kane, Roslyn D.; And Others
TITLE Problems of Women in Apprenticeship.
INSTITUTION RJ Associates, Inc., Arlington, Va.
SPONS AGENCY Bureau of Occupational and Adult Education (DHEW/OE), Washington, D.C. Vocational Education Research Branch.
PUB DATE Dec 77
NOTE 175p.; Not available in hard copy due to faint print in original document

EDRS PRICE MF-$0.83 Plus Postage. HC Not Available from EDRS.
DESCRIPTORS *Apprenticeships; Background; *Employment Problems; *Equal Opportunities (Jobs); Failure Factors; Females; Job Applicants; Occupational Surveys; Personnel Integration; Recruitment; *Sex Discrimination; Sex Role; Sex Stereotypes; Success Factors; *Working Women
IDENTIFIERS Joint Apprenticeship Councils

ABSTRACT

A study was conducted to determine why so few women applicants were admitted to apprenticeships, what the differences were between the successful and unsuccessful applicants, and what programs and services were needed to insure the success of both applicants and apprentices. In order to identify the major problem areas, 110 questionnaires were analyzed (77 from women apprentices and 33 from applicants) as well as interviews with 17 Joint Apprenticeship Councils (JACs) and 13 recruitment programs. While shortcomings were found in the societal, psychological, and developmental experiences of women, their lack of suitable education and training was considered especially critical because of its effect on their ability to meet admission requirements, to score well on written examinations, to pass oral interviews, and to qualify for points given according to previous course work. Another serious obstacle for women was obtaining a job for the apprenticeship. Once accepted, women encountered a further set of problems: acceptance by fellow workers and supervisors, male chivalry, physical or technical job demands, related instruction, and promotion. Women often voluntarily dropped out and strongly felt the need for supportive services. Specific recommendations were made and directed to the school systems, JACs, unions, employers, and Department of Labor to aid in the solution of these problems. (In an appendix the methodology used in the study is described in full.) (ELG)

****
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
****

ED154161

Problems of Women in Apprenticeship

Prepared by

Roslyn D. Kane
Elizabeth Dee
Jill Miller

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH, EDUCATION & WELFARE
NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION

THIS DOCUMENT HAS BEEN REPRODUCED EXACTLY AS RECEIVED FROM THE PERSON OR ORGANIZATION ORIGINATING IT. POINTS OF VIEW OR OPINIONS STATED DO NOT NECESSARILY REPRESENT OFFICIAL NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION POSITION OR POLICY

Rj Associates, Inc.
1018 Wilson Boulevard
Arlington, Virginia 22209

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

Jill Miller

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC) AND USERS OF THE ERIC SYSTEM."

December 1977

The research reported herein was performed pursuant to a contract with the Vocational Education Research Branch, Bureau of Occupational and Adult Education, Office of Education, U.S. Department of Health, Education and Welfare. Contractors undertaking such projects under Government sponsorship are encouraged to express freely their professional judgment in the conduct of the project. Points of view or opinions stated do not, therefore, necessarily represent official Office of Education position or policy.

CE 015 748

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This report was prepared by Rj Associates, Inc., under the direction of Roslyn D. Kane, Project Director. Teaming with Ms. Kane in the design and conduct of the research were Jill Miller and Elizabeth Dee. Margaret Armstrong served as a consultant to the project, conducting selected interviews and assisting in the conceptualization of this report. Deep appreciation goes to Alinda Fells for the production of this document and Incha Kim who assisted in that effort.

The research staff owe special thanks to women apprentices across the country who responded so eloquently to our questions with their letters and comments. We would also like to express our appreciation to the representatives of the Joint Apprenticeship Councils and the outreach and recruitment programs for their cooperation in providing time and information during our interviews.

Table of Contents

Introduction 1

Part I--Problems in Apprenticeship

A. Problems in the Background of Women 4

1. Demographic Characteristics 4

2. Educational Background 6

3. Employment 12

4. Motivation 13

B. Problems in Admission to Apprenticeship 16

1. Problems in Reaching the Women 16

2. Problems in Meeting the Requirements 23

3. Problems with Written Examinations/Academic Background . . . 29

4. Problems with the Oral Interview 31

5. Problems with the Point System 35

6. Problems Obtaining a Job 38

7. Programs Designed to Recruit and Prepare Women for Apprenticeship 44

8. Summary 55

C. Problems in Apprenticeship 56

1. Problems with Fellow Workers and Supervisors 56

2. Problems with Chivalry 59

3. Problems on the Job 63

4. Problems with Related Instruction 66

5. Problems with Placements 67

6. Problems of Retention 69

7. Need for Supportive Services 72

Table of Contents (Cont'd)

Part II--Issues and Conclusions

A. Where Did All the Applicants Go? 77

B. Different Women/Different Trades 80

C. The Point System 89

D. Job Placement Problems 92

E. Social Networking and Transportation 96

F. Government Regulations 98

G. Selection of a Trade 114

Part III -- Recommendations

A. Recommendations to School Systems 118

B. Recommendations to JACs, Unions, and Employers 124

C. Department of Labor (DOL) 128

D. Recommendation for a Model Recruitment Program 131

Appendix

Methodology

Introduction

In the past few years, efforts have been made to increase the number of women in apprenticeship. The initial efforts to increase women's participation in apprenticeship focused on identifying women who were interested in apprenticeship and getting them to apply. The data indicated that indeed over the past few years, more women have applied for apprenticeship. However, the number of women apprentices and journeypersons has shown only modest gains.

Our purpose in conducting this research was to determine why so few women applicants were being admitted to apprenticeship. What was the difference between the unsuccessful applicant and the successful apprentice? We sought to query the women themselves, both the applicants and apprentices, to determine the differences in their background and preparation so as best to advise young women interested in apprenticeship how to prepare for successful admission to apprenticeship. We interviewed individuals who make the decisions regarding admission and rejection to apprenticeship programs. We sought answers to the same questions from programs that are designed to recruit and prepare women for admission to apprenticeship.

We found that the problems of women's entry into apprenticeship were far more complex than lack of preparation on the part of the women or sexual bias on the part of the companies and unions. We confirmed our expectation that women's problems in gaining access to apprenticeship begin long before women ever consider apprenticeship as a vocation and that their problems continue even after they become journeypersons (for the very few who do).

We have chosen, therefore, to present the findings of our research using a chronological approach to illuminate the problems women face in their pursuit of apprenticeship. Part I of the report describes the problems as recounted in responses, letters, and comments of the women themselves, in the responses and comments of those who sponsor apprentice-

ship programs (Joint Apprenticeship Councils, 1/ company and union representatives), and the responses and comments of those who assist women in gaining admission to apprenticeship (recruitment programs). The reader is advised that in Part I where conflicting views and descriptions of problems are presented, the point of view will depend on who is commenting.

We have relied heavily on quotes from the women who wrote profuse comments on the survey instruments, and those interviewed including JACs, outreach and preapprenticeship programs, related instructors and apprentices. By and large, they speak for themselves.

The Part I narrative is followed by an analysis of the major issues affecting women's entry into apprenticeship, and recommendations based on the observations and findings.

Outline of the Report

PART I

- The first chapter defines the demographic, educational, and prior work experience characteristics of the apprentices and applicants.

- The second chapter describes the problems of obtaining admission to an apprenticeship.

- The third chapter describes the problems apprentices experience once admitted.

PART II

- Part II analyzes the unique problems and issues that were observed during the study, draws conclusions, and makes recommendations on these overriding problems.

1/ Joint Apprenticeship Councils (JACs)--local sponsors of apprenticeship programs representing the union and the employers. In some cases, there are also community members.

PART III

- Part III directs recommendations to institutions where changes are required to increase the number of women apprentices and journeypersons.

APPENDIX

- A detailed description of the methodology can be found in the appendix.

Part I -- Problems in Apprenticeship

A. Problems in the Background of Women

> Women, as a whole, are not given the opportunities to learn about mechanical or other trade related subjects. By this I mean the day to day exchange of ideas and the use of the various "languages" used in describing the work or events that are the topic of discussion. Men and boys move in easy groups--learning from one another. A girl who joins them and wants to be part of that group has often been made to feel like an odd ball. We all know the various names applied to anyone, of either sex, who has an interest outside of what society has deemed right for that particular sex. What a waste of intelligence and talent! 1/

The research has indicated that many of the problems faced by women at the time they seek entry into apprenticeship are problems that developed long before they ever considered apprenticeship. The problems relate to a variety of societal, educational, psychological, and developmental experiences of the women as they are growing up. This chapter will describe these problems as reflected in the data obtained from the women 2/, and the information reported in the interviews. 3/

1. Demographic Characteristics

a. Age

The age of women seeking entry into apprenticeship indicates that women do not move into apprenticeship directly from high school. Most of the women successfully applying for apprenticeship are in their mid-twenties or older.

Sixty percent of the women seeking entry into apprenticeship were in their twenties. Twenty-six percent were between 18 and 20 years of age. For more than 74% of the women, it was a number of years after leaving high school that they sought apprenticeship. The interviews confirmed that men are more likely to apply directly from high school, and that the average age of women who apply is two to five years older than that of the men.

1/ Comments of a woman applicant in response to the survey instrument; unless a footnote indicates another source, the direct quotations in the report reflect comments of women applicants and apprentices in response to the survey instrument.

2/ Many of the women responded with long letters in addition to completing the instrument.

3/ See Methodology in Appendix for organizations that were interviewed.

Age (in years)	Apprentices 1/	Applicants 2/	Total
18-20	25%	29%	26%
21-24	38%	42%	39%
25-29	23%	16%	21%
30 and over	14%	27%	14%

The age of women applying for apprenticeship would indicate that many women are reaching the decision to pursue apprenticeship on their own or due to factors not directly related to their experiences while still in school. A similar pattern was found in the previous Rj Associates' study of women in postsecondary non-traditional vocational training which revealed that women's own interests and ability were the most influential factors in their decision to enter non-traditional training. 3/

b. Race

The distribution of minority apprentices and applicants is close to the national rate of minorities in the population, but there is some indication that Black women may be having comparatively more difficulty being

Minorities	Apprentices	Applicants	National Rate
White	81%	76%	83%
Black	16%	21%	11%
Other Non-White	3%	3%	6%

admitted to apprenticeship than White women. Recruitment programs 4/ reported that certain cultural patterns often played a critical role in their attempts to recruit Hispanic and Black women for apprenticeship. For example, recruiters/counselors reported that the social background of Hispanic women is very restrictive and dictates that women are not supposed to work. The experiences of Black women often dictate that they are not to earn more than men, it was reported.

1/ Apprentices are those who have been declared eligible for apprenticeship either by a JAC, or by a company and/or a union.

2/ Applicants have applied for admission to apprenticeship, but have not been declared eligible.

3/ Rj Associates, Inc., A Study of the Factors Influencing the Participation of Women in Non-traditional Occupations in Postsecondary Vocational Training Schools, Arlington, Virginia: Rj Associates, Inc., 1976.

4/ Outreach programs designed to recruit and prepare women for apprenticeship are referred to in this report as recruitment programs.

c. Marital Status

Considering the very large percentage of the sample that were 21 years of age and over, an unusually large percent of the women apprentices (43%) were single.

Marital Status	Apprentices	Applicants	Total
Married	31%	23%	29%
Single	43%	61%	48%
Divorced, Separated and Widowed	26%	16%	23%

Forty-one percent of all apprentices had children; 59% did not. Of those who had children, 67% had two or more.

Number of Children	Percent of those with children	Percent of the Total Sample
1	32%	13%
2	46%	19%
3 or more	21%	9%

All of the divorced, separated, or widowed women apprentices had children. Predictably, women with two or more children had more problems in apprenticeship as is often the case of working mothers. Women with one child had the least problems, and the presence of a husband made little difference in the problems women had.

2. Educational Background

The percentage of apprentices that had a college preparatory program in high school is very high. The percentage of those with a vocational education background is so low that it is insignificant. Several women had taken scattered vocational courses which were relevant to apprentice-

High School Background	Apprentices	Applicants
College Preparatory	53%	46%
General Education	44%	50%
Vocational Education	3%	3%

ship, but had not pursued those courses as part of a comprehensive vocational programs.

A major problem cited by the JACs 1/ was the over-emphasis in high school that is placed on encouraging students to attend college, both on the part of the parents and the schools. The tendency of many schools is to emphasize entry into college as a goal for all students, rather than the acquisition of employable skills. Vocational education still bears the stigma of the "dumping ground" for students who cannot make it to college. With this as the prevailing attitude, students are not advised in a positive vein of the advantages of participating in vocational education. This attitude is reflected in career day programs in high school which are often limited to careers in the professional areas only.

Where information about non-professional careers is provided in schools, it is frequently inadequate. Industry and JAC representatives complained that although they regularly attend Career Day programs in high schools, they usually meet with students who are already seniors, which is much too late for students who might be interested in apprenticeship to take the vocational, mathematics, and science courses that would prove useful in entering the apprenticeable occupations. They also stated that audiences were composed primarily of young men. Although many reported women students in attendance, they were clearly a minority except in cases where the total student body was required to attend.

1/ Joint Apprenticeship Councils--local sponsors of apprenticeship programs representing the union and the employers. In some cases, there are also community members.

Many of the JACs believe that the school counselors themselves know little or nothing about apprenticeship and cannot give proper counseling to men or women concerning the opportunities for training and employment, the nature and responsibilities of the jobs, or the requirements for admission. For many students, the only exposure to information about the skilled trades is the JAC speaker at Career Days.

The lack of information on the skilled trades severely limits women's knowledge of and participation in courses in school which can be beneficial in gaining access to apprenticeship and in developing basic skills useful on the job. The result is that women are at a disadvantage both in being accepted into apprenticeship and in being able to handle the tasks on the job. Later, when women apply for apprenticeship, many find themselves in a position of having to go back to school, on their own time and money, to get the background they could have had without undue investment of time and money, if it had been acquired while they were still in high school.

Not only do the counselors seem to lack sufficient information about apprenticeship either to spark interest or to provide substantive information, but they tend to discourage women who do exhibit an interest in such a non-traditional pursuit. One apprentice suggested more open minded counseling should be done in school to let women know they have or could have a future in a trade:

> When I went through high school (1960-1964) I asked the guidance counselor about getting into an aircraft mechanic school and was told girls didn't do things like that. This kind of attitude is not only wasteful, but stupid . . .I lost several years of my life preparing for and being engaged in something I did not really want to do.

Yet most of the responses from the apprentices or applicants indicated that more or better counseling would not be helpful, which may indicate that the counseling that is presently provided is so irrelevant or of such poor quality that students cannot envision it being useful even if it were improved or expanded.

Additionally, the vocational testing program utilized in schools is not very useful according to the apprentices and applicants. Although the interest and aptitude tests given to students are the same for both sexes, in most cases, the interpretation and translation of the results of the tests into jobs is based upon the sex of the students. As reported by the women in the study, if she is a woman, interest and aptitude for the skilled trades often go unrecognized or undirected.

Not only are the young women encouraged along traditional 1/ lines in vocational counseling, but they have been actively discouraged from or discriminated against taking non-traditional vocational education classes. 2/ Women apprentices complained frequently that high school did not prepare them for apprenticeship as indicated by the following quotes:

> My high school did not offer vocational training except mechanical drafting. Junior high had only one semester "industrial arts" not open to girls in 1965.
>
> I feel women need more opportunity to learn the use of tools.
>
> Women were not admitted at the time.
>
> Women were not allowed, or highly discouraged in taking courses in shop, architect, or mechanical drawing, etc., which are much needed in apprenticeship training.
>
> Women didn't take shop courses.

Eighty-eight percent of the apprentices and 94% of the applicants had less than one year of vocational education, either in secondary or post-secondary school.

1/ Traditional vocational classes are female-intensive classes in which more than 75% of total student enrollments are women.

2/ Non-traditional vocational classes are male-intensive classes in which less than 25% of total student enrollments are women.

Years of Vocational Education	Apprentices	Applicants
0	67%	78%
Up to 1	21%	16%
More than one year	12%	6%

Even high schools with large vocational education programs do not encourage women in the skilled trades, but direct them into the more traditional women's areas of health, business, or home economics. This tradition deprives women of the challenges and experiences given to their male counterparts and reinforces occupational segregation.

> High school girls, in the past at least, have been carefully steered away from the shop and mathematical courses. This will have to be corrected--with girls who have mechanical ability and an interest in the trades. They should be guided into courses that will help them not only pass the test but achieve the desired points necessary for apprenticeship qualifications.

Some women reported that they were able to pick up related skills even though they were pursuing traditional occupations. The women in nursing or other health-related fields picked up more mathematics and science than the liberal arts students. The women who developed the most related skills in school were the fine arts majors or those in commercial arts, where they learned spatial relations and had some opportunity to work with tools and machines.

The research revealed some unexpected and contradictory information regarding the mathematics backgrounds of women seeking apprenticeship. According to those interviewed, women have a tendency to take less mathematics and science in high school, but according to the responses from the women, a high percentage had had more than two years of mathematics.

Courses in Mathematics	Apprentices	Applicants
0	--	5%
Up to one	--	11%
Up to two	39%	21%
Up to three	30%	26%
Three or more	30%	37%

As previously mentioned, an unexpectedly large number of women in the sample had participated in a college preparatory program in high school. These were the women who had more than two years of mathematics.

The women who had a general curriculum in high school were not likely to have had more than two years of mathematics. While these women are not excluded from these classes, they have a different orientation regarding the importance of these courses for career development and are not encouraged to take these subjects because it is presumed that they do not need them.

Of the college preparatory women, less than a third stated they had problems with mathematics on the written examination for entry into apprenticeship. Even so, 48% of the apprentices felt more mathematics would be helpful for women planning to become apprentices, and 62% felt a strong mathematical background was very important.

Highest Grade	Apprentices	Applicants
Less than high school graduate	4%	10%
High school graduate	53%	62%
One to three years of college	26%	17%
College graduate or more	17%	10%

The sample indicates that 30% of the White applicants and 15% of the minority applicants had some college prior to apprenticeship, but few studied apprenticeship-related courses. The majority reported that they were in liberal arts courses studying, among other things, sociology, criminology, education, art and political science.

Only one-fifth of the women believed that their postsecondary training helped them gain admission to apprenticeship. Of those who said that it was helpful, most stated that it helped in more of a general sense--development of ability to think and reason, increased self-confidence,

and greater awareness of the world. Forty-seven percent indicated that their postsecondary education was of no value in preparing them for their apprenticeship.

Most of the women who had taken relevant vocational education classes, (as opposed to a vocational sequence 1/), did so at the recommendation of a JAC or recruitment program in order to be given credit towards their apprenticeship for doing so.

Seventy percent of both apprentices and applicants indicated they had some experience with tools. Thirty-four percent indicated they acquired this experience at work and 6% at school; 60% had acquired their experience informally in the home or from their hobbies.

The most useful preparation for apprenticeship, in the opinion of the apprentices and applicants, would be experience with tools (79%), and vocational courses in their field of specialty (75%). None found them not useful.

In summary, the experiences women have which are relevant for admission to apprenticeship are generally acquired in informal ways outside of school, often after graduation.

3. Employment

A large percentage of women spent their time between high school and applying for an apprenticeship working rather than attending postsecondary schools or in full-time home care of children. A majority of those not working had been out of the labor force for less than one year.

Period Out of the Labor Force When they Applied	Apprentices	Applicants
None	63%	61%
Less than one year	24%	25%
More than one year or never employed	13%	14%

1/ A vocational sequence is a series of courses in a vocational program which, if completed, provides a student with entry level skills.

The work experience history of apprentices and applicants was almost the same. Sixty-three percent of the women who gained admission to apprenticeship were working when they applied. Another 24% had been out of the labor force less than one year; only 13% were re-entrants, having been out of the labor force for more than one year. Most of their work experience, however, was not related to apprenticeship.

Most of the jobs held by women were traditional women's jobs--predominantly clerical and service occupations, where women had little or no opportunity to use or develop trade-related skills. Thirty-four percent of the women apprentices had been employed in clerical occupations, 16% in service, 14% in professional and technical occupations.

Previous of Present Employment	Apprentices	Applicants
Professional, technical or managerial	14%	7%
Clerical and sales	34%	36%
Skilled	3%	7%
Semi-skilled	33%	14%
Services	16%	21%
Other : laborer, agriculture and military	0%	14%
	100%	100%

The marked difference in the percent of women employed in semi-skilled occupations among the apprentices (33%), and the applicants (14%), suggests the large number who gain admission directly to apprenticeship from the production line. The data and the interviews indicate that these women were not necessarily seeking apprenticeships, but were recruited as employees in industrial plants.

4. Motivation

The decision of women to seek training and employment in an apprenticeship program was arrived at in different ways. Some women became interested in apprenticeship because their husbands were in a program.

Other women were seeking a high paying job after a family breakup or divorce, because they found themselves in a position of having to support themselves and their children, and they discovered that the trades offered them the salary they needed. Other women were seeking a satisfying career after finding that a traditional occupation was not fulfilling their needs. Some women apparently discovered that they enjoyed mechanical work around the house and wanted to translate that interest into a job. Others were exploring new options.

Many of these women reported that they had little prior knowledge of the possibilities in the trades, and no idea of the nature of the work. Women who enter apprenticeships, often are looking for an opportunity to do something different and more interesting, and/or earn higher wages. As one apprentice described it,

> I had spent five years working as a licensed practical nurse, I didn't enjoy the work and I was earning $2.70 an hour. I knew from high school theater-set building experience that I enjoyed carpentry, and decided to pursue it when I started seeing pictures of other women in newspapers across the country who'd gotten into union apprentice programs. . . I had an idea that I'd enjoy the work a lot more. 1/

Summary

Women's high school experience has left them ill-equipped for an apprenticeship. They had little orientation to opportunities in the skilled trades, knowledge of what the job entailed, knowledge of the skills required, etc. Their physical, psychological, and skill development had all been directed towards the traditional female role. Although some of the college preparatory women had had an adequate background in mathematics and science, those women in the general curriculum had not.

The traditional skills women developed also did not lead them to employment in areas where apprentice-related skills could be developed. Most women did not apply for apprenticeship programs immediately after graduating from high school. Of the few that did apply, many knew little about the industry in which they were seeking employment and most were inadequately prepared to convince a JAC that they should be accepted.

1/ "Women in Construction," The MacNeil/Lehrer Report, New York: Educational Broadcasting Corporation, aired August 22, 1977.

The women continued to suffer the consequences of the lack of opportunity in secondary school all the way through their transition years. Postsecondary schools, family, and jobs, were not sources of reinforcement to women any more than their school years had been. At the time they sought admission into apprenticeship, they were generally unprepared. Only the women employed in a semi-skilled occupation where an employer had an apprenticeship program that stressed the recruitment of women from the plant, was a woman likely to have made positive steps toward preparing for apprenticeship during her transition years.

B. Problems in Admission to Apprenticeship

1. Problems in Reaching the Women

Reaching women who are interested in pursuing apprenticeship is not an easy task. They have not been following the ordinary path that would place them in the pipeline that feeds into apprenticeship. The fact that women may be in colleges and other postsecondary institutions, employed in traditional jobs, or out of the labor force entirely, requires that a variety of different techniques be utilized in order to reach women who would be interested in apprenticeship.

Recruitment techniques are impacted by factors other than simply trying to reach women, however. The different types of apprenticeships--construction, industrial, or other crafts--have different requirements, and require different techniques to gain admission. Apprenticeship programs in the construction trades, for instance, have accepted applicants only sporadically in the last few years because of the slow economic situation in that industry. Industrial apprenticeship programs, although also subject to economic fluctuations, have tended to commence apprenticeship programs on a fairly regular basis, generally twice a year.

Recruitment efforts are further complicated by the differences in the women themselves. There appears to be one group of women, highly motivated toward apprenticeship, who apply directly on their own to JACs without seeking (perhaps not knowing) of the assistance of special programs designed to prepare women for admission. They almost always seek admission to the best known or most highly visible apprenticeships, frequently in the construction trades. The data indicate that women in this group tend to be quite well-educated, very often having attended college and sometimes having graduated.

There is a second group who are women looking for a job, usually any job, who have very likely never considered apprenticeship. They may have had either general curriculum or a college preparatory program in high school but are unlikely to have had any postsecondary training. In their effort to find

a job they seek the services of an organization such as LEAP 1/ or RTP, Inc. 2/ which are well known for assisting people find employment. They are often referred by these programs to the coordinator for the women's component where they are screened and/or encouraged to seek apprenticeship. In almost all cases, the apprenticeships they are informed of and geared to are in the construction trades. This referral is due in large part to the requirements of their DOL contract which requires that LEAP/RTP-type programs 3/ place their emphasis on opportunities for apprenticeship in the construction trades.

There is yet a third group of women who are recruited into apprenticeship. These are women who are employed in semi-skilled occupations in industries. They generally have had a general curriculum in high school. They are not particularly motivated toward apprenticeship but appear to have sought traditional women's production semi-skilled jobs in industry because they offer a good salary compared to most "women's" jobs; and because these women have no other particular skills.

The reader must keep in mind these major differences--in the types of apprenticeship, the different types of women who apply, and, yet two additional variables:

a. The different types of recruitment programs 4/ which help to provide an explanation for the varying and often contradictory information that appears on the following pages in describing women's problems in admission to apprenticeship.

b. The different approach of JAC representatives/coordinators and the employer sponsors that were interviewed to the problems of women in apprenticeship. These representatives tend to have two different approaches:

1/ Labor Education Advancement Program of the National Urban League.

2/ Recruitment and Training Program, Inc.

3/ LEAP/RTP-type program is referred to here as the women's component of national programs that were originally designed to assist minority men gain access to apprenticeship.

4/ Recruitment program is an umbrella term to describe outreach programs designed to recruit and prepare women for entry into apprenticeship.

(1) JACs and employers interested in recruiting "good" women into apprenticeship because of their perception of the needs of governmental affirmative action requirements; e.g., since 1972, Maritime Commission has required that women be included in the affirmative action plan of shipbuilders.

(2) Those JACs and employers who have no particular interest in qualifying women, but still do not want to risk a complaint charge of discriminatory practices.

a. Recruitment for Apprenticeship in the Construction Trades

Apprenticeship programs in the construction trades are required to announce 30 days in advance of the closing date that they are accepting applications. To gear up to recruit women adequately within this time frame, and to counsel and prepare the women properly for the application process, is somewhat of an overwhelming task.

Additionally, since the construction trades have accepted apprentices so rarely, it has been difficult for recruitment programs to build a backlog of interested women. Women who have been prepared, but do not gain admission, find other employment and are no longer available when an apprenticeship placement finally becomes available. Therefore, when recruitment programs receive word that applications are being accepted, they often have to beef up their efforts during the 30 day period to reach and convince the women clients to pursue apprenticeship in the construction trades.

Because of priorities specified in their contracts with the Department of Labor, the LEAP/RTP-type programs have concentrated almost entirely during the past few years on placing women in the construction trades. Their recruitment techniques have responded to the need to locate and prepare women for the application process within a short period of time. They utilize public service announcements, newspapers, radio, and fliers to encourage women to apply. They try to give press and media coverage to successful women in construction in hopes of encouraging other women. They consider one of the most

successful methods to be women already in the trades who are proud of and like what they do; these women are enthusiastic and effectively encourage other women to give it a try. Many Urban League clients refer friends and others to LEAP. When interested women apply they then try to provide the women with an understanding of the area, providing descriptions of the work, and sometimes utilizing visitations to job sites and conversations with contractors and other workers (preferably women workers).

Because the most well-known function of LEAP/RTP-type programs is actual job placement, there are many women who come into their offices who have never considered a non-traditional job; rather they come looking for a job. The women's coordinator may try to encourage them to apply for apprenticeship, particularly if it is during the 30 day period that an apprenticeship program is accepting applications. It was reported in the interviews that this type of "counseling" may sometimes verge more on actually "arm twisting" to get women to apply for apprenticeship.

Some of the JACs did complain in the interviews that recruitment programs refer women who really are not interested in apprenticeship. Several expressed the feeling that women are pressured to apply so that the program can fill its placement quota for its contract. The JACs felt that many of the women who are referred to them have not had previous exposure to the occupation or an opportunity to explore the work or related skills.

If the JACs complaint is valid, it appears to be a reflection of the fact that the LEAP/RTP-type programs simply have not had enough time to educate, counsel, and prepare the women. This situation is not entirely the fault of the programs. These programs, as well as the DOL, particularly in the early years, believed that the problem of getting more women into apprenticeship was mainly a problem of finding the women. Therefore, recruitment programs were designed with insufficient emphasis on preparing women with the background and skills they were lacking, which was one of the major reasons they were not getting accepted. (This argument is not

intended to diminish the fact that discriminatory practices against women were also at play.)

Some of the Women's Programs 1/ whose recruitment often depends on self-referral by women and referral from other agencies, have concentrated on screening applicants closely in the beginning to insure that those who go after apprenticeship are highly motivated, well-qualified, and have an excellent chance of success. They look for women with motivation, mechanical ability, or other related experience. Many have orientation or self-screening sessions designed for the women. Unfortunately, some programs, in trying to insure success, cream for the best applicants, the "superwomen" who will serve as an example for others. These programs may be excluding other women who are not necessarily superwomen but who do have the interest and potential, but may need somewhat more encouragement, skill development or schooling.

b. Recruiting for Apprenticeship in Industry

Recruiting women for apprenticeship in the industrial trades requires a different technique. Many industries are required under the terms of their collective bargaining agreements to accept two or more apprentices from within the plant for every applicant accepted from outside. Very often companies accept even more applicants from within and will only accept an outside applicant who has relevant experience or training. These are rarely either women or minority members.

Companies have regularly posted information regarding apprenticeship application in the plant. They report, however, that this has not been a successful technique in recruiting women. The interviews indicate that the industries with the most women apprentices have been successful because they have taken the initiative to contact, personally recruit and encourage women on the production line within the plant to apply. Recruiting women outside

1/ Women's Programs refers to programs that were organized by women to serve women in preparing for entry into apprenticeship.

the plants has not been fruitful. Thirty-six percent of the women who become apprentices responded that prior to entering apprenticeship they had been employed in semi-skilled occupations. It appears that women working on the production line are most likely to be recruited and have several other advantages over "outside" applicants. Production workers are often given credit both for related job experience and previous work for the company when they apply for apprenticeship. Thus, women working on the production line within a plant or in a shipyard have a much greater chance for admission. Some companies also offer tuition rebates for employees taking related courses. Women can thus upgrade their skills and increase their chances of acceptance for very little money. Another advantage for these women is that they can continue their present job while waiting for an apprenticeship program to begin, and meanwhile maintain all their company benefits. At the same time these women are in the most advantageous position to learn about the opportunities in apprenticeship and what is involved in the trade, since they are actually working in the same industry.

In spite of all these advantages, this technique has not been widely utilized by recruitment programs, and only a few women who are interested in apprenticeship have independently used employment on the production line as a means of gaining admission. This appears to be the case partially because of the emphasis on construction trades and a lack of knowledge and understanding of industrial apprenticeships, particularly by some of the Women's Programs.

Companies who have actively tried to recruit women from within the plant complain that they have had difficulty finding women who are interested. Some apprenticeship coordinators feel that women particularly have a difficult time committing themselves to the number of years of training required to become a journeyperson. Other women prefer to remain in production with the hope of becoming a foreman. For them, this is a more secure route, especially if they are at all unsure about apprenticeship and are not guaranteed their jobs back, if they decide they do not like or do not succeed in apprenticeship.

It was reported that men are better able to see apprenticeship as a training period and give up extra money over the short term for a good future. Women need to be made more aware of the opportunities for journeypersons. One successful tool and die apprentice stated that she received notification of acceptance into apprenticeship the same day she was offered promotion to foreman. After some consideration, she thought "anybody can be a foreman" and took the apprenticeship. She said she knew it would be harder, but it could take her somewhere, and it was worth the risk.

In general though, the women who are being recruited from the line are not necessarily women with a particular interest in or drive for apprenticeship. This group of women, who moved from production into apprenticeship, account for a large number of women apprentices in the sample who had had a general curriculum program in high school. If the 36% of women industrial apprentices are discounted, the distribution of the remaining apprentices and applicants indicates a substantially different picture of the high school background of women seeking non-industrial apprenticeship.

High School Background of
Non-industrial Apprentices and Applicants

College Preparatory - 81%
General Curriculum - 14%
Vocational Education - 5%

The picture that emerges from these data indicates two quite different types of women who have entered different types of apprenticeship programs. Women in industrial apprenticeship often come from the production line--a job taken not as a strategy for admission to apprenticeship, but because it was "a job"--they had taken general curriculum in high school and had

few employable skills. Their interest and knowledge of opportunities in apprenticeship were probably the result of active and aggressive efforts on the part of the company, not on the part of recruitment programs or on the part of the women.

The women in the non-industrial apprenticeship programs appear to be a different breed altogether--they are not like the other women, nor are they like men who go into apprenticeship. The majority are women who had a college preparatory program in high school and often some postsecondary or college experience. For whatever the reason they are highly motivated and seek apprenticeship on their own. These women have had a variety of experiences having experimented with different jobs and activities--usually unrelated to apprenticeship. In fact, these unrelated experiences often work against women at the time they seek apprenticeship. JACs often query these women on why they spent time pusuing other things if they really wanted to be an apprentice. Their other pursuits are interpreted as a lack of interest in apprenticeship.

2. Meeting the Requirements

(1) High School Diploma or G.E.D.

Almost all apprenticeship programs require a high school education or a high school equivalence certificate, although three women apprentices in the sample reported that they had not completed the 12th grade and did not indicate that they had a G.E.D. An inadequate high school education was only infrequently mentioned as a problem, although the majority of the women indicated that their high school education had not prepared them for apprenticeship. Recruitment programs advise those applicants who are not high school graduates to obtain a G.E.D., and several of these programs offer tutoring for the equivalency examination. Only one woman applicant in the sample stated that lack of education was a problem in gaining admission into apprenticeship:

I'm sorry that I can't be of much help to you. I have my own experiences, but the qualifications call for high school graduates only. That's the reason why I haven't been accepted. But I do believe if I had been given the opportunity to enter apprenticeship, I could have just as much of a chance to pass the exams as the high school graduates.

(2) Physical Condition

Although some JACs require that apprentices be in "good physical condition," there are no tests of strength given to applicants. The physical hurdle at the time of application is mostly a mental one. Some women are afraid of doing manual work, and think that they are not capable of handling heavy jobs. For other women, the issue of physical strength may be a problem, or it may be sex stereotyping on the part of the interviewer. One applicant reported that the "examiner told the women in the room that we were welcome, but would not be able to do the work. He joked about the one successful women who was 6'2" and 180 lbs." Some of the JAC representatives were surprised that small women could handle the work, but this did not alter their skepticism concerning women's ability to handle the physical requirements of the job.

(3) Age Requirements

Many of the unions, particularly in the construction trades, have not eliminated age restrictions for the apprenticeship program. For trades that still impose age restrictions, the age is 18 to 25 or 26, but some locals have established a maximum age limit as low as 22. By the time many women make the decision to enter apprenticeship, they are already considered "too old," and are turned away. Most industrial sponsors interviewed have lifted age restrictions, or at least raised them substantially, but even there, age restrictions frequently remain for anyone not already working within the plant. One union representative did state that exceptions could be made to the rule in the face of extenuating circumstances. The example of such circumstances he gave, however, was in the case of military

service--a background not common for a woman--and the age restriction was not lifted, but simply raised to 30 years.

There is no indication that age is a major factor affecting the capabilities of an apprentice. Where there are no age restrictions, the general impression was that older women once admitted, had no more and perhaps fewer problems in adjusting to apprenticeship. Although the number of problems the women had on the written examination increased slightly with age, this may be due, in part, to the fact that they have been out of school longer. However, one shop steward suggested that some of the tutoring programs that were offered by recruitment and preapprenticeship programs were more useful to the older applicants, because they were designed primarily as review or refresher courses, rather than as courses for those without academic credits.

Of the six cases 1/ decided by the U.S. Court of Appeals, the U.S. District Courts, and EEOC on the age issue, in all cases the decision was that an upper limit on the age of apprentices is illegal according to Title VII of the Civil Rights Act. The State of California 2/ has legislation expressly prohibiting the establishment of a maximum age for apprentices.

However, the issue evidently has not been generally understood, since an interview with a recruitment program in California, where it is clearly illegal, reported accepting maximum age limitations. All recruitment programs across the country reported the problem of women who are refused admission because of upper age limits, and none, save in California, mentioned the court cases, or questioned the legality.

1/ Pettway v. American Cast Iron Pipe Co. CA5(1974) 7 FEP Cases 1115; Stevenson v. International Paper Co., Mobile, Alabama CA 5(1975) 10 FEP Cases 1386; U.S. v. Steamfitters Local 638 DC NY(1973) 6 FEP Cases 319; Judson and Judson's v. Apprenticeship and Training Council of the State of Oregon Ore Ct App(1972) 4 FEP Cases 747; EEOC No. 71-1418 (Mar. 17, 1971) 3 FEP Cases 580; EEOC No. 72-0265 (Aug. 6, 1971) 4 FEP Cases 68.

2/ §3077.5, California State Code.

(4) Background Needed to Obtain Admission

The broadest and most frequently mentioned problem that women have in obtaining apprenticeship is stated simply as lack of background. Lack of background covers a wide range of problems, including poor academic preparation for apprenticeship, lack of exposure to the trade, no knowledge of the work involved, and lack of related job experience. A woman's background works against her in the point system 1/ and in both the written exam and oral interview. Not only is she at a disadvantage in meeting 'objective' requirements, but she is faced with the interviewers' sex stereotyped perceptions of her capacity and her ability to perform the work. She may also have trouble assessing her own interests and abilities, and/or the JAC representatives may not be able to make a fair overall evaluation of them.

The experiences women have had which are relevant for apprenticeship generally may have been acquired in informal ways outside of school, often after graduation. These experiences are not fully credited with "points" when applying for apprenticeship. Seventy percent of both unsuccessful applicants and those who became apprentices had had some experience with tools, but few gained this experience in school (6%) or on the job (34%). Several women reported helping their fathers in their work; at least two said they grew up on a farm. One successful woman apprentice, soon to become a journeyperson toolmaker, described herself as her "father's son." Had she had a brother, she maintained, she might never have had the series of experiences and opportunities that led her to become an apprentice.

The recruitment programs responded that the women had had some relevant experience, but not very much. Of those who had, the greatest number obtained the experience around their home--fixing appliances, building cabinets, home or automobile maintenance, painting, plastering, etc.

1/ The point system is a method of evaluating an applicants qualifications by assigning point values in various areas including educational background, test scores, and evaluation during oral interview. (See Problems with the Point System, p. 35.)

A major problem is getting the women, and then the unions, to recognize such informal experiences as being valid and relevant, and to assure that the JACs evaluate women's overall experience and potential more flexibly. The recruitment programs stated that not only did the women themselves not recognize such experience as relevant, they were often reluctant to express it as such. Several JAC representatives also stated that they frequently had to make a special effort to pull this information out of women during the interview. Even where the experience is expressed and credited, frequently less value is placed upon it than the "documented" experience obtained in work, school, or the military.

(5) Interest and Knowledge of the Area

Interest in the trade was expressed as essential for acceptance into apprenticeship. Lack of interest was expressed by JACs as a major problem in recruiting women, but even among those interested enough to make application, there are indications that many women are not yet intellectually and emotionally prepared to enter apprenticeship.

Lack of sufficient interest is indicated by the large proportion of women who do not complete the application process. Frequent references were made about women not turning in the required documents, not taking the tests, or not showing up for the oral interview. One JAC reported that more than half of the initial women applicants never reach the testing stage. The consensus in these cases is that the persons were just applying for a job, and when they became aware of the commitment expected and the red tape involved, they decided to look elsewhere. As with any job application, a proportion of men do not follow through either, but the number, according to the JACs, is considerably less.

According to some JACs, men and women do not exhibit any substantial differences. "Young people suffer severely from lack of good attitudes toward work, and young women are no different in this respect from the young men who apply. They are looking for a job but one that requires no work." Although most JACs admitted that there were problems with

both men and women apprentices, the perception prevails that women, more than men, lack career commitment. Women, more than men, are not raised to be career-oriented, and to many women the work is quite foreign to their past experience. Although women's work patterns are changing, and many women are breaking away from the established model, a career, particularly in a male-dominated field, is still a new idea to most women. In many cases, during the application process, a woman is in the position of exploring her interest at the same time that she is expected to be demonstrating her interest to the JAC.

Many JAC representatives stated that "women don't know what they are getting into." Although many women do complete the application procedure, this still may not affect the JACs' perception that she lacks interest, which goes hand in hand with the judgment on their part of the applicant's limited knowledge about the specific apprenticeship. As one company official put it, "you can't be very interested in the work, if you don't even know what it involves." Many of the JAC representatives felt that women really didn't understand how hard the work is. A major difference that was frequently mentioned was that the successful women applicants know more about the area, more about the program, and seemed more aware of what they were getting into.

A number of JACs reported that the successful women applicants had a friend or relative in the trade. Many of the women in the survey reported that they learned of the trade from their fathers, or that they worked with their fathers, husbands, or boyfriends in a business of a similar nature. Women who apply for apprenticeship from within the company, have an idea of the tasks to be performed and the nature of the apprenticeship program. Many women without this background know nothing about the trade when they make an application.

3. Problems with Written Examinations/Academic Background

The interviews revealed basic disagreement between the JACs and the recruitment programs regarding the extent to which women have problems with the written examination. The majority of JACs interviewed stated that the women's problems tended to be more with the written examination and/or academic background than with the oral interview. The recruitment programs reported just the opposite.

JACs mentioned that women score low on tests in mathematics, mechanical ability, terminology, and tool recognition. They also lose points under the point system for not having taken related courses in mathematics, science, and particularly in non-traditional vocational education. The perception was that men applicants in general had a better background due primarily to the trade and industrial vocational courses that many of them had taken in high school, their greater experience with tools, greater exposure to machinery, and greater information about the area of employment.

A great many of the recommendations from the JACs to women interested in apprenticeship were course-related: the need to take more courses in mathematics, science, physics, shop, patterns, mechanical drawing, drafting, machine shop, blueprint reading, etc. Although women may fall short in all of the above areas, lack of vocational courses seems to be the worst offender. Only three out of more than 100 applicants in the sample had taken a vocational program in high school, and none of them were in an apprenticeship-related program. Where mathematics was found to be a problem for the women, it was also frequently reported as a problem for the men, and in more than one instance, a JAC reported women did <u>better</u> in mathematics than the men. This could be due, in part, to the high percentage of women in the sample who were in a college preparatory program in high school, or who had had one or more years of an academic program in college.

The JACs as a rule, blamed the school system for the women's lack of preparation on two counts: (1) not allowing/encouraging women to take courses giving them the proper preparation, and (2) ineffective career guidance--channeling students to professional careers and not the trades, and specifically, channeling women into traditionally women's areas.

One union representative stated that he had had to fight the schools to permit his daughter to take mechanical drawing. Another volunteered this information:

> Women are handicapped by their background, they have not been encouraged, or allowed to take appropriate courses in high school. They have not been told about the possibilities in the trades--even when given tests, they are not recommended to enter apprenticeships. Women that make it are those who know of it from somewhere else and fight to find it. They are usually told about more traditional occupations. Schools encourage and emphasize college too much--even for the men, vocational courses are not often advised and have been changed from mandatory to electives. Parents also emphasize college too much, and it may not be right.

The most frequent reason given by the women for their lack of preparation was that they were either discouraged in school, or were not allowed to take "male" vocational education courses. This is particularly a problem for women who are now in their late twenties and early thirties, many of whom indicated that they had been barred from taking male-intensive shop courses. Although it is still common practice for women to be directed into traditional vocational education, they are no longer likely to be barred from the non-traditional vocational education classes. Where points are given for these classes, or are taken into consideration in the application procedure, the older women are particularly at a disadvantage. As these courses open up to women, this problem may diminish. One company official stated he was happy to see <u>for the first time</u> this year a woman applicant who had a strong background in industrial arts, drafting, and other appropriate high school vocational education courses. She was 18 years old.

Approximately half of the apprentices and 78% of the applicants who had to take the written examination found it difficult. Most women indicated that more relevant vocational courses would have been useful, and 40% also found more mathematics would have been helpful to their preparation for apprenticeship.

The majority of the recruitment program staff did not view the academic background of women as a major problem, although they did cite lack of mathematics and vocational education as problems.

4. Problems with the Oral Interview

In contrast to the views of the JAC's, the recruitment representatives generally perceived the oral interview as the major obstacle for women.

The issue of 'background' or lack of it, comes up again in the oral interview. Here it is used by the JAC to determine a woman's interest, attitudes, and knowledge of the area.

The interview is generally conducted by at least two and usually more members of the JAC, with representative(s) from the union, management, and sometimes from the community. 1/ The purpose of the interview is to evaluate the applicant's desire to get into the skilled trade(s), his/her stability/maturity, knowledge of and interest in the trade, attitude towards work, and other stated 'relevant' factors (and sometimes unstated irrelevant factors). Yet this is where the applicant has the opportunity to, and indeed must, convince the committee that she is truly interested in the work and will be able to handle the job. Since it is almost impossible objectively to measure such criteria, the oral interview is likely to be very subjective and rely mainly on impressions by JAC interviewers.

1/ When a Hometown Plan is involved.

The issues addressed by the oral interview are:

- The women must have an interest in the specific apprenticeship for which she is applying.
- This interest must be communicated in the oral interview.
- The interviewer must be able to perceive that interest.

The staff of the recruitment programs agreed with the JACs that there are problems with women not having enough interest; even when they have interest, they have problems getting that interest expressed.

Problems the JAC representatives saw with the oral interview were that the women were not communicative or responsive, that they were not able to present all the relevant factors, and they seemed uneasy and reluctant to talk freely. They stressed that the most important aspects of the interview are the ability to project an interest in the area, knowledge of the field, a good attitude toward work and 'commitment.' (The word 'commitment' was used over and over again.)

One perception frequently mentioned by the JAC was that the women did not know much about the trade, and this counts against them. They also reported that women "hide relevant factors," or that they have to dig the information out of them. Recruitment program staff also reported that the women lacked the ability to sell themselves during the interview. Women re-entering the professional labor force are encouraged to utilize their administrative and supervisory experiences acquired from volunteer work when applying for paid administrative jobs. The same holds true in apprenticeship. Women need assistance to translate their home activities--car and appliance repair, home maintenance, design skills, etc.--into job-related skills. This also applies to their ability to convince the JACs of their ability to take on the physical aspects of the job. Two children and a bag of groceries may weigh as much as concrete blocks, it's merely a different image, but the women must be able to get across their capability and proficiency.

Many of the JAC representatives themselves are sensitive to the issues, and report spending a longer time with women to get them to talk more comfortably. For the woman who has not been coached for the interview, many JAC representatives try to elicit the information which can improve her standing.

Another aspect considered in the oral interview is attitude, motivation and commitment of the applicant, which are subject to much interpretation on the part of those interviewing. Lack of sincerity is a common disqualifier. Some comments from JACs include:

> Women apply more out of curiosity.
>
> Some don't really intend to stick with it. (School teachers apply because they are tired of teaching.) Some apply under pressure (her father was a radical, and forced her to make an issue by applying).
>
> No sincere interest--women apply because the Urban League feels that they have to meet their quota of women.

The recruitment program staff maintain that the difficulties with the interview are caused by unions, contractors, and companies who are reluctant to hire women. They also felt that part of the inability of the women to present themselves positively during the oral interview is the discriminatory nature of the questions asked (how are you going to care for your child? Why would you (a frail woman) want this (dirty, difficult) job?).

Although only 13% of the apprentices and 30% of the applicants felt that they had had difficulty with the oral interviews, 41% of the apprentices and 50% of the applicants said they had felt uncomfortable with the JAC members. One electrical mechanic expressed great frustration with the nature of the interview she had:

> I had been interviewed by this person, that person. I said, "I am sick of this!" I walk in--I'm a woman, and I'm not trying to be anything else! I want to support my child.

> I walk in there looking my best. Men look their best when they go to interviews. They'd ask me some of the weirdest questions, like what my father and mother thought about it, and why didn't I go into modeling?! Really, there were a lot of little sly things, and when you're being interviewed they have ways of trying to get you off the track. I'd stay with it, but I'd never gotten any jobs. So I was disenchanted. 1/

Problems with the oral interview declined with an increase in the age of the applicant. The older women were better able to project a willingness to take on the commitment and responsibility of the training program, had more self-confidence, were more verbal in presenting their qualifications, and came across as having the maturity to handle the job.

The women have to come to grips with their own perception of their roles and job commitment, and must be strong enough to overcome the traditional perceptions of the interviewer. The image of a career-oriented woman may be new to the interviewer, invariably a man, particularly in an area which is so predominantly and traditionally male. The women have to overcome all the prejudices of the interveiwer under most difficult circumstances. It is here, that the woman has to come on strong. Where a man has to show the same traits, and many may not, a woman has to go one step further to prove herself. Yet if she is too aggressive, she may turn off her all-male interviewers.

Comparing successful female applicants with unsuccessful ones, one JAC representative stated that the successful women are more determined, know what they want and go after it. A recruitment program representative described the successful woman as more sincere, trying harder, and having better verbal skills. Assertiveness was, far and away, the attribute of successful women applicants most frequently mentioned by everyone, or as the trait most needed. One recruitment program representative stated that a woman must be willing to fight to get the job.

1/ Terry Wetherby, ed., Conversations--Working Women Talk About Doing a "Man's Job," Millbrae, California: Les Femmes Publishing, 1977, p. 158.

These were not mentioned as prerequisites for men, nor was it shown how good verbal skills and assertiveness are necessary to do a good job in a skilled trade. Certainly good verbal skills would be necessary for personnel work, and assertiveness perhaps is necessary in sales, but to hold them forth as bona fide occupational qualifications (BFOQ's)1/ for plumbing and carpentry? The issue is, that these are necessary skills for a woman to be successful in her oral interview for an apprenticeship. A woman must be able to prove verbally that she can and will handle a man's job physically, in order to be given the opportunity to find out if she indeed can!

5. Problems with the Point System

In many apprenticeship programs, a point system is used to determine an applicant's qualifications. Points are assigned for scores on written examinations, evaluation of an applicant based on an oral interview, and, in addition, evaluation of the applicant's background including points for education and for work experience that is relevant to apprenticeship. Specific courses for which points are given include:

Mathematics
Physics
Shop courses or other courses using tools
Mechanical drawing
Mechanical drafting
Others (traditionally "male") vocational education courses 2/

Points are also given for preapprenticeship courses or other extra schooling, related work experience, work experience for the company (in the industrial trades), and "other relevant factors."

1/ A bona fide occupational qualification (BFOQ). The courts have held that any qualification that is held forth as being required in order to fill a job, must be able to show its relevance to the actual performance of that job.

2/ Different JACs give points for different courses and different work experience.

A minimum total point count is required for acceptance into apprenticeship. In many cases, those meeting this minimum are then ranked according to their scores and selected, as positions become available, beginning with applicants with the highest scores. The present point system consistently works against women. Although the JACs recognize that the women are handicapped by the channeling towards traditional occupations in school, the point system magnifies the problem. The women's lack of background works against her at every step of the evaluation process. Points given for "other relevant factors" are minimal, and are certainly not enough to compensate for lack of points offered for formal schooling or work experience.

Although applicants are allowed to re-test and submit further documentation periodically and doing this frequently increases a woman's chances of being accepted, most women are too discouraged after their first exposure to continue in order to make their application more acceptable. One JAC did note that more women than men took his advice to take more courses, and that women re-tested more often than the men. In many of the companies, employees interested in apprenticeship are encouraged to take classes for which they get a tuition rebate. Women who take advantage of this while working, gain seniority at the plant and gain points at the same time. In other situations, the time and money involved in obtaining such schooling is a problem.

Some unions and companies (large manufacturing industries and shipbuilding) are trying to help compensate for school inequities by giving credit for home economics, saying that sewing uses patterns and machinery, and cooking teaches following instructions and measurement. Others have started to give credit for any vocational education class, regardless of what it is. Some have completely eliminated examinations and interviews.

One company official stated that the law made the point system necessary. In the past, in the particular industry he represented, the acceptance of

apprentices had been based solely on the oral interview. This was thought to be too subjective and produced discriminatory decisions against minorities. The Equal Employment Opportunities Commission and the legal decisions have required a more objective way of determining qualifications, and have required that applicants be ranked according to these measures and accepted into the program on that basis. 1/ The point system was, therefore, established as an "objective measure," to rank applicants by their scores, and as job openings became available, the people with the highest scores were placed. This creates a situation, however, where simply qualifying is not enough, and qualified minorities and women are frequently not the highest ranking.

One representative suggested that more women would get in if the JAC could drop the point system and go back to just an oral interview. The oral interview, however, presents its own problems, particularly where the interviewers are consciously or unconsciously negative about admitting women to apprenticeships.

The problem the JACs are faced with is that methods that have been used to improve the opportunity of minorities to enter apprenticeship, now work against women. During the past decade, changes have been designed to accommodate the admission of minority men into apprenticeship. These systems that worked well for minority men (such as the point system) now work seriously against the placement of women. Yet both the employers and JACs have by and large accepted the fact that the system has to insure that both women and minorities have the opportunity to score high enough to be placed. The JACs recognize that the "so-called objective measures make this task more difficult, because the measures can themselves be discriminatory." What is even worse, what is useful for minorities works to the detriment of women, and vice versa.

1/ This is their perception and not necessarily a true reflection of the decisions made by EEOC in their BFOQ requirements.

As described by one company, problems arise directly from the effort to change or shift the requirements. They had done a study of the entry problems experienced by minorities, and discovered that minorities were more likely to have taken vocational education courses than mathematics or physics courses. To improve the likelihood of minorities gaining entrance, the vocational education courses were weighted more heavily, and physics was dropped as a point count. Unfortunately for the women, it has now been determined by the same company that women apprentices are more likely to have taken mathematics and science, and were less likely to have taken related non-traditional vocational education. What has helped one group, has harmed the other. In order to help the women, management attempted to change vocational education requirements to give credit for traditional female courses. These changes, in this instance, had to be approved by the union, and were met with some opposition--cooking as a prerequisite for tool and die?--it did eventually pass.

To date, this dilemma has not been resolved, in part, because so little information is presently available about the women interested in entering and remaining in apprenticeship. A system must be evolved to evaluate and make a fair determination of a woman's capability for apprenticeship, utilizing a method that is flexible enough to present a balanced picture of the capabilities of both minorities and women that does not work to the detriment of either. To evolve a solution is not easy and the new regulations do not even deal with or refer to the issue (see section on Government Regulations).

6. Problems Obtaining a Job

Since the nature of an apprenticeship is to learn the trade from a skilled craftsperson, obtaining and keeping a job is a necessary prerequisite for beginning and remaining in an apprenticeship program. All apprenticeships are highly competitive, and many applicants who have met all other requirements are still unable to start their apprenticeship because they cannot obtain a job. An electrical workers union representative claimed that they have ten qualified applicants for every job opening, even when times are good.

a. Selection of a Trade

A problem for women trying to obtain an apprenticeship is that with their limited knowledge of skilled occupations, they are most likely to select trades that are the most well known, and hence, have the keenest competition. Electrician is the most popular trade in both industry and construction. Carpentry is favored in construction, and tool and die-makers, machinists, and pipefitters are among the industrial favorites. Choice of the trade seems to be based on images of what the job entails (less dirty work) and its visability to the public. Frequently, occupations are chosen because they have known someone in the area, or have had an opportunity to see someone at work.

Some JACs seemed to feel that women tend to avoid those trades that involve a long period of training. Several recruitment representatives stated that women are sometimes reluctant to sign up for long programs and are attracted to the shorter programs. Women are also perceived as more likely to get into programs with fewer requirements of previous training. (In this respect, it would appear that the women are reality-oriented.)

Women frequently choose and in some cases, are advised by JACs or recruitment programs to go into certain areas which are believed to be better areas for women. It was suggested that women have more patience and would do well in trades requiring fine work such as electrical work. Women are frequently steered away from occupations requiring a greater amount of heavy work, such as training as a millwright. However, the perception of what occupations are too heavy for women varies considerably. Where some people highly recommend carpentry to women, others view it as too heavy. Many expressed the belief that if a woman is in good shape, she could handle any trade.

For an industrial placement, the applicant usually has the opportunity to list three trades she is interested in. Whichever she is most qualified

for, or whichever has an opening first, will be offered (if she meets the requirements). Frequently, the apprenticeship she accepts is the one that was offered rather than her first choice, for fear this may be her only opportunity.

b. Job Opportunities

The job opportunities depend upon the nature of the trade and the economic situation. Construction trades have not expanded in the last few years and most job openings that occur are due to attrition. Unemployment rates in the construction trades have been consistently high in recent years, and many of these apprenticeship programs have shut down completely.

At present, industrial placements are more easily accessible, since new jobs are continually developing. Members of the automobile manufacturing industry expressed concern that they lost many apprentices during the automobile industry slump, and they are now looking for qualified applicants to replace them. They recommended that during the slump is good time for people to gain the necessary skills to improve their access to apprenticeship, so that when jobs once again become available, they would be ready. They recognize that pursuing this course does represent some risk for women but since the competition for apprenticeship is so keen, the women will be in a far better position if they gain this experience. Industrial unions are less likely to "blanket-in" 1/ on the basis of partial experience; therefore, there is no quick way to "create" journeymen in most industrial skilled occupations when things are good which works to the women's advantage.

1/ "Blanketing-in" is the system whereby an individual receives a journeyperson's "card" or membership in the union without having completed an apprenticeship. Such persons usually have had experience in the trade.

Apprenticeship programs are a vulnerable area, most readily affected by changes in the economy. Most unions have contracts specifying the ratio of apprentices to journeymen, and any changes must be negotiated. Apprentices already in the program have priority, and if jobs are not available, no new apprenticeship positions are opened, and apprentices may be laid off. Several unions that were contacted to participate in the study stated that their apprenticeship programs were closed, and some stated that they had not accepted a new apprentice for several years.

c. Job Placement

There are two major systems in operation for job placement:

1. The so-called "Hunting License System." This system operates in different sections of the country frequently in the same construction trades that utilize a hiring hall elsewhere. Here, all qualified applicants are responsible for obtaining a union job on their own, usually getting only a card from the union stating that they are eligible for employment as an apprentice. In some industries, a similar system is involved, but the process is reversed. The applicant obtains the job from the company, and then is referred by the company for admission to the union which cooperates or in some cases, supervises the training.

2. Qualified Applicant List. This is the method used in industry, and in those construction trades that have hiring halls. The applicants are rated according to the point system or competitive examination and interviews, or both, and placed on the qualified list in order of their rank. As jobs become available, whoever is on the top of the list is placed.

(1) Hunting License

Many women expressed great frustration in trying to find a union employer who would hire a woman. "I met the union requirements and will be accepted as soon as I get a job--that's the catch." Construction trades were seen as particularly difficult to enter. One Women's Program director, when asked about the coopération between the unions and the contractors, responded, "Oh, they cooperate beautifully together--to

keep women out." The unions get off the hook by saying that it's up to the contractor to hire the woman. The contractors respond that there are no jobs available, or that the union is not certifying qualified women.

Recruitment program staffs expressed the opinion that there is a great deal of reluctance on the part of contractors to hire any apprentices, particularly women apprentices. Again, the woman is faced with the same stereotyping, if not discrimination, that she faced in qualifying as an apprentice. One program representative reported being told by a construction boss that "it wasn't appropriate for a 'gentleman' to ask the owner to hire a woman for dirty work like that."

A woman's ability and motivations are questioned, and if not that, a woman is not wanted at the construction site 'distracting' the men. Short of pressure by the government, the employer is not required to hire a woman who is qualified as an apprentice, and the unions certainly are not pushing the issue.

> After about a year's effort I was rejected on the basis that there weren't quite enough jobs available, that if the contractors were forced to put women in the program, to hire women, they would refuse to participate in the apprenticeship program and I would be destroying the effectiveness of the program for everybody involved. 1/

One related instruction teacher suggested that a major change should be the abolishment of the "hunting license" system,

> All trades with apprentices ought to be required to use the hire hall method; this will give more women apprentices a chance to really get into the program at an early stage and preclude the discouragement that now exists for those women apprentices who must use the hunting license.

1/ "Women in Construction," The MacNeil/Lehrer Report, New York: Educational Broadcasting Corporation, aired August 22, 1977.

(2) Qualified Applicant List

The biggest problem that the women applicants have with a hiring hall or industry placement list is that they initially do not get ranked high enough to gain a reasonably competitive position on the list.

> I have mentioned inside the questionnaire what my experience was--I was accepted to the program, put on a list, and then have never been called in for the program. Because of changes in my life and city of residence, I have not followed up in any energetic way--however, I believe this is what the program hopes will happen and by placing women at the bottom of their list (because of having no "shop classes" from school) they successfully eliminate women from the program. People with shop (etc.) in school were going to be called first. I was accepted but never called. Last year I was sent a notice asking was I still interested. I said yes--but have not heard again.

The same factors which prevent many women from making the list at all are also responsible for their low placement on the list--lack of high school mathematics and vocational education, no military experience, lack of related job experience, not making enough points in the interview, etc. The women at this point are recognized as qualified, but they are not able to get placed. Only the very exceptional woman will score high enough to be at the head of the list; until a more equitable system of evaluation is designed, most women find they may have no better chance on a list than they do looking for their own job.

Whichever system is in effect, lack of placement in a job is a major cause of women dropping out. The wait is long, and if she has to find her own job, frustrating, and discouraging.

The women who continue to work at another job during the application period have the best chance to eventually wait it out--they do not have to quit the process in order to earn money to survive. Many women get tired of waiting and look for something elsewhere, or some other opportunity comes along that is hard to pass up when the apprenticeship is so uncertain. If she is the sole support of her children or even herself, she will not be able to wait very long.

7. Programs Designed to Recruit and Prepare Women for Apprenticeship

A significantly greater proportion of the successful apprentices had participated in some type of recruitment program than had unsuccessful applicants. Fifty-one percent of the apprentices compared to 14% of the unsuccessful women applicants in the survey had participated in a recruitment program prior to their application for apprenticeship. Of those who participated, more than 80% completed the program successfully--at least to the point of being named to an eligible apprenticeship list. Clearly,

Participated in Recruitment Programs	Apprentices	Applicants
Yes	51%	14%
No	49%	86%

the recruitment programs have proven valuable in getting the women into the system.

Three types of preapprenticeship, or what we have called recruitment programs, that are assisting women gain entry into apprenticeship, were interviewed during the course of the study. The first were the women's outreach components being operated as part of the Urban League's Labor Education Advancement Program (LEAP) and the Recruitment and Training Program, Inc. (RTP). 1/ These programs were originally designed to assist minority men gain admission to apprenticeship and have been operating preapprenticeship programs almost 15 years. All of the LEAP/RTP-type programs were funded under a national contract, although some also had local funding from CETA prime sponsors. The second type were those groups that had been organized by women to serve women. 2/ Most of the Women's Programs, if they were funded at all, were funded through local CETAs, with a few notable exceptions where they have received national contracts such as in Denver and

1/ These programs are referred to as LEAP/RTP-type programs.

2/ These programs are referred to as Women's Programs.

San Francisco, for instance. The third type of preapprenticeship programs were those conducted by and large by the major companies or unions 1/ preparing persons for admission to a single industry. These programs are generally designed to help participants meet technical entry requirements for a specific trade in a single industry, generally focusing on basic mathematics and some skill development. None of the women in the sample indicated they had participated in a nationally funded union preapprenticeship program.

According to the JACs, except in cases where all apprentices were required to have taken a preapprenticeship program, men were not as likely to have participated in a recruitment program, 2/ except for minority men. It was generally agreed that the men were less likely to need it, since they were likely to have had the proper background.

The primary components of the LEAP/RTP-type programs and the Women's Programs are tutoring, counseling, mock interviews, and various types of job placement services. Depending upon the program, more or less may be offered. The primary objectives, once women are recruited, as expressed by the programs themselves are:

a. to prepare the women technically to meet apprenticeship application requirements;

b. to prepare the women psychologically; and

c. to work with JACs to help to facilitate the entrance of the women into apprenticeship programs.

1/ These are truly preapprenticeship programs and these are referred to as such.

2/ Recruitment program is an umbrella term referring to all of the programs: LEAP/RTP-type programs, Women's Programs, and preapprenticeship programs.

(a) Preparing the Women Technically to Meet Requirements

The JACs attribute women's lack of proper credentials (no related courses and low test scores), as the major reason that women are not being accepted to apprenticeship; yet these areas are not a major emphasis of the recruitment programs. In-depth training related to the skills, tools and language of the trades is not provided. However, most of the programs offer general tutoring in mathematics, spatial and mechanical concepts, and vocabulary as preparation for the written examination. The frequency of these tutoring sessions varied depending on the program, from a couple of hours once a week to several hours two or three times a week. Other available services include counseling and job placement. At least one-fourth of the women participating in recruitment programs said that there was no set program, just occasional optional meetings. Of those apprentices in the sample who listed a length of program, nearly half reported that it was six weeks or less, yet only 37.5% of the apprentices recommended longer programs.

One unique program for women combined the efforts of a LEAP/RTP-type program and a State Board of Education in designing a six-month program to train women as welders. The program provided in-depth preapprenticeship training and provided a stipend to participants. Although the recruitment program had only a short time to recruit and select women for the program, the retention rate of the women in the program was excellent. Yet at the time the interview was conducted, which was several weeks after the participants had graduated from the program, several of the women were employed as non-union welders, but not one woman had been placed in apprenticeship. Over half had still not been placed in a job.

Some programs have had success in placing women in other non-traditional jobs other than apprenticeship. If they feel a woman does not qualify for apprenticeship, they channel her into other non-traditional jobs. For those seeking apprenticeship, the primary aid is tutoring for the examination and the oral interview. Some referrals are made for G.E.D. or additional courses to prepare the women. Some re-

cruiters/counselors recommended to women that they go back to school and get some related training for which they could get credit at the time of application, and which would most likely enable them to do better on written examinations. For single women and divorced women supporting themselves and sometimes their children, the suggestion was not generally useful. Apparently, only a few took the advice that was tendered.

A few of the programs concentrate on familiarization with tools. The program includes workshops teaching tool identification and manipulation, or, on a smaller scale, utilizing illustrations similar to those on tests. Only one program reported working on physical development.

Although most of the recruitment programs did not run a preapprenticeship program per se, on occasion, clients are referred to other established preapprenticeship programs, which concentrate more heavily on background and skill development. These programs are often sponsored by the union or company, and frequently the participants must be referred or approved by the union or company before they are accepted. Women participating in a program are given credit, usually in the form of points, and it does help in getting the women into the apprenticeship program. However, the preapprenticeship programs can and do refuse the referral.

Participating in a preapprenticeship program has additional advantages. In the view of one recruiter/counselor it gets women used to a male atmosphere. It tends to build a woman's self-image and self-confidence if she does well; she may become more interested in the field and try harder. If not, it is a good opportunity to realize that apprenticeship is not for her. One woman wrote that she had quite a number of problems in preapprenticeship school, and suggested that hassles encountered at this stage are very similar to hassles in a regular apprenticeship program, and that little is done by the staff to resolve the problem. Over 90% of the women in the survey felt that a preapprenticeship program would be useful preparation for the application for apprenticeship. Seventy-four percent felt it would be helpful in preparing them for their apprenticeship itself.

Unfortunately, the preapprenticeship programs may not always be able to help women get into an apprenticeship, and few have been able to provide services to women once they have been admitted.

> Somewhere along the line, sometime, I decided I wanted to be a carpenter. I didn't have any training. That was the problem, and I didn't have any friends who were carpenters. After I quit my go-go dancing job I went to HRD (Human Resources Development). They have a work-study program--three days of classes and shop work, and then two days you're actually out in the field. They pay just real cheap wages, something like $1.50 an hour while you're working. But they do pay you, and you get a lot of work experience. So I took the test, a small battery, English and math. It was about junior high school level, and I got 100 percent. So I thought,"Well, I'm set."
>
> I kept waiting for them to call me. They never did. Finally I called and they said it was filled with veterans. They told me that veterans were given preference. At the time I thought about taking them to court. 1/

(b) Preparing the Woman Psychologically

Counseling was available in all programs, and is given major emphasis across the board. Yet, many of the women apprentices did not consider counseling to have been that useful in preparing them for apprenticeship when compared to other preparation.

Most programs provide counseling at the first interview or orientation session to let the women know more about apprenticeship programs, the work involved, and to determine their interests and capabilities. In some cases the woman recruit has not yet determined that she has any interest in apprenticeship. The counselor/recruiters expressed an urgent need to give the women a good understanding of what lies ahead. One program begins with an orientation session that is designed to give information to prospective apprentices about both precise program requirements for admission and the larger issues of what it is like being an apprentice. It is also designed

1/ Wetherby, Conversations, p. 75.

as a self-screening exercise for the participants so that some of the women can de-select themselves at this point, if that seems appropriate. The session also encourages women into trade-related courses in the vocational education system. Finally, the session allows the program staff to look for the skilled and semi-skilled women who are highly motivated.

A lot of the counselors expressed their belief that women are not interested in non-traditional work, or that the women have a hard time believing that they can handle the work. Many of the counselor felt this attitude was a major reason that women drop out prior to completing the application, or do not do well in the oral interview. Most expressed frustration with this type of client, feeling that they were not able to do much for these women.

One method that has proven very helpful in terms of helping a woman see herself in an apprenticeship is the use of role models. Many of the programs stated that they try to give a lot of publicity to the women who are successfully making it, and some report that the application rate for women increases after such publicity. One director stated that a key strength in her program was the use of examples of successful women who have made it through the program or are still in it. She sees this exposure as part of the critical attitudinal development needed by women workers to view themselves as being able to do--and enjoy--heavy physical work. The majority of women have to be sensitized and to receive continual reminders as they move through an apprenticeship program.

Most of the programs spend a great deal of time focusing on describing the problems women have in apprenticeship. Many counselors said they have to lay it on the line for the women--let them know the work is hard and dirty. They also want to prepare the women for the fact that they are a minority, a novelty on the job, and that there are likely to be hassles on the job if they make it at all. The counselors feel that if women are unwilling to deal with the problems, it is better to find out early. However, there is a fine line between preparing the women and discouraging them. One woman complained that "one of the counselors was extremely hostile, discouraging me far more than encouraging or helping me."

Problems that may be encountered on the job are discussed on an individual basis and in group situations. The groups are frequently all women, but sometimes include men. One counselor believes that having men in the sessions may help avert future problems. By helping the young men become more aware of the problems that exist for the women, the men will be more sensitive to the issues once they are on the job; if they are not helpful in the solution of problems, they may at least not contribute to the problems, and possibly even avoid some of them.

A great deal of attention is given to psychologically preparing women for the oral interview. It is widely recognized that women have a major problem in the interview overcoming the barriers created by the perception of stereotypical roles. It is essential for a woman to be able to break through by presenting herself as capable of handling the job. Preparation for the interview, therefore requires a woman know how to bring out all relevant experience, be ready to handle the interviewers and break through their preconceived notions. The women are told, in general, what kinds of questions they will be asked and how to answer them. Since interviewers range from very sensitive and helpful to women, to those who are antagonistic and hostile, many programs inform the applicant of who will be doing the interviewing and how best to handle each of them.

Many of the programs conduct "mock" interviews--a strategy that has proven useful for male applicants. In some cases, the approach has been modified for the women--exposing them to a hostile interview situation so they can handle it. The success of this technique is reflected by the fact that only 13% of the women who participated recruitment programs had difficulty with the oral interviews. None of the successful applicants who had participated in a recruitment program found discomfort with JAC members to be a major problem (compared to one-third of non-participants); yet 100% found it to be a minor problem. However, 50% of the applicants who were not successful did not find it to be a problem at all.

In some cases, a counselor will accompany a woman to the interview. Such a strategy may be helpful in discouraging a hostile interview. The counselor may be able to clarify some of the issues for the JAC on behalf of the applicant. It may also work against the applicant in cases where the presence of a counselor is interpreted as an indication that the applicant cannot stand up on her own. Some counselors fear that the situation may set a precedent of dependency upon the counselor.

There are few supportive services available other than counseling. Counselors report that older women (30 +) have special needs that cannot be met in existing programs. Childcare was seen to be a major problem area, but no services are available except for occasional referrals. Women with two or more children have many problems, but women with husbands present with no children seem to have more problems than women without husbands, and no more problems than women with one child. Transportation is another area that is frequently described as a problem, yet the programs have provided no service solutions.

(c) Coordination with JACs

One of the most critical factors to insuring the success of women in apprenticeship appears to be coordinating the efforts of the JACs and the recruitment programs. The better the relationship between the program and the JAC, the better the chances are for the women coming in. A close working relationship permits the recruitment program to (a) have a close reading on the apprenticeship program vis-a-vis what JACs think women need in the way of preparation for apprenticeship, and (b) develop long-term relationships with JACs so that they will be in a position to become a resource for helping JACs when they have problems with women apprentices. The interviews revealed that the most successful programs had established or were working to establish such a relationship. They recognize that the JAC or employer is a most important factor in the overall application process because in the long run that is where the decision for employment is made.

In many other programs, little effort has been made in this direction, and instead, some programs and JACs view one another as adversaries. Some recruitment programs see the JACs as the major obstacle to women's gaining access to apprenticeship. They reported in the interviews that unions and companies are not open to women, and claim outright discrimination. Many of the unions put the burden of responsibility primarily upon the employers, and upon the women themselves. Although some of the JACs found some of the recruitment programs useful, many did not believe the programs were preparing women for apprenticeship. Several of the companies stated that all their apprentices go through their own preapprenticeship program anyway before they are placed, and it is a waste of time for them to go elsewhere for this preparation. Most only recognized their own programs as effective. Yet many of the women who completed preapprenticeship programs experienced the same problems as other women apprentices described (except for the problem of finding a placement).

(d) Problems Related to Recruitment Programs

A major barrier to success of the LEAP/RTP-type programs has been the emphasis on placing women in construction, since there have been few jobs in construction, and many apprenticeship programs have slowed or come to a complete halt. In some cities, some JACs have not accepted applicants in years.

Aside from the economic situation which makes construction harder to enter for everybody, there is the barrier of the male image to overcome, for both the women and the employers. Women have always been in industry, in semi-skilled positions, at least, but the construction site has been traditionally all male. With construction slow, there is a real reluctance to hire a woman who is viewed as taking a job away from a man.

> It's "a cruelly tantalizing practice" to continue to recruit women for construction jobs that really aren't open to them, says Elizabeth Howard, a Washington, D.C., carpenter and member of a local group known as Women Working in Con-

struction. "For the whole 6 or 7 years I've been in the trade, I've run into discrimination every time I've turned around." Howards says bitterly, "If I hadn't had constant legal coaching, I couldn't even have gotten a job. A woman shouldn't have to be a legal expert to work in construction. 1/

Another problem is that it is the construction trades, primarily, that still maintain age restrictions for applicants.

Most of the recruitment programs expressed a desire to expand into the industrial sector. At present, their contracts dictate their emphasis on construction, and they are not able to pursue industry as much as they would like. Most feel that in this area, results would be far better.

The most frequent complaint of women participating in the programs was that they did not get enough job-related training. "It was mostly theory--no hands-on training." Several expressed that the program was generally inadequate or too short; others listed as specific shortcomings--not enough vocabulary preparation, not enough time on tools and fittings; not enough familiarization with the trade. Most would have liked more mathematics and blueprint reading. The most positive responses were those from programs which gave them an idea of what to expect. The best response came from a woman who had participated in a scheduled full scale program run by women:

> Training was most helpful. I was able to freshen up on math and concentrate on areas that I had little experience, but were going to be included on the exams. We focused on math, algebra, and a little geometry and mechanical reasoning. Sample tests were available on tool recognition also. I did a lot of studying on my own. Our class met once a week for 3 hours. I spent additional time with the teacher preparing for the oral exam. This really helped to know the type of questions that I'd be asked, what the JAC wanted to hear and boosted my self-confidence.

1/ Hashiam, J.T. "They Needed a Chance to be Counted," Worklife, August 1977.

The LEAP/RTP-type programs described the fact that they were having more difficulty in placement of women than they were having in the placement of minority men. Many of the LEAP/RTP-type programs are just beginning to serve women; often the women are cranked into a system designed for minority men. Most of these programs had one staff person in charge of the "women's component"--a woman's coordinator or recruiter/counselor whose main responsibility was to recruit and counsel women, but in general, the services were the same for the women as for the men. Often the clients are handled inter-changably by available staff members. A program designed specifically for women has not been established, although the woman's coordinators recognized the need.

The Women's Programs appear to be the best equipped to deal with the special needs of women and focus on the technical areas where women have specific problems. They are also much more likely to be sympathetic and attuned to the problems facing women, and are able to provide the best supportive counseling. On the other hand, many are inadequately funded and not adequately tuned into the apprenticeship system.

In most instances, the LEAP/RTP-type programs which have been operating for some time for minorities have developed a better relationship with the JACs and employers than had most of the programs run by women. As part of their experience in preparing minority men, the LEAP/RTP-type programs have developed staff to serve as contact people whose duties are to work with the JACs. On the other hand, most of the Women's Programs (with some important exceptions) have not had this long history and experience, and have not been able to develop the positive working relationships with the JACs and the representatives of the companies. Many did not understand the apprenticeship system very well. What is more, many of the staff of the Women's Programs who understood the system least, tended to be the most militant, and were likely to approach the JACs, the unions and the companies with the assumption that the women were being discriminated against, which did not improve the relationship. There are also indications that, being women, they have to overcome some of the same obstacles (in sex stereotyping) as do the women they are serving. One woman director recalled a meeting of a local apprenticeship training council:

> I felt that I was on trial--the men on the council grilled me for 3 hours. But there was an educational process going on. Once we got beyond the first confrontation, we began discussing how we could help each other. 1/

The programs that have been serving the minorities are less attuned to the unique problems and attitudes of women. The Women's Programs which relate well to the women and provide good preparation often have difficulties in placing the women because of their lack of experience with the JACs. Clearly, it is essential that both are funded and trained to deal with the JACs effectively, and to effectively meet the special needs of women, if both are to be as effective as they could be in placing women in apprenticeship.

7. Summary

An examination of the application process and requirements in light of a woman's ability to get through it successfully indicates one major overriding theme: It is not a system designed for women. There is little or nothing in a woman's experience that is likely to be judged favorably within the present system of evaluating and selecting applicants for apprenticeship. The programs that are presently designed to assist women must attempt to repair the history of the women, that which has made them women, and make them more like men, if they are to have any chance of being accepted. If there is to be any major expansion of women into apprenticeship, without their becoming more like men, which no one is advocating, substantial changes must be made in the system itself.

1/ Womanpower, DOL, How to Succeed in a Journeyman's World, November 1975.

C. Problems in Apprenticeship

The problems to be faced by women do not diminish upon finally being accepted into an apprenticeship program. Most of the previous obstacles continue in the same or a new form, coupled with new and different ones--relationships with fellow workers and supervisors, the physical requirements of the job, the problem of adjusting their lives to the work, class schedules, and family pressures, etc. For far too many women, these problems result in their discontinuing apprenticeship before becoming indentured. Even those who do complete, often do so only by sheer will power. Twenty-one percent of the apprentices stated they were having major problems with their apprenticeship; another 49% had "some" problems. Only 30% said they had no problems.

1. Problems with Fellow Workers and Supervisors

By tradition, apprentices undergo a type of initiation which includes a certain amount of harassment and verbal abuse doled out by fellow workers and supervisors. Women apprentices are in no way excluded from being the object of this hazing; in fact, as indicated in the responses of many apprentices and the interviews with JAC coordinators, the women are often forced to endure a lot more hostility than are the men. Additionally, since a woman's socialization tends to be among small group or one-on-one relationships, the adolescent hazing, typical of male adolescent group relationships, is foreign to a woman's experience and may be much more difficult for her to take in stride.

Women apprentices are generally subject to more 'testing' than men, and they also must deal with actions and comments directed at them specifically because they are women, such as sexually aggressive remarks or actions. Several of the women apprentices complained about harassment of a sexual nature--ranging from passes or being fresh, to having to work surrounded by nude pin-ups. Fellow workers often use profanity just to see if they can get a rise from a woman. As a woman carpenter described on a television program:

> Over the years, constantly you run into graffitti campaigns directed against individual woman which sometimes will last as long as a year. You run into job sites where toilet facilities have no walls on them--a problem for men, but much more of a problem for a woman working on a job site where there are maybe 700 men. You run into situations where women are expected to pick up paychecks in offices where stag films are being shown. This kind of thing is a day-to-day assault on any woman who does make an attempt at working on a construction site or staying in the construction industry. 1/

In some cases, women are actually physically attacked. One woman's program director stated that all women apprentices ought to have a course in self-defense.

There were also claims that the women apprentices themselves precipitated problems. One complaint was made that women who are flagmen do not dress "properly." A union person reported that he wanted to treat women as equals, but it is difficult to do so when they show up for work "half covered." An example was cited of a woman who wore hot-pants to work every day. Not only did it "bother" the men on the site, but it outraged the wives who came to pick up or deliver their husbands on the site. One instance was reported where an apprentice ran away with a co-worker, leaving an enormous amount of work to be done the next day. However, the speaker admitted that this kind of thing could happen anywhere.

In most of the cases of this nature, it is the woman who is blamed, and generally she who must pay the consequences. An example of this was a case where a woman apprentice and her foreman drove to work together every day. They started arriving late or not at all. The problem was solved by firing the woman; the foreman maintained his position.

It was generally agreed that reactions of women to harassment can affect its intensity and duration. Women are constantly admonished to "be tough," "talk back," "don't be so fussy about language," "demand respect." Coping with this phenomenon is tough for all women, but seems

---

1/ "Women in Construction," The MacNeil/Lehrer Report.

to be toughest for the younger women. Two-thirds of the women 18-21 years of age reported problems with fellow workers and supervisors. Older women, on the other hand, reported fewer problems; they are likely to be more mature and do not get as flustered as their younger colleagues. With men, age seems to make a difference as well. The older men, those closest to retirement, were reported by the women, to be the easiest with whom to work. They are more likely to accept women, or at least not to resent them, and are the best teachers and the most understanding.

Many of the women felt that the first few weeks were the toughest, and that given the time to prove they could do the work, the problems with fellow workers disappeared over time. For some women, however, the problems associated with harassment, particularly the subtle and covert, continued throughout their apprenticeship.

There were cases recounted of women who made it all the way through apprenticeship to journeyperson status and then quit, saying "they couldn't take it any longer." They felt compelled to stick it out to prove they could do it, but once having proven that they were capable of making it, they no longer felt compelled to endure it.

> I've got to finish the apprenticeship program. I feel that I owe it to the women behind me. When I started, I heard "Oh, yeah, there was a woman in the apprenticeship program. She lasted three months." And "Yeah, there was a woman in the trade; she froze on the thirty-second floor, and they carried her down." Not real encouraging . . . so I feel I owe sometning to other women. 1/

The most difficult situation occurs where there is one women alone at a site. As recounted by one woman apprentice:

> It is impossible to describe what it is like being the only woman. There is a subtle hostility, sometimes toward women in general, sometimes specifically towards women in the trades. I have heard many men say that most of the brothers feel women don't have a place in the trades. Of course, this is rarely said to my face but it is transmitted in many small ways.

1/ Wetherby, Conversations, p. 81.

It is on construction sites that women feel most isolated. Almost any industry will have some other women within the plant, but this is rarely true of a construction site.

A lone woman among an otherwise all-male workforce is excluded from the traditional support systems that are available to men. The "buddy system" within the carpentry trade has created a very real community among union colleagues as they move from one job to another, frequently a considerable distance from home. This informal community operates like a home away from home; it provides a family, emotional help when needed, money, and the general ambience of club life. Women have not yet been accepted into this "club," and there are not yet enough women to form their own club. The lack of a support system makes it difficult for the few women in the trades to cope with all the problems they confront on the job.

Of the apprentices responding to the questionnaire, 31% had difficulty with fellow workers, while 40% had difficulty with supervisors. The difficulty women are having with supervisors seems to indicate that the journeypersons/supervisors do not consider it their role to control the hazing, or to make themselves responsible for controlling the atmosphere at the job site.

2. Problems with Chivalry

Chivalry remains as much a barrier to the women as the actual physical requirements of the job. Some women complain that they have to tell men to go away and let them do their own work more frequently than they have to ask for help. One apprentice wrote:

> I have carried my own share of the work, when I've been given a chance to do so. The tendency all the way along has been for the contractors to refuse to give me a job that I needed to do to learn the trade, with the excuse that it would be too hard for me, without either of us having let me have a chance at testing whether I could do it or not.

Women apprentices sometimes complained that this type of "special treatment" was a deterrent to their learning necessary skills. Some women feel they are not getting the same treatment when men jump in to help; they are not getting the exposure they should have, or the chance to develop the necessary skills.

> I think part of it is that if I can do the job then suddenly the job itself is devalued in their eyes and possibly in the eyes of the contractor who's paying them. I spent five weeks on a door-hanging crew begging for a chance to actually do the lifting and installing of the door myself. I finally had to sneak off on a lunch break to try to grapple with one of the doors myself. It took me a while, I didn't have much advice on how to do it, but I was able to do it. This kind of thing has happened over and over again where my attempts to carry my own weight, my attempts to get assignments other than gravy job assignments, have been foiled at level after level, and it's been a real struggle to overcome that on the job site.

Although on the one hand, men tend to treat the women traditionally--assigning lighter work, helping with heavy loads, etc.--on the other hand, they are highly critical of the fact that women aren't "carrying their share of the load." Resentment toward women apprentices emerged among fellow workers who complain that women are given easier work, which means that the men have to pick up the slack. Supervisors are criticized for giving women special attention and spending more time with them than with men apprentices. Although co-workers are sometimes overcareful about women doing jobs that require heavy lifting or other physical "bull work," when men and women are working side by side for the same pay, a man is eventually going to stop helping a female colleague, or be resentful of that colleague to the extent that she gets--or does--the light work.

There also is real skepticism on the part of fellow workers that women apprentices can do the job. An apprenticeship coordinator shared the following story about one way he has dealt with this problem:

> When women first began entering the meatcutters apprenticeship program, the men found them totally unacceptable. When they saw they were going to have to deal with women, they got into the antagonistic joking stage. One particularly adamant

> young male meatcutter, who said there was no way a woman could do the job properly, etc., got talked into visiting a woman in another store who was a journeyman. The coordinator then briefed the woman about the man who would stop by her store. She spotted him when he came in, hefted a whole carcus of beef onto her shoulder (the man was young enough so that he had never had to deal with whole carcuses but only the breaks), and walked casually over to the counter to talk to him. At that point he was speechless. She casually tossed the carcus down on the cutting table, proceeded to perform rapid and brilliant surgery while he watched, and then gave him an impeccably cut filet. This man has never again been heard to say anything negative about a woman meatcutter.

In some cases, supervisors were viewed as being patronizing and overprotective. The fact that women are given more attention than the men--especially with regard to safety requirements--was perceived by women as a lack of trust.

In one electrician's opinion, when asked what women can do as an electrician, he responded:

> She could do many of the light ends of work--lamp up the building, put the bulbs in the electrical fixture, dust off the plastic . . . again, no offense, but that's about it as far as electrical work goes. 1/

The big equipment, particularly, is seen as a problem. Not only are women seen as weak and as having trouble handling the equipment, they are also seen as having a low level of stamina for a full-shift of the machines. Men expressed a contempt for women, full of stereotypes concerning women's strength and abilities. Several problems arise from this attitude. First, in order to keep up production, co-workers often slot women into working on the easier machinery which they are able to handle more efficiently. Second, when this happens--or when a supervisor similarly slots women into newer and/or lighter machinery--there is tremendous resentment among the old-timers who feel they deserve the lighter work. So although men contribute to it, the men do not like the "favoritism," and generally this works against both women and the apprenticeship program.

1/ "Women in Construction," The MacNeil/Lehrer Report.

In terms of specific machinery, it was felt women were comparable to men in handling machinery in a plant. On the other hand, women are not seen as performing as well on heavy gear machinery. This perception relates not only to the issue of productivity, but also to the problem of reliability. Women are not trusted with certain kinds of machinery because it is believed by the male workers that women cannot run them as well. Apparently, it is often the case that a man insists upon taking over a difficult maneuver if it is possible that heavy and expensive machinery could be damaged by an error on the part of the women. This action makes it particularly difficult for a woman to gain either experience or self-confidence.

One Operating Engineer JAC complained about women apprentices not being trustworthy for driving, or sometimes just handling the big expensive equipment. On the other hand, it was pointed out that a supervisor would be very wary of letting any apprentice--man or woman--drive expensive equipment until s/he had gained enough experience. However, much, if not most, of the new equipment has hydraulic controls, so the argument that women do not have the strength may be spurious. Also the stamina problem--long hours of a jolting and pounding piece of machinery--has been reduced for all operating engineers by the use of cushioning devices, as was pointed out by the JACs themselves. Altogether, most of the heavy machinery stamina problems commented upon by some of the JAC members have been eliminated or reduced by new technology.

In some cases, the women apprentices complained that supervisors provided little assistance to apprentices and seldom volunteered any information concerning the trade. The women often felt that supervisors do not want women apprentices to obtain the well-rounded experience needed.

On the other hand, both management and union said that supervisors are reluctant to tell women to get with it--"it is hard to be tough on women." The result is that a supervisor does not push women apprentices hard enough,

which some viewed as a cause of lower productivity for woman than male apprentices.

3. Problems on the Job

Two-thirds of the women entering apprenticeship programs were employed in other occupations up until the time that they entered apprenticeship. Yet more than one-fourth of these women indicated that they had difficulty adjusting to the work of an apprentice. Women previously employed in clerical occupations experienced adjustment problems more often than those who had held positions in professional, technical, or semi-skilled occupations.

(a) Physical Demands

The problems for women of having adequate physical strength to perform on the job are very real. Again and again, the JACs, the apprenticeship coordinators, the recruitment program staff and the women apprentices themselves reported that the physical demands of lifting and moving heavy materials and equipment caused problems and presented limitations to both the entry and success of women. It is essential for apprentices to be able to perform the physical tasks required of the trade. The problems, however, are not a matter of sex so much as a matter of physical strength and musculature. There are many tasks that are too physically taxing for the average man. The difference is that, on the whole, men have been encouraged to develop and use their muscles more than women have. Women may also have less experience with heavy work of any kind, and have a more difficult adjustment to make to the working conditions. Women generally have never learned proper techniques of lifting heavy weights. As one woman apprentice described in her lengthy response to the study's questionnaire:

> As far as difficulties after entering apprenticeship, the difficulty I had in adjusting to work, was in getting used to lifting, pushing, and pulling extremely heavy loads of ceiling tile; as an example, the first week I worked the foreman and I moved 12 loads of tile, 20 bundles for each load, 50 lbs each, a distance of 300 yards; it was early

> June, 97°, inside an unventilated, un-airconditioned building. It takes a few months to adjust to. If I'm lifting and carrying these any distance at all, I've found I can carry them as far (and as many) as any man I'm working with. Granted, I'm a little stronger now, but I've discovered the most important thing in carrying any heavy object is 90% a matter of how you balance it. What got me through the first 2 months of this, tho, wasn't muscle, just a lot of determiantion, and I guess, plain stubbornness.

A carpentry apprenticeship program which prepares apprentices for work as construction carpenters, cabinetmaking and mill workers, millwrights, and drywall (sheetwork, partitions, ceilings) requires competence in all four areas in order to become a journeyperson. It is a difficult program for women because of the physical demands of lifting and moving material. Specifically, the drywall and millwright areas require considerable lifting. (A standard drywall weighs 100 lbs.) The machinery is also heavy, and requires considerable lifting and moving of large pieces of metal.

Other trades which present problems for women include pipefitters, machinists, meatcutters, and operating engineers. Pipefitters must carry pipes that are heavy and come in long lengths and bundles. Women meatcutters have trouble with their backs because of lifting heavy breaks, and they have to adjust to the cold locker room temperatures. Operating engineers handle machines ranging from monster, non-hydraulic equipment which is physically hard to handle, to holding flags on construction sites. The big equipment is definitely a problem and women have trouble handling the equipment. The physical difficulty in performing these tasks is seen as a reason that some women drop out.

Many of the people interviewed who identified lack of physical strength as a problem felt that women would be more able to handle heavier work if our society encouraged the development of physical attributes of women at an early age--kindergarten, or earlier. In the meantime, women are often steered away from trades that require physical strength and are encouraged to enter other trades. One woman's solution to this problem is described below:

> I was talking to a fellow--I was having trouble doing things--and he said, "You know something, you ought to go to a health spa." He said, "I work out every day. Most men do. Usually a man has something in his house that he exercises on. So I started going to a health spa. And I took dance lessons. I swam. I was more physical. I took sailing lessons, even. I just did as many things as I could. In sailing, I learned rope-tying which you need sometimes. It was really helpful. I was able to use the knots to tie something around or keep something on the truck. It really did a lot of good things for me.
>
> Going to the health spa was really great because I was able to improve my physical strength and tone up my muscles. I was going about three or four times a week . . . swimming, exercising the upper torso, the leg muscles. Sometimes if you're pushing something, you push from the legs. Maybe you'll have a foot on one part of the car giving yourself that extra push-off. You almost need to be a dancer! Sometimes you are in a cramped space and you need extra force. 1/

The problem of physical strength should not be underestimated. Even though it is known that men do help each other with heavy loads, that technological advances have helped to diminish the extent to which one must use one's own strength for lifting and hauling, and that a number of apprenticeship programs require no special strength, the problem of adequate physical strength was mentioned as a factor far too often by the women themselves to be ignored.

(b) Tools

The use of tools is more of a problem to women apprentices than men. Because men have had more exposure, the use of tools on the job comes more naturally to them. Women have more difficulty handling the tools and have to spend more time learning to use them.

1/ Wetherby, Conversations, p. 162.

Several JACs criticized preapprenticeship and vocational education programs for not teaching more trade-related skills. Much of the training that is offered is considered superficial and sometimes counterproductive, if a student feels she has acquired the necessary skills only to find out that she has not.

Women seem to have less of a problem with the lighter tools, and it was suggested that women do better than the men at some trades, particularly those trades such as electrical that require more fine work and where a woman's smaller hands are an asset to her performance.

4. Problems with Related Instruction

Only 15% of the women apprentices indicated in their responses that they were having difficulty with related instruction. The interviews with the related instructors confirmed that generally the women apprentices do not have difficulty with the coursework in the related instruction classes. In fact, many reported that the women actually do better academically than the men, that they are better students and tend to have a better educational background. These comments confirm the data that indicate that women going into apprenticeship often have been in college preparatory programs in high school and frequently have had a few years of college or have obtained college degrees. Although women tend to have a better background, the vocational exposure that men have had does give them an edge. Women frequently have trouble at first getting used to the terminology and are not as familiar with tools. Where women have problems with the coursework, it is often in mathematics. Fifteen percent of the women apprentices indicated that having had more math would have helped them with their apprenticeship.

Several of the women apprentices complained about the substance of the related instruction. They felt that much more material could be covered in the amount of time spent; several women argued that students should be allowed to advance more rapidly utilizing a self-study approach.

There was also a comment about the immaturity of fellow students, particularly those just out of high school, and the effect this has on the amount of material that can be covered.

Being the only woman or one of two in a traditionally male class also presents problems. Women may experience some of the same hassles as they do on the job, or they may just be a little uncomfortable. It was pointed out that women are sometimes reluctant to ask questions and are afraid that their peers will laugh at them.

The primary problem for women concerning related instruction focuses on the additional hours away from home and family responsibilities. Related instruction is generally given in the evening when childcare may be difficult to find and cause additional expense. Classes add to the already long hours of work, and many women find it difficult to maintain the requirements of being on the job and attending classes, if they have a family. Several women mentioned that it is essential to have an understanding spouse who is willing to help out. Transportation to classes may also be a problem in households with one or no automobile.

5. Problems with Placements

To move from apprentice to journeyperson status, a newly admitted apprentice has to obtain and maintain employment in order to learn the skills and acquire the experiences necessary to move from one stage to another. The women continue to face the same employment problems they encountered when seeking their first job to begin their apprenticeship as was described in detail in Section C. Job Placement, p. 41. Twenty-five percent of the women apprentices indicated that even after they had started their apprenticeships, they had difficulty finding a placement; 28% reported problems with the irregularity of placements. Women apprentices seeking placement are at a serious disadvantage because of the contractors who are reluctant to put women on their sites. The unreliability of placements and the subsequent impact on women depending on a salary is so unsettling that it is a major reason for dropping out of apprenticeship.

The "hunting license" system remains as difficult for the women as has previously described. Some recruitment program staff maintain that if the trades were required to use the hiring hall method, it would give more women apprentices a chance to get into the program at an early stage and preclude the discouragement that now exists for those women apprentices who must use the hunting license.

In many cases, if an apprentice is not working she is not allowed to continue with related instruction classes and drops out of the program entirely. In other cases, unemployment prolongs the number of years required in order for an apprentice to attain the required number of working hours to achieve journeyperson status. Two thousand hours per year of work experience and 164 hours of related instruction are required to obtain credit for one year of apprenticeship in most trades.

Construction jobs frequently fluctuate with the seasons, and off season jobs are particularly hard to find. They are of limited duration, and when the project is over the apprentice must seek employment elsewhere. Most jobs are for short periods of time, and the placement problem continues throughout the entire apprenticeship program. Each time a woman apprentice seeks a placement, she is subject to discriminatory practices.

In industry, the biggest problems are strikes and layoffs which interrupt the apprentice's training. Layoffs account for a high percentage of dropouts by women in industrial apprenticeship. JACs and employers report that there is a higher percentage of non-returnees among women than among men. Little data are available on their reasons for refusing recall, but it is presumed that they found other, more stable work.

The JAC administrator and/or apprenticeship coordinator has in some cases played a major role in preparing the way for women seeking placements. The interviews clearly indicated the critical importance of the role and relationship of the coordinator to contractors/employers. An

individual who is both supportive of women and savvy in dealing with contractors can lay the groundwork for acceptance of women apprentices among previously recalcitrant employers.

If discriminatory practices are a problem, the most effective administrator is often one who knows all the tricks and knows everybody in the system. One such administrator fought off opposition aimed at pushing a woman apprentice into another district; through his knowledge of the system and his support of the apprentice, he was able to keep her close to where she lived and provide her with a lot of strength, advice, and support.

The most effective situation seems to occur where JAC administrator works closely and continually with women apprentices, the union, and everyone else involved in the system; he is viewed as a resource to all, if he is able to move diplomatically, but decisively through the system on behalf of developing good journeypersons rather than fronting for any particular side in the issue.

6. Problems of Retention

It is no small wonder with the myriad of problems being faced by women in apprenticeship, that the number who drop out is high and is of great concern to practically everyone who was interviewed. Interestingly, there is little agreement regarding the reasons why women apprentices drop out before becoming indentured. It was noticed, however, that among women there are many more voluntary quits than among men. (Men are more likely to leave the program involuntarily.)

Several of those interviewed felt that many of the women who drop out just do not know what they are getting into when they enter apprenticeship. They apply out of curiosity, under pressure, or through persuasion on the part of some employment counselors. Also mentioned by JACs was a lack of stick-to-it attitude, where women's original desire to work was for higher wages and with no similar commitment to hard, long work.

For some women what is expected of them on the job is different from what they anticipated, or it is simply overwhelming. They may find they do not like the work, the working conditions or the hours, or they may have problems operating the machinery or handling some of the heavier work. Some women quit the program for another job where the working conditions are simpler.

Women may drop out while waiting for placement. Depending on economic circumstances, some women are not in a position to wait between jobs and cannot survive unless they earn a salary. As one woman described it:

> I had been admitted and was awaiting the specific date to begin my training. The economy at the time was such that union members were faced with work shortages and the apprenticeship program was slowed down, (until the situation improved). Time went by and nothing happened. I could not continue to wait. Therefore I resigned from the program.

Successful woman apprentices seem to be those women with prior exposure to either the trade or heavy work, prior vocational education experience, and high motivation. Older women who have already achieved the emotional maturity necessary to be one of the few women in a male-dominated occupation last longer in apprenticeship. Their maturity seems to help them deal more effectively with the hassles on the job.

Transportation to job sites, particularly among construction-related apprentices is often a problem. For women in families with only one car, it is most often the husband who will have the use of the car, leaving the woman to find other transportation to her job. One recruitment program representative stated that this is a particular disadvantage for women, because assigning apprentices with no transportation to the sites furthest away is a favorite technique for 'weeding out' minorities and women.

A woman alone will find it more difficult to obtain credit to buy a car. Very few cities have adequate public transportation systems and those that do rarely are extensive enough to reach outlying construction sites, or to plants in suburban areas. No formal programs currently exist for coordinating carpools or establishing transportation to job sites.

Many of the women's apprenticeship problems relate to their home situation and family responsibilities. Problems for married women with families are compounded by changes in job assignments which may require moving closer to construction sites. Changes to different shifts are sometimes required in order to learn certain aspects of the trade. Long hours and mandatory overtime requirements result in similar problems in trying to maintain some sort of family life. Attending related instruction after working hours, requiring additional time away from home, is a further complication. These hours are often difficult in terms of finding childcare facilities, if the husband is gone during the same time. For many women, this situation can cause tremendous guilt feelings about not seeing their children enough or not giving them adequate time and attention. Even women without children have problems; 37% of women apprentices with husbands present and no children responded that they had problems.

Management and union officials view these factors as affecting women's reliability. They expressed concern about women who leave the apprenticeship program to get married, move away with their husbands, etc. Similarly, daily reliability is hampered by the problem of sick children who must be tended to.

For women with small children, the problem of finding and affording adequate childcare is critical. None of the special programs for women are providing this service, although some do assist women in finding childcare through private sources. It was pointed out that minority and disadvantaged women tend to be more aware of where to go to find day care, because they have utilized social services and community action programs more than White middle class women, and therefore, know where to begin to look. Without flexible day care arrangements, some women are unable to remain in apprenticeship programs, particularly if the husband is not present or is unwilling to help. Personal problems such as divorce also affect a woman's ability to stay in the program because the responsibility for children is generally greater for the woman than for the man.

Competition at home from a husband who is sometimes not earning as much as the woman apprentice is likely to create other problems which several felt has caused some women to drop out. Some women have husbands in the program; this can create competition which the women would rather not deal with. One woman applied at the same time as her husband; because he did not make it, she later quit.

7. Need for Supportive Services

> Women definitely need courses for emotional and mental adjustment to a man's world! My first six months on the job were the most trying in my life. I practically needed reprogramming to keep the job.

As was the case for the woman apprentice quoted above, the psychological impact of being the only woman on the job is for many women the most difficult aspect of apprenticeship.

> After 4 years as an apprentice, I am fed up with having to constantly prove myself, counter endless comments, etc. Perhaps counseling would have been of help--it seems to me that the problem is one of numbers--when there are more women working in a field such as carpentry, it will be so much more pleasant. I do not feel at this time the hassle is worth the job.

This isolation was frequently given as a reason for women dropping out. Many of those interviewed recognized that it is essential to provide counseling to women after they have begun their apprenticeship and to give them an opportunity to let off steam. Women need to know how to deal with co-workers and supervisors, how to deal with the emotional pressure of being the only woman on the job site, and how to link up with other women apprentices to share experiences. One woman apprentice felt that "if group discussions were about male attitudes and methods of dealing with subtle discrimination, it would be good."

Women who are already journeypersons are especially helpful, but there are so very few of them. They can offer information on what prob-

lems to expect on the job and how to avoid them, or to get out of touchy situations. Most of all, they offer encouragement in the form of their own success. Sharing with other apprentices is helpful too--just not to feel so alone in the situation. One of the interviews brought two women apprentices in the same plant together for the first time. The woman who had been an apprentice for only three months was clearly delighted with the opportunity to ask questions of the more experienced woman, who in turn, was happy to be able to relate some of her experiences to someone who understood and shared her situation.

In most cases, women are not getting the support that they need. Recruitment programs do not have staff, time or money to do follow-up in a formal organized manner since it is not included as a covered activity in their contracts. Once a woman is admitted and begins apprenticeship, the few services that were available to her are over. What follow-up is done occurs informally; it generally consists of calling up a woman apprentice a couple of weeks after she starts on the job to see how she is doing. There is little in the way of organized mechanisms to meet with the women on a regular basis, or to get them together so they can share their experiences.

In spite of the lack of formal follow-up or counseling procedures after placement, several of the recruitment programs reported that the women apprentices tend to develop a close relationship with the women's coordinator, an occurrence that does not commonly occur with men who are placed in apprenticeship. This close relationship is an understandable response in light of the frustrations and problems women face in an all-male work environment and the need they have to talk about their experience.

Having no place to turn for support can push women out. Having such support can make all the difference, as it did for the apprentice quoted below:

> I can say very definitely, that I would not have completed the program if I didn't have the supportive, encouraging and determined counselor I had.

> I could always count on her for a sympathetic ear when I ran into problems at school. There were quite a few times when I got out of school and headed straight for her office, emotionally strained, tired, angry, discouraged and feeling sick at the treatment I received at school. I not only had her shoulder to cry on, I had her there to help fight my battles with the school--she wouldn't let them "get away" with it, nor would she let me give up.

Another area of supportive services that is lacking is that of counseling fellow workers on the job who have never worked side by side with women to prepare them before the woman appears on the job site. Sessions need to be conducted that deal sensitively with men's stereotypes about women's ability to perform certain kinds of jobs, informing them of women's role in the labor force and their own feelings of resentment towards women "invading their territory."

Support and encouragement are sometimes offered in an informal manner by a JAC administrator or an apprenticeship coordinator. These individuals have played a particularly key role, not only with individual women, but also with supervisors, journeymen, other apprentices, and with management.

Sometimes a recruitment program coordinator or JAC administrator will intervene on behalf of a woman, but if this intervention continues on an individual basis, it may result in more problems for the woman because she is seen as receiving "special attention." Women need dependable back-up services, not merely the outlet for frustrations which is all the coordinator can provide at present.

Few, if any, services are available for coordinating the placement of women apprentices on job sites or in related instruction classes so that more women will be together on the job or in class; in fact, there is no system even for women apprentices on different sites to get together.

The established union grievance systems are not designed to deal specifically with the problems of women apprentices, and may women do not know where to turn. One apprentice stated the necessity for:

> Information on personal rights as a woman apprentice and contact if rights are violated. (It's very easy to be bull-dozed and pushed around--a woman is very isolated on the job and at school.)

What few services the women do receive are primarily directed at their ability to deal with the situation or at providing psychological release valves for their frustrations. Interestingly, few women responded that counseling would be a useful means of resolving problems in apprenticeship.

With the few services available after placement into apprenticeship, it is a rare woman who can successfully coordinate home and work responsibilities and schedules, adjust to the physical aspects of the job and tasks which are foreign to her past experience, and effectively deal with the harassment and special treatment on the job. The number women who actually become journeypersons remains very small indeed. Although efforts are made to recruit women and to get them admitted into apprenticeship, until the women are able to successfully complete their apprenticeship, these efforts will have achieved very little.

Part II -- Issues and Conclusions

Issues and Conclusions

This review of women apprentices and the problems they face--from the time before they ever considered such a vocation, to the application and admission process, through their apprenticeship and for a very few, to journeyperson status--is an exhausting tale replete with problems. If you feel weary and overwhelmed, so do we, and so do they.

Much of the frustration is the realization that there are no simplistic solutions to the problems. There is no one aspect nor any one institution "to blame." A solution to one problem still leaves many others unresolved.

Our attempt in this section is to "get a handle" on the situation by examining some of the major issues affecting women who seek entry into apprenticeship. The discussion and analysis of these issues have different implications for various agencies, institutions and programs that are involved in apprenticeship. None have total responsibility for all of the issues. However, any significant increase in the number of women journeypersons requires that they all be addressed.

A. Where Did All the Applicants Go?

In 1973 and 1974 in the 14 major apprenticeable trades that represent more than two-thirds of all apprentices, there were 14 women applicants for every one woman apprentice; on the other hand, there were only two male applicants for every apprentice in the same trades. 1/ Although a great deal of effort was being expended to increase the number of women who applied for apprenticeship, no attention apparently was being given to determine why the women who were applying were not being admitted. Our approach to this study, therefore, was that there was a need to determine what specific assistance women who did apply for an apprenticeship needed to improve their likelihood of being accepted.

What our study showed was that whatever the other reasons were for failure, probably the largest group of applicants who were not accepted as apprentices were women who never completed their applications. Many women applicants do not complete the process: file all the papers; take their written examination; or appear for their oral interview.

The reasons that so many women partially complete their application are varied: they start the application process without fully understanding the job requirements; or withdraw when they find out about the point system, the written examination, and the various complex factors surrounding the oral interviews.

The women who do not complete the application process appear to follow one of two courses. The first group are the women who apply on their own for admission directly to the JACs, companies and/or unions with little knowledge of what to expect. The second group are the women referred by recruitment programs. Recruitment programs are only able to refer applicants when the JACs announce they are accepting applications. In many cases, particularly in the construction trades, this was infrequently and irregularly. Many of the women who had been prepared earlier were no longer available when there finally was an opportunity to apply. They had given up waiting and accepted satisfactory employment elsewhere. The result was that many of the women who were referred had been hastily re-

1/ U.S. Equal Employment Opportunity Commission, unpublished Apprenticeship Information Report EEO-2, 1974 and 1975.

cruited and prepared for the application process. The result was that this group of women had very little prior preparation for the whole apprenticeship application process.

A great many more apprentices than we had expected are admitted to apprenticeship programs through an internal recruitment system within a plant or shipyard. This system selects applicants based on predetermined qualifications among those already employed in the industry. Applicants who were accepted began their apprenticeship as the next scheduled apprenticeship program was initiated or as an opening became available. If applicants needed further preparation, many of the companies were already operating preapprenticeship programs, and men and women participated in those programs prior to admission to apprenticeship. But in these cases, few women who applied directly for an apprenticeship would be considered.

Certainly, some women, as described by the JACs, could do better on the written examination. But the critical factor of admission does not seem to be that women are unable to get through that examination. Certainly, they need more vocational education; some of them need more mathematics; many have only a limited knowledge of tools, or of the industry, or are not in good shape physically; but these handicaps usually turn out to be more critical for the women once they are actually accepted into apprenticeship, than they are in preventing them from being admitted.

A critical factor in admission was the problems surrounding the oral interview, where many women were unable to convince the JACs that they did indeed have "commitment and a good working attitude." Assertiveness was reported as a requirement by many JACs, and whether or not that assertiveness was necessary to perform as an apprentice, it was clearly necessary in order to convince JAC members that the applicant was indeed a serious candidate. The oral interview for women has become a separate arena unto itself, and the recruitment programs are placing their major emphasis on training women to get through that interview rather than preparing them to become apprentices. The women who participate in a recruitment program are

better able to respond to the oral interview than others. Women who apply directly, on their own, without the assistance of a recruitment program have difficulty overcoming the barriers. Those barriers in the oral interview appear to be much more a barrier of sex stereotype and predetermined attitudes about women, than it is of overt discrimination. Covert perhaps, but by and large, the JACs do not seem to be aware of how discriminatory their practices are in fact, whatever they are in intent. Although the oral interview is a factor that often eliminates women applicants, at least some JACs did work with women applicants, urged those who had failed to reapply and assisted them to improve their relative competitive position.

Additionally, we discovered that the point system itself, independently, works seriously to the detriment of women at every step of the process. Many women were failing to gain admission to apprenticeship not because they were unable to pass the test, nor because they were found unacceptable during the oral interview, but rather because they could not build up enough points to be accepted, or, once accepted, were placed so far down on the list of eligibles that they were never reached for placement. (See Point System.)

The final factor that works against women entering apprenticeship was the difficulty that women had in finding placements once they were declared eligible (see Problems with Job Placement).

Thus, the problem of the gap between the number of women applicants and the number of apprentices is both important and complex. If we are to expand the number of women apprentices, the issue requires serious attention beyond simply the recruitment of more women.

B. Different Women/Different Trades

Our research has revealed some major differences in the problems to be faced by women entering the construction trades, and women entering the skilled industrial trades. Piecing together information received from women apprentices and from those we interviewed who have contact with the women, certain considerations emerge that are relevant to any overall conclusion concerning women in apprenticeship.

There have been a number of studies concerning the slow but steady movement of professional women into occupations that are considered non-traditional for women. The rise of women's consciousness to their changing role and expanding opportunities has clearly impacted these professional women. There is evidence that changes are also occurring among non-professional women. These women are beginning to see their roles changing to include employment as a part of their life. More and more women, professional and non-professional, are choosing to remain in the labor force, or are re-entering at an earlier time in their lives. The composition of women in the labor force not only includes those in the lowest economic classifications, where their employment is literally the essential ingredient which maintains the family above a level of poverty, nor are they just those women who are pursuing a career as a means of self-realization. There are now indications that a vast number of women in the working and middle classes are also seeking entry and re-entry into the labor force, primarily to increase the income and standard of living of their families. Including employment as part of their life pattern is a major change, but many of these women have given little thought to the type of employment--traditional or non-traditional--that they are seeking.

Many of the women who are merely seeking employment are graduates of a general curriculum in high school, who have had little training or useful work experience to prepare them for employment. Upon entering or re-entering the labor force, they seek the traditional jobs open to women that do not require prior training. By and large, the major jobs that are open to them are sales jobs, those service jobs that do not require very much specific training,

and for which their home life has provided them considerable work experience (such as food service and childcare), and lastly, those semi-skilled positions in industry that have been traditionally open to women. The semi-skilled operators are generally better paid, which is likely to be a major reason women seek employment in these positions, although most of the women are not as well paid as the men working in the same plants. Although some of these women may be seeking new life patterns, there is no evidence that many are unusually motivated to seek non-traditional jobs. We can assume, therefore, that they were "at the right place at the right time," to be offered the opportunity to enter apprenticeship through recruitment efforts by the industry. There seems little evidence that they themselves were actively seeking apprenticeship. Among this group are also women who were apparently seeking job placement assistance and were referred to apprenticeship by recruitment programs. As with the women working in industry, they had no particular motivation to enter apprenticeship.

On the other hand, there is a group of women who have sought employment with the notion that a job may be a career and a source of self-fulfillment. They are likely to be women who had a college preparatory program in high school, many of whom went on to college, and some who obtained college degrees. For various reasons, some of these professionally-oriented women are turned off by the professional life. They may be unwilling to invest the lengthy time required in preparation for professional employment or they may view the job(s) available to them as unrewarding. Some of these women view apprenticeship as a way of defining a new role or self-expression. They are seeking more than new life patterns; they are seeking new ways of responding to society and having society respond to them. These women have decided to pursue apprenticeship, some applying directly on their own initiative to a JAC, and some seeking assistance through known recruitment programs. Thus, it appears that there is a group of women who, for all of the complex reasons in our rapidly changing society, are interested in utilizing the skilled trades as a means of self-fulfillment.

The responses from the interviews, together with the data showing the very high percentage of the apprenticeship sample who completed college preparatory courses, (many of whom have one or more years of college) and on the other hand, the large group who completed a general curriculum, suggests that we are dealing with at least two quite different groups of women educationally, who are presently entering apprenticeship, or are seeking to do so.

Construction Trades

Women who are motivated to apprenticeship are directed into the construction trades by the established recruitment programs. Women who seek apprenticeship on their own without the help of a recruitment program also tend to select the construction trades. Because they have a limited knowledge of the non-traditional skilled occupations, these women select the trades that they know about, which tend to be the ones that are most visible. They are also the ones in which women are likely to have gained informal experience in working around their homes. It is not surprising that they would select electricians or carpenters, rather than stationery engineers.

The women, the recruitment programs, and the JACs all emphasized the difficulty of gaining access to the construction trades. There has been continuing high unemployment in the construction trades which has meant that their apprenticeship programs only rarely accept applicants, and there are indications that there may be more resistance on the part of the construction trades to the employment of women. When a construction JAC does accept applications, there is also a large group of men seeking entry, both White and minority, who are likely to have had the vocational education and work experience that is directly relevant to construction. Our interviews also described problems on the construction work sites.

Those few women who have had the strength to confront all of the problems of entry and retention in construction apprenticeship are not ordinary women, but are often the "superwomen." More is expected of them

as apprentices, and those who choose to meet the challenge reflect a drive, stamina, courage, self-control and discipline that goes far beyond what most people are able to give to a job. Using these "superwomen" as models or examples of what women apprentices are like and designing programs and supports based on these women may not be appropriate. The system must be able to accommodate women who want to work and who are able to work, but may not be extraordinary.

Recruitment programs have been inclined to perpetuate the recruitment of only the "superwomen" in order to provide a product that meets the demands of the JACs and the employers and to provide a good example to others. Many women who might be interested and could be prepared to do a commendable job are selected out by some of the recruitment programs, who admit to "creaming" the applicants. What is more, since there are only a few "superwomen," if the recruitment programs eliminate all other women, it seems unlikely that the number of women apprentices will expand to any major degree.

Industrial Trades

The women in semi-skilled occupations in industry have a better chance of obtaining admission into apprenticeship for several reasons. Several large corporations have been extremely sensitive to government pressure for equal right and have been willing to employ women as apprentices. (It is immaterial whether they are any less sex stereotyped than the contractors in the building industry.) Because the collective bargaining agreements of the industrial plants frequently require that two out of three persons admitted to apprenticeship be selected from within the plant, production workers have an advantage over outside applicants.

Many of these industries select more than the required two-thirds of their apprentice from among those already employed in the plant; it is an advantage to accept apprentices from among their own employees, since they thereby have the opportunity to observe their working habits, their steadiness, their "commitment," and their "work attitudes" in the context of a work

situation. From this vantage point, they are able to recruit among a "known quantity," and find it easier to locate qualified women and minorities. Additionally, although there has been unemployment among industrial workers as well as construction workers, unemployment was never as high for industrial workers, even at the base of the recent recession. With the improvement of economic conditions, the demand by industry for apprentices is considerably greater than the demand in the construction industry.

Women in the plants are also offered the best opportunity to obtain special training in order to prepare for admission, since many of the employers either themselves operate a preapprenticeship program, or provide the funds to pay at least partial tuition for women who take courses to prepare themselves for admission. They are also the women who are most likely to know and understand "what they are getting into" if they accept an apprenticeship, because they are already in the plant, and have a much better opportunity to observe the work that the apprentices carry out.

Ironically, it is the employers in the industrial plants who complain most about the difficulty of finding women willing to enter apprenticeship. Women in semi-skilled industrial positions are the women who are aggressively being recruited for apprenticeship, and yet, they are also the women who have the least motivation to become apprentices.

The motivation of these women to enter operative positions was primarily because they were seeking well-paid employment. This motivation seems to be further substantiated by some of the reasons given for their lack of willingness to enter apprenticeship. First of all, the salary structure is such that several companies and JACs indicated that after one year in a plant a woman would probably be earning more money remaining in production than she would make as a beginning apprentice. Second of all, many of the women in semi-skilled occupations feel that they have the opportunity to become foremen in their own unit without undergoing "all the hassles of entering an apprenticeship." Although many of these women are attracted by the fact that they may eventually make more money if they become journeypersons,

these women are already making what they consider to be the best salary available to them, and also have the opportunity to increase their income if they simply continue to work where they are. If their work is outstanding (and we can assume that the women that the employers are recruiting for apprenticeship are those who are the most hard working, responsible, and presumably the ablest of their women employees), apprenticeship offers them comparatively small inducements to leave the job in which they are presently employed. This rationale would seem to indicate shortsightedness in favor of present financial gain over development of a career which could take them much further, but if our theory is correct, most have not been looking for a career, nor do they necessarily have long range goals.

Mismatch

Thus, we have an apparent case of mismatch. The women being actively recruited for apprenticeship are women who were merely seeking the best paying job available, had probably not considered the idea of apprenticeship, and, in general, are not motivated to commit the time and effort necessary for apprenticeship. On the other hand, the women, who for various reasons of their own, are seeking apprenticeships tend to apply or to be referred to the construction jobs, where they have the least chance of success.

A few of the recruitment programs indicated that they wanted to refer women to industrial apprenticeships and could not because of their existing contracts with the DOL; in a few cases there were programs that were indeed informing women that their best opportunity for obtaining an apprenticeship was to seek employment on the production line of a major industry, though the instances of recruitment programs taking this approach were few and far between.

Although we would recommend that every effort be made to reduce the barriers to women seeking apprenticeable training in the construction occupations, a broader base of apprenticeable occupations needs to be considered in the placement of women. There should be broad dissemination of information that perhaps the most direct way to apprenticeship is to

be employed in a large industry that has an active and extensive apprenticeship program. Recruitment programs should be advised of this fact, as should employment security offices and others doing counseling and placement, including the schools. As part of this effort, the information from collective bargaining agreements should be collected to determine how many apprentices are likely to be recruited in any major plant in any given year; and further to determine what percentage must be recruited from employees within the plant.

Differences on the Job

Some of the differences that we have described suggest further insights to be considered in attempting to understand the dynamics of the problems of women in apprenticeship. As there are varying problems in recruitment of women and in access of women to the trades, there are also distinctions in problems on the job. Women in industry would appear to have fewer problems once placed, than those in construction. They are women who have the opportunity to gain relevant work experience and the opportunity to gain class instruction that will improve their capacity to perform as apprentices. In addition, they are faced with fewer problems than the women who enter construction apprenticeship. Even if they are the only woman apprentice, industrial apprentices are still not as isolated as are women on a construction site. Inevitably, there are other women in the plant: there are the semi-skilled women working in the production units with whom the apprentices may already have developed social relationships because they have been working together in the plant before they became apprentices. Therefore, if they need the support or the sense of "not being a total outsider," they can find other women in the plant with whom they can discuss their problems and find a social world that is less hostile than the all-male environment at the construction site. The construction sites, on the other hand, are often isolated, there is considerable harassment, some of which is traditional, but some of which is targeted specifically against the women. There are also problems related to the difficulty of the work and the degree of physical strength required. All of these problems make the construction trades the most difficult of apprenticesable opportunities for the women.

Different Backgrounds

Another factor to be considered, given the current patterns of recruitment, is the different backgrounds of these different types of women. Since men and women being selected for apprenticeship in the industrial plants are largely men and women who have been working on the production line, they are likely to have similar socio-economic backgrounds and more cultural similarities. A woman who has been working as an operator in a plant may be married to a man similarly employed and is likely to have parents, siblings, friends, similarly employed. On the other hand, the woman who has come through a college preparatory program in high school, and particularly those women who have been in college or are college graduates quite possibly have husbands or friends employed in professional, managerial, or other white collar occupations. An assumption can be made, based on their education and prior employment in white collar jobs that these women apprentices are likely to have cultural differences from their fellow men apprentices. These differences may be, in part, the cause of the difficulties that many women experience in the construction trades. The basic cultural differences may be offering problems that everyone is attributing entirely to sex differences.

Considering these tentative conclusions, it seems only rational that some effort should be made to test these conclusions in the field, and if they prove valid to begin to deal with the issue. In the meantime, recruitment programs should make efforts to sensitize young women not only to the sex differences and the implications of those sex differences to women on a construction site, but also attempt to determine life experiences of the women. If they are different from the men with whom they are likely to be working, they should be assisted to adjust to and understand these additional factors. Greater understanding might assist in reducing the harassment on the job site that young women report over and over again.

We do not have an adequate data base to explore fully the differences among the women in the different trades. However, the motivations of the women do not appear to be the same, and may, in fact, be radically different. If further research supports this hypothesis, it has important implications for the design of recruitment programs that serve women. A program for women, qua women, is not sufficient. Apprenticeships, as well as the women, are different. A program designed to accomplish the purpose should take into consideration all the possible variables.

C. The Point System

The point system is one of those difficult issues where the federal government's efforts to expand the access of minorities to apprenticeship are working at loggerheads with efforts to expand the access of women to apprenticeship. The problem is not competition--if a man who is a minority member is placed, a woman cannot be placed, or vice versa. The problem is that the system which was developed over the past decade to protect minority men from discriminatory practices and to improve their access to apprenticeship does not assist women, and in several ways, works seriously against them.

In order to increase the opportunities for minority men in apprenticeship, the method of evaluating an applicant's qualifications was changed to make it less discriminatory. Points were given for a variety of courses and work experience which minority men were likely to have had. These changes were appropriate in and of themselves, and we are not recommending that points for these courses and work experiences be eliminated, since they continue to be useful for favorably evaluating the qualifications of minority men. However, it is likely to be years before the point system will cease to work to the serious detriment of women. Until major societal changes occur, and women are encouraged to pursue and participate in non-traditional vocational training and non-traditional work experiences, providing points for such experiences will continue to work to the disadvantage of women.

A variety of approaches presently are being tried to improve the position of women under the point system. Some employers and JACs give points to women for any vocational education program that they have taken, be it traditional or non-traditional. However, the fact that the JAC is willing to give points for cooking, sewing, and clerical training, adds little to assist women applicants who have had no vocational training, primarily those with a college preparatory background in high school.

Additionally, many JACs and virtually all recruitment program staffs maintain that the skills that women acquire informally are not evaluated as highly as the skills obtained through the more formal methods commonly utilized by men, such as vocational classes, military service, or relevant work experience. In the professional fields there has been much support given to accrediting the administrative and supervisory skills that women gain from volunteer work when they seek entry to graduate schools or paid administrative positions. The same should hold true in the trade areas. Women should be able to translate their home activities--car and appliance repair, home maintenance, design skills, etc.--into credit for job-related skills, and to present them as relevant experience to be given commensurate point value.

JACs should adapt their evaluation methods in the awarding of points to give women credit for their informally acquired skills. A variety of methods should be experimented with to evaluate the informal skills and experiences. One method could provide points for each repair skill that can be demonstrated. Another might be the provision of credit for years of advanced academic training, as well as vocational training, whether or not it can be shown that it is directly related to apprenticeship. A woman with years in college is likely to have acquired knowledge that would be useful to her in apprenticeship and should receive credit for the years of education beyond high school. All apprenticeship programs should reinstitute the provision of points for mathematics and science courses. (Many JACs dropped this because so few of the minority men had these courses.) This system would be designed to add additional points for women, and would not eliminate points now being given that assist minority men. By these methods, the number of qualified women applicants should effectively be increased. However, the problem that qualified applicants have in obtaining placements is not solved by this approach. Amending the point system would be effective if implemented in combination with the establishment quotas for women and minorities, 1/ or by establish-

1/ Depending on the decision of the Bakke Case.

ing a pool of applicants, where all qualified applicants have equal opportunity for placement through random selection. The validity of this approach could be implemented on a trial basis with the DOL evaluating whether women given points for informally acquired skills make successful apprentices. If the experiment proves successful, and women are able to perform on a par with other apprentices, such an approach should be recommended to all apprenticeship programs using the point system in their selection procedure.

Every effort should continue to be made to include more women in non-traditional vocational training which would eventually reduce some of the problems. Until that time occurs, however, alternative strategies for evaluating the qualifications of women must be tried so that the women can become more competitive, without reducing the ability of minority men to compete for apprenticeship.

D. Job Placement Problems

1. The Hunting License

The "hunting license" system presents more placement problems to women than any other system. Under this system, qualified applicants are simply given a card from the union which states that they are eligible for employment as apprentices, and the applicants are then responsible for finding an employer who is willing to hire them. The problem is particularly severe in periods of recession, when jobs are difficult to find by anyone. In many trades, employers hire only a few apprentices, and during a recession with fewer apprenticeship turnovers and more layoffs, there may be no new openings. These factors also extend the length of time required for apprentices already in the system to complete their apprenticeships.

Seeking a job requires a certain degree of timing, since apprenticeships usually become available only when another apprentice quits or when an apprentices completes his/her apprenticeship. Employers are not in a position to expand the number of apprentices, since national standards for most trades require that there be a specified number of journeypersons (often five) for every one apprentice. Thus, employers almost always add several more journeypersons before they can add an additional apprentice. A large expansion of apprenticeships, therefore, usually occurs only when times are good.

Although the situation during a recession is extreme, placement under the hunting license system is always difficult. It does indicate the critical need for the JACs, or at least some central institution, to keep the information on apprenticeship openings up-to-date and readily available; specifically, the date when apprentices will complete their programs at each of the companies that are covered, as well as openings that occur when an apprentice drops out. Providing such an information system to all qualified apprentices is an excellent way for the union to indicate that it is not discriminating, and to prove that if a woman does not find a placement, it is the fault of the employer and not the union's. However, "there is no requirement that they undertake the task since they are not a placement agency like the union hiring hall, and therefore, there is

no requirement for them to have to assist any qualified applicant to find a job." What is more, under Executive Order 11246, the union has no direct responsibility to the federal government, since it is the employer with which the government has a contract; it is the responsibility of the employer to hire without undue discriminatory practices. If the employer does not meet its obligations under affirmative action, it is possible to enjoin it and to apply sanctions including the loss of its government contract. Since the Executive Order 11246 (see Government Regulations) places a variety of other affirmative action responsibilities on the employer, the regulations could also require that the companies keep the union informed of two things: (1) the approximate date when they are likely to need an apprentice, and (2) their affirmative action plan indicating whether the employer is short of minorities and/or women in that particular trade. This reporting system would inform the union of whether the employer would welcome the referral of a minority person or a woman when it has an opening to fill.

Even in a very large metropolitan area, most local unions will not have that many companies with whom they have contracts that keeping such a roster would prove burdensome. The union's roster should include: (a) the companies they represent (information they already have), (b) the date(s) when each company is likely to need an apprentice, and (c) the need for a minority person or a woman to meet the company's affirmative action obligations. This roster would be kept at the union headquarters, and could be examined by any woman or minority applicant, or in fact, any qualified apprentice. This system would save time, energy and frustration by better directing the whole "hunting license" system. It would assist the woman to find her own job and reduce the amount of time spent doing so, since she would know where and when to apply. Under the circumstances, a woman would have a better idea of whether it would be advisable to maintain her current employment until a placement is likely to become available.

As an extension of the new regulations, the requirement to hire women and minorities is placed squarely on the shoulders of the employer. The government (BAT) could assume the responsibility of suggesting an organized system such as the one described to all trade associations, national unions, and major employers utilizing the hunting license system, or could leave it up to the national organization to make the suggestion to their members and/or locals. The local BAT representatives could also attempt to organize the system in their local areas by making the suggestion to their JACs.

Various recommendations have been made to abolish the hunting license system, but its abolition could be considered an intrusion on the rights of both the employers and the unions. Organizing the system would appear to be a preferable approach. It also would help to eliminate the problem of an employer who is determined to hire someone he knows, once that individual becomes qualified for apprenticeship. The son, the nephew, the boy down the street has often been privy to information regarding apprenticeship openings for which he could prepare in a timely fashion. If the information becomes public , then the employer will have to decide whether to hire the apprentice he has pre-selected and be open to the charge of discriminatory practices, or by accepting a woman or minority referral. The system could also reduce the unfair advantage given to the person who comes into a JAC with a letter from an employer stating that if the JAC finds him qualified, the employer will hire him. In the past, the unions have been inclined to be extremely lenient on an applicant under such circumstances. Eliminating the practice should reduce the discriminatory behavior of both the union and the employer.

The problems of women obtaining placement under the "hunting license" system do not end with her first placement. Although women, once placed in the industrial plant or shipyard are likely to remain employed unless a serious economic downturn forces a layoff of employees, many placements, particularly those in the construction industry, are for only short periods of time. Upon completion of one assignment, a woman has to find

another job, frequently with another employer. Thus, the problem of finding a job repeats and repeats. If women are not to have a continuing series of problems, there must be a much greater commitment on the part of the government to monitor more consistenly employers' actions with regard to affirmative action. In the construction industry, barriers are so great that assuring that women get their fair share of placements must depend on more than simply her ability to find her first job (see Government Regulations).

2. The Hiring Hall

Although the hiring hall eliminates many of the problems of job searching found in the "hunting license" system, women frequently have troubles with initial placement, and apprentices awaiting placement may also experience discontinuity. (See section on Point System.)

The established procedures of a hiring hall are supposed to serve all its members fairly, but the experiences of women apprentices indicate that the procedures do not always work. However, all unions have grievance systems and procedures, and the recruitment programs should include utilization of such procedures and the assistance of the JAC coordinator in their efforts to assist women resolve problems they experience on the job. These methods of resolving difficulties tend to be more effective than immediately filing a complaint with a federal agency. Any external complaint procedure is likely to be uncomfortable, because union members are very devoted to the union, and particularly resent any attack on the union from outsiders. If the women are to have successful apprenticeships, they need to work within the union structure, and JAC coordinators as well as recruitment programs should assume the responsibility of explaining all of this to a woman before she starts her apprenticeship. The unions, in turn, must be responsive to the women and be willing to help resolve the problems from within.

E. Social Networking and Transportation

The issue of social networking is particularly sensitive one in the construction trades where many of the local unions' jurisdictions cover large areas in which JACs place individuals. In places that are too remote for individuals to return home at night, the group of apprentices working together on the job site often form a strong mutuality around their working circumstances which also provides a base of socialization during off hours. Women find that his male world is an extremely difficult one to break into.

"A few women," and it apparently takes only a few, assigned to the same job site, would appear to be among the easiest and the most rational solutions to the problem that all women face in moving into an all-male environment.

Since the patterns of employment and apprenticeship in the construction industry are not likely to change simply because of newly recruited women apprentices, if we are indeed serious about encouraging women's participation and retention, attention should be given to the placement of women on remote job sites. The practice of consistently placing women on remote locations when more accessible sites exist, warrants consideration as to whether this practice in and of itself is discriminatory. The recently issued regulations now state that women may lose their apprenticeship if they refuse to accept such placements (see Government Regulations). Yet employers are required to "eliminate sex discriminatory employment practices" that work particularly against women.

These isolated and remote placements tie in with other sometimes unique problems faced by women, in that many women do not have access to a private automobile. For married women, husbands traditionally have priority in the use of the family car for transportation to work; single women find it much more difficult than men to obtain loans from a bank with which to purchase a car. Additionally, although in rural, suburban, and outer city areas women are as likely to drive as men, there are still many central city areas where fewer people, and particularly women, learn to drive, own or operate cars.

The JAC coordinator should make every effort to assist a woman without adequate transportation who is assigned to a remote site to obtain transportation in a carpool with other apprentices or journeypersons. Any movement to drop a woman to the bottom of the placement list or withdrawing her membership in the local should be considered discriminatory on the face, if the woman is penalized because she cannot accept a placement in a remote site because of transportation-related problems, or if there is evidence that such placements were designed to encourage her to refuse the placement.

F. Government Regulations

Regulations have recently been issued by the Department of Labor that include women in affirmative action programs, both in construction, 1/ and in all other apprenticeable occupations covered by contracts subject to the Executive Order 11246. 2/ Additionally, the new vocational education regulations 3/ will have an impact on the problems women have had in being able to participate in the non-traditional programs that prepare students for apprenticeship. These three sets of regulations should contribute to producing more women who are better prepared to enter apprenticeship, will provide strong legal support for women in obtaining access to apprenticeship, and will assure that once accepted, the conditions of employment will cease to be discriminatory on the face. We should not be so simplistic as to assume that regulations will, in and of themselves, accomplish this complex goal. First of all, vigorous enforcement will be necessary; second of all, both young women in school and adult women seeking placement in apprenticeship will have to be made aware of their rights; finally, even if sex bias is eliminated, sex stereotyping, which is a much more complex phenomenon, will not disappear with the passage of new regulations. The elimination of sex bias requires only the will to make it work; however, the underlying issue of sex stereotype which pervades the attitudes and responses of the women and the employers, supervisors, fellow workers, JACs, vocational educators, etc., are a product of everything people have known and experienced all of their lives. The impact of such socialization will not be readily eliminated.

Nonetheless, if the regulations are carried out in good faith, they could be enormously helpful. Proposed goals and timetables in the construction industry are realizable and not so far from being attainable

1/ U.S. Department of Labor, Office of Federal Contract Compliance Programs. "Construction Contractors, Affirmative Action Requirements," 41 CFR 60-4, Federal Register 42 No. 158, August 16, 1977.

2/ U.S. Department of Labor, Office of the Secretary. "Equal Employment in Apprenticeship Programs," 29 CFR Part 30, Federal Register 42 No. 190, September 30, 1977.

3/ U.S. Department of Health, Education, and Welfare; Office of Education. "Vocational Education, State Programs and Commissioner's Discretionary Programs," Final Regulations, Federal Register 42 No. 191, October 3, 1977.

that people will not even try. The Department of Labor's goal of 50% of the women in the workforce for all trades other than construction will be a goal that will take more than a year to accomplish.

1. Government Regulations for Construction Industry

On August 16, 1977, the DOL issued proposed regulations for the construction industry, including new goals and timetables for the employment of women on federal or federally-supported construction contracts of $10,000 or more. Details of the requirements as they affect women are described below.

(a) Goals

Goals were established for a three year period that would apply to a contractor's or subcontractor's entire working force employed in the area, whether or not that working force is on a federal or federally-csissted construction project.

Time Frane	Goals for Employment of Women
1st year	3.1
2d year	5.0
3d year	6.9

These goals will prevail except where higher goals are required by state or local jurisdictions.

The question has been raised as to whether attainment of the goal is realistic. The experience in Seattle indicates that positive effects can be achieved, if the will exists. The City of Seattle has had a 12% goal for employment of women on construction contracts for several years.

> Mechanica, a skilled trades referral service for women in Seattle, reports that since these goals went into effect, women have been employed on every city construction job, and at least seven women have worked on university projects. In contrast, Mechanica has not been able to place one woman on a federally funded construction job, even though there is an estimated $99 million worth of Federal construction in Seattle. 1/

1/ Lehmann, Phyllis. "Women Journey into the Skilled Trades," Workfile, August 1977.

The Maritime Administration, which enforces the order of the shipbuilding industry, began requiring goals for women in 1972, and they have had an expanding number of women on construction-like jobs in the shipyards ever since.

(b) Working Environment

In addition to goals, the regulations mandate a working environment free of harassment, intimidation, and cohersion at all sites. Supervisors are given the responsibility for carrying out this order. It is important to note that more women apprentices had difficulty with their supervisors than with their fellow workers. If supervisors are to be made responsible for the elimination of harassment, the JAC coordinators and the employers are going to have to commit a considerable amount of effort to making this occur. These key actors can assist the supervisors in many ways.

Simply providing instructions or information to supervisors regarding the new regulations is unlikely to change their attitudes or actions. The DOL could assist the training of supervisors by developing a training program to be utilized by the thousands of local apprenticeship councils. We would recommend that an audio-visual presentation be designed for the purpose of training. As part of their contract, the recruitment programs could be funded to show the materials. Contractors who receive a government contract could require that their supervisors attend the training sessions. Such a session might be held once a month at a central place in each SMSA, keeping the numbers involved to a reasonable size. The session should be designed to bring about discussion around the issues presented in the audio-visual materials, how the suggested changes could be carried out at the work site, how the "subtle and covert activity" which the women complain about could be identified, and strategies could be developed for the elimination of the more obvious harassment and sexual aggression. Cooperation would be needed from the JAC coordinator and the employer. The JAC coordinator could be included in such sessions, since the positive role that the JAC coordinator can play to eliminate such harassment, is a very important one (see section on Need for Supportive Services, p. 85).

If a woman continues to experience harassment at a work site, she can file a complaint, either with a local review body or with the DOL. The complaints, however, are not likely to reduce the harassment, and may aggravate the situation to make it almost impossible for the woman to work in an isolated work site. Therefore, one must assume that a system that does not provide absolute anonymity to a woman who files a complaint, will be useful only if the woman has already decided to drop out of apprenticeship.

Another important way the key actors can assist the supervisors is to organize the work sites so that two or more women are assigned to the same site. For trades that utilize the hiring hall, the unions could be extremely helpful in making such a practice possible, by referring more than one woman to a site. Even two women in different trades would be helpful and could be arranged, if the hiring halls would assume the responsibility. When a woman comes to the top of a union's placement list, the hiring hall would determine whether there are other women on its own eligibility list that could be sent out. If it does not have another women available for assignment or there is only one opening for the trade, the local could telephone the hiring halls of other trades to recommend that the other union(s) refer a woman to that site. It would require only a small change in the present referral system. The responsibility for the effort would not always be with the same local; no union would be expected to assume full responsibility of jumping women to the top of their list. It is important at the same time that Department of Labor collect data to determine whether the assignment of more than one woman to a site actually does improve the ability of women to adjust to a construction work site.

2. Regulations Regarding Equal Employment in Apprenticeship (29CFR30)

Proposed regulations designed to bring about equal employment for women in apprenticeship programs were issued on September 30, 1977. On the basis of these regulations, all affirmative action plans for apprenticeship programs with federal contractors cover women as well as minorities within 90 days of the issuance of the regulations. Affirmative action goals will be established based on the percentage of women in the

workforce (see Table 1), who have the potential to qualify for apprenticeship programs. The goal for the first year will not be less than one half of the proportion of women in the labor force in the program sponsor's labor market area (this would be about 20% of all apprentices) and should be adjusted after the first year. (See Table 1.) Availability will be determined on the basis of the number of qualified women who can be identified in a vigorous outreach program.

Affirmative action must go beyond hiring to employment practices including assignment of work, rotation among all work processes of the trade, advancement, and job performance.

(a) Affirmative Action Plan (§30.4)

Affirmative action plans require that an adequate outreach and recruitment system must be designed to increase the number of minorities and women who become eligible for selection. Information on application for admissions must be available at least 30 days in advance of the earliest date for application. For those accepting applications throughout the year, information must be disseminated at least semi-annually. Such information shall be made available to local schools, employment service offices, women's centers, outreach programs and community organizations which can reach minorities and women.

Employers must cooperate with local school boards and vocational education systems to develop programs for preparing students to qualify for entry into apprenticeship programs including preparatory trade training or other programs designed to prepare applicants for apprenticeship. Those who complete such programs successfully will be afforded the opportunity for admission into the apprenticeship program.

Methods for indicating that a "good faith effort" has been made include the use of present minority and women apprentices as recruiters, career counseling, periodic auditing of affirmative action programs and activities, and developing reasonable procedures to eliminate discriminatory practices.

The regulations require that the contractor review its obligations to the women apprentices with all supervisory employees every three months and prior to their start at any site, so that the supervisors fully understand their responsibilities to keep the work place free of discriminatory practices against women.

In order to accomplish this, we suggest that material should be disseminated to the major unions, through the BAT and the State Apprenticeship Councils to assist supervisors in this effort. In cooperation with JACs, a feasible training program could be offered annually by the Bureau's State and City representatives when a JAC registers its program. Bureau personnel and the State Apprenticeship Council staff and their district representatives would have to be trained, and they, in turn, could serve as trainers for JACs and company sponsors. As an alternative, the recruitment programs might be similarly funded to provide the training.

(b) Selection Method (§30.5)

Apprentices will be selected from a pool of eligible applicants established on the basis of the rank order of the scores of applicants on one or more qualification standards, including aptitude tests, and educational attainment (including G.E.D.). There must be a significant statistical and practical relationship between the rank order of applicant scores and their ability to perform in the apprenticeship program.

Eligible applicants can be selected by a random selection procedure which would improve some of the problems for women, but since this method is not mandatory under the regulations, it would help women being placed by hiring halls only if the union chose this method. It would have no impact on those selected through "the hunting license" (see section on Hunting License), which has caused the most difficulty to women in obtaining placements.

The point system is not addressed in the regulations, although we consider this a critical factor (see Point System). The ranked order method of selecting apprentices from lists of approved applicants can continue to keep many women out of apprenticeship. This would be true

regardless of the ability of the local JAC to show that its testing procedures were appropriate on the basis of bona fide occupational qualifications (BFOQ).

Where an employer's failure to meet goals is attributable to its selection method, which can be shown to adversely affect the opportunity of minorities, and/or women to gain access to employment, the sponsor will have to redefine or change its selection method. If its existing list of eligibles does not include enough women or minorities, the sponsor will be required to discard its existing eligibility list, and to establish a new one.

Applicants who have been placed in a pool of eligibles must be retained for a period of two years and may be removed from the list at an earlier date only by the request of the applicant, or following his/her failure to respond to an apprenticeship job opportunity.

Removing an apprentice from the qualified list by her failure to respond to an apprenticeship job opportunity can work in a discriminatory manner against women. (See Social Networking and Transportation.) On the basis of those we interviewed, sending an apprentice to a work site far removed from her place of residence has been a method used by employers (and one would assume by the hiring hall) to eliminate those apprentices that are not wanted.

(c) Oral Interviews

Oral interviews cannot be used as a requirement to determine eligibility. However, once an applicant is placed in the eligibility pool and prior to his/her selection for apprenticeship, s/he may be required to submit to an oral interview. Oral interviews shall be limited to objective questions to determine the fitness of applicants to enter the apprenticeship program, and to determine his/her "motivation and ambition." When an oral interview is used, each interviewer will be required to record the questions and the general nature of the applicant's answers, and

must prepare a summary of conclusions. Each applicant rejected on the basis of an oral interview must be given a written statement of the reasons for such rejection. Requirements for admission, reasons for rejection, and appeal rights must be made available in writing to each applicant.

These procedures for the oral interview might eliminate some of the sexist questions that have been common practice in oral interviews, but the only real gain is that it requires better documentation of sexist decision-making. That this will be an improvement is unquestionably true. However, it may still not address the underlying problems that have been observed in the oral interviews.

Further changes in the regulations affecting oral interviews, could go further to eliminate sexist practices. The JACs over and over again reiterated that during the oral interview women had to show that they had "commitment and good working attitudes" in order to prove their acceptability. The implications of the way these two words were used indicated marked sex stereotyping in the practices used in the oral interview. How one determines "commitment" of a woman is difficult to perceive, especially if the interviewer has a traditional view of women which could color his perception of a woman's commitment to a skilled trade. A woman's "attitude" was frequently determined in the oral interview by her assertiveness; the result is that a woman is required to gain access to apprenticeship by proving her ability to get through the oral interview, which has no bearing on her ability to perform as an apprentice.

Although the verbiage used by the regulations is somewhat different, the two sets of words as they are used can be interpreted in the same way. The regulations permit the JACs to require that women prove their "motivation and ambition," during the oral interview; yet women could be both "motivated and ambitious" without being able to project the image to a member of the JAC whose stereotype of women is that they are neither.

(d) Age

The proposed regulations (§34(c)(9) state that "if age exceeds the maximum for admission to a program, no such action would be permissible if ignoring the age ceiling will assist the sponsor in achieving its affirmative action obligations." The probability, in most cases, is that it can be shown that ignoring the age ceiling will assist the sponsor to find more eligible women, but maximum age should not prevail under any circumstances. The U.S. Courts of Appeal and the U.S. District Courts have in every case supported the fact that a maximum age is illegal in apprenticeship. 1/ The programs designed to recruit and prepare women for apprenticeship do not understand the implications of the court decisions. Even in such states as California, where a state statute makes it illegal, recruitment programs reported that they could not place an applicant because she was too old. The definition in the regulation is likely to be too complicated for most people to understand, and therefore, unless the regulations deal directly with the issue of maximum age criteria, age is likely to continue as a barrier.

1/ District court improperly found that employer has not violated Acts of 1866 and 1964 by its requirements that applicants for apprentice programs be under 26 years of age or under 30 years of age if they served in military--Pettway v. American Cast Iron Pipe Co., 7FEP Cases 1115; Age restriction for admission to employer's maintenance craft apprenticeship program perpetuates past racial discrimination, and therefore, unless business necessity is shown, cannot be used as obstacle to rightful place in department--Stevenson v. International Paper Co., Mobile, Alabama revs'g in part,10FEP Cases 1386; Joint apprenticeship committee's apprenticeship program does not meet requirements of Title VII, where, inter alia, program is open only to applicants between ages of 18 and 24 except those in service-- Steamfitters, Local 638; U.S. v DC NY (1973) see also 3FEP 349, 6FEP Cases 319; Oregon apprenticeship and training council may not bar individual from being employed by employer in authorized apprenticeship training program for electricians on sole ground that he is 43 years old--Judson and Judson's v. Apprenticeship & Training Council of the State of Oregon (Ore CtApp (1973) 4FEP Cases 747; Reasonable cause exists that employer violates Act by barring employees over age 25 or 30 from admission to apprenticeship program--EEOC No. 71-1418 (Mar. 17, 1971) 3FEP Cases 580; Cause exists to believe that union violated Act by requiring applicants for apprenticeship program to be no more than 25 years old, to have high school degree, and to pass unvalidated aptitude tests--(EEOC No. 72-0265 (Aug. 6, 1971) 4FEP Cases 68.

(e) Complaint Systems

Non-compliance of the foregoing regulations by a sponsor is subject to sanctions.

Filing -- Any apprentice or applicant for apprenticeship may file charges with the DOL either personally or through an authorized representative within 180 days of the date of the alleged discrimination, if s/he believes that discrimination has occurred, or that the equal opportunity standards with respect to his/her selection have not been followed.

Sponsors are encouraged to establish fair, speedy, and effective procedures and a review body using three or more responsible community members to consider complaints or failure to follow the equal opportunity standards. If the complaint is not resolved within 90 days, or the review does not seem adequate, the DOL can undertake its own review.

A major problem from the very beginning with the Executive Order 11246, has been the difficulty of getting the federal government to exercise sanctions against an employer who exhibits overt racist and/or sexist behavior. There is no particular reason to assume that the DOL will exercise its authority to impose sanctions any more with these regulations, than they have done with previous regulations. However, even without the exercise of sanctions, the promulgation of regulations will probably stimulate a given amount of conformity by the contractors simply "to keep Justice off their back."

Previous experiences indicate how much improvement can occur with just the threat of action on the part of the federal government, even when no action is actually taken. It is possible that a similar result can occur for women as a result of the new regulations. How successful these programs can be is testified to by examining Table 1. Fifteen years ago, before the major drive undertaken to expand apprenticeable opportunities for minority men, the percentage of all apprentices that

were minority looked very much like the percentage of women today. There is still a great distance to go in some states for Blacks for, but the gains have been extraordinary and similar gains should be able to be achieved by women during the next decade, if the Government mandates adherence to the Regulations.

3. Vocational Education Act of 1976

Federal regulations were issued for vocational education programs on October 3, 1977. The regulations require that the state set forth a detailed description of the procedures it will utilize to assure equal access to programs by men and women, including the specific actions that will be taken to overcome sex discrimination, and the incentives adopted to encourage enrollment of women in non-traditional programs. A state may now use funds to support services for women who enter non-traditional vocational education. These support services include counseling for both those entering and those enrolled in non-traditional programs; bringing persons into the schools as role models; providing students the opportunity to visit the work place of business or industry, and follow-up support to assist women in finding employment relative to their training and employment. All of these supports would clearly include preparation for placement into apprenticeship, and would provide funds for services to women apprentices after they have been admitted. The state may use funds to provide day care services for children of students in secondary and postsecondary vocational education which would include related instruction for women apprentices.

Putting the vocational education amendments into effect should increase the number of women who enroll in training for non-traditional occupations and could provide an additional resource to assist women to enter and remain in apprenticeships.

Efforts should be expended by those interested in expanding apprenticeship opportunities for women to assure that the needs of women apprentices are included in the State Vocational Education Plan, so that funds can be used for these purposes.

Table 1. -- Apprentices and Population by U.S. and State, 1976

States	Black	Indian	Asian	Spanish	Total Minority	Women 4/	Percent Women Entrants
US Total 1/	9.4	1.4	0.4	4.7	15.0*	1.7	3.1
Percent Population 2/	11.1	0.4	0.8	4.6	17.0*	40.0 3/	
Alabama	15.3	0.4	0.0	0.2	15.9	0.4	0.9
Percent Population	26.2	0.1	0.1	0.4	26.8	39.8	
Alaska	3.4	19.8	0.9	1.7	25.8	3.1	9.1
Percent Population	3.0	17.0	0.7	2.0	22.7	41.9	
Arizona	3.6	9.3	0.2	20.2	33.3	0.5	2.7
Percent Population	3.0	5.3	0.5	18.8	27.6	38.7	
Arkansas	11.3	1.8	0.0	0.4	13.5	0.3	0.4
Percent Population	18.4	0.1	0.1	0.5	19.1	40.6	
California	7.9	2.2	1.3	13.9	25.3	1.1	3.1
Percent Population	7.0	0.4	2.7	15.5	25.6	39.3	
Colorado	3.5	1.6	0.4	17.6	23.1	1.1	5.1
Percent Population	3.0	0.4	0.5	13.0	16.9	39.1	
Connecticut	7.1	0.1	0.2	1.4	8.8	1.6	3.7
Percent Population	6.0	0.1	0.2	2.4	8.7	41.5	
Delaware	6.9	0.1	0.1	1.1	8.7	0.5	0.5
Percent Population	14.2	0.1	0.4	1.1	15.8	40.0	
District of Columbia	25.4	1.0	0.4	0.8	27.6	1.1	2.1
Percent Population	71.2	0.1	0.7	2.1	74.1	51.4	
Florida	6.4	0.5	0.2	2.6	9.7	0.4	1.5
Percent Population	15.3	0.1	0.2	6.6	22.2	41.9	

*Includes all other minorities.

1/ 1976 BAT Registered Apprentices.
2/ 1970 U.S. Census
3/ 1976, Current Population Survey, Employment and Earnings, Extrapolated.
4/ Percent of all apprentices and percent of all workers.

Table 1. -- Apprentices and Population by U.S. and State, 1976 (Continued)

States	Black	Indian	Asian	Spanish	Total Minority	Women 4/	Percent Women Entrants
Georgia	21.1	0.3	0.3	0.3	22.0	2.0	1.7
Percent Population	25.8	0.0	0.1	0.7	26.6	41.7	
Hawaii	0.0	0.0	82.7	0.0	82.7	0.1	1.5
Percent Population	1.0	0.1	58.0	3.0	62.1	38.2	
Idaho	0.5	2.0	0.5	2.7	5.7	1.2	1.2
Percent Population	2.8	0.8	0.4	2.7	6.7	36.9	
Illinois	11.9	0.6	0.3	3.7	16.5	0.4	1.7
Percent Population	12.8	0.1	0.4	3.3	16.6	40.6	
Indiana	9.4	0.3	0.0	1.3	11.0	1.2	3.5
Percent Population	6.9	0.1	0.1	1.3	8.4	39.9	
Iowa	4.8	1.0	0.1	1.8	7.8	0.6	1.8
Percent Population	1.1	0.1	0.1	0.6	1.9	39.2	
Kansas	7.6	1.4	0.3	3.3	12.6	0.9	0.8
Percent Population	4.7	0.4	0.2	2.1	7.4	38.5	
Kentucky	10.6	0.2	0.1	0.1	11.0	0.9	2.0
Percent Population	7.1	0.0	0.1	0.3	7.5	37.7	
Louisiana	25.0	0.3	0.2	0.5	26.0	2.1	3.8
Percent Population	29.8	0.1	0.1	1.9	31.9	37.1	
Maine	0.0	0.3	0.0	0.0	0.3	0.6	2.2
Percent Population	0.3	0.2	0.1	0.4	1.0	40.6	
Maryland	13.1	0.5	0.3	0.3	14.2	1.4	1.7
Percent Population	17.8	0.1	0.4	1.4	19.7	40.2	

-110-

Table 1. -- Apprentices and Population by U.S. and State, 1976 (Continued)

States	Black	Indian	Asian	Spanish	Total Minority	Women 4/	Percent Women Entrants
Massachusetts	8.4	0.2	0.4	1.1	10.1	1.0	2.1
Percent Population	3.0	0.1	0.4	1.1	4.6	43.0	
Michigan	11.1	1.1	0.1	2.4	14.7	1.0	3.0
Percent Population	11.2	0.2	0.2	1.4	13.0	38.6	
Minnesota	1.4	0.8	0.1	0.4	2.7	0.3	0.7
Percent Population	0.9	0.6	0.2	1.4	2.3	40.7	
Mississippi	19.7	0.2	0.1	0.2	20.2	3.6	6.3
Percent Population	36.8	0.2	0.1	0.4	37.5	41.3	
Missouri	13.8	1.0	0.1	1.9	16.8	1.5	1.3
Percent Population	10.2	0.1	0.1	0.9	11.3	40.8	
Montana	0.2	3.9	0.3	0.8	5.2	3.5	5.8
Percent Population	0.3	3.7	0.1	1.2	5.3	37.1	
Nebraska	6.2	1.1	0.3	3.2	10.8	1.1	1.6
Percent Population	2.7	0.5	0.2	1.4	4.8	39.3	
Nevada	9.4	3.4	0.3	6.6	19.7	1.1	3.6
Percent Population	5.7	1.4	0.6	5.5	13.2	38.5	
New Hampshire	0.3	0.3	0.0	0.5	1.1	1.5	0.0
Percent Population	0.3	0.0	0.1	0.4	0.8	41.5	
New Jersey	14.9	0.2	0.3	3.2	18.6	0.7	1.1
Percent Population	10.7	0.1	0.3	1.9	13.0	40.2	
New Mexico	1.6	8.1	0.3	42.3	52.3	1.2	2.3
Percent Population	1.9	7.0	0.2	40.1	49.2	37.2	

Rj ASSOCIATES, INC.

Table 1. -- Apprentices and Population by U.S. and State, 1976 (Continued)

States	Black	Indian	Asian	Spanish	Total Minority	Women 4/	Percent Women Entrants
New York	7.8	0.6	0.6	4.0	13.0	0.8	2.5
Percent Population	11.9	0.1	0.7	4.8	17.5	41.5	
North Carolina	9.7	0.7	0.1	0.3	10.8	0.3	1.2
Percent Population	22.1	0.9	0.1	0.4	23.5	42.4	
North Dakota	0.0	3.5	0.3	0.3	4.1	0.3	0.3
Percent Population	0.5	2.2	0.2	0.3	3.0	35.2	
Ohio	11.3	0.2	0.1	0.9	12.5	0.8	1.6
Percent Population	9.1	0.1	0.2	0.9	10.3	39.0	
Oklahoma	8.5	9.7	0.0	1.4	19.6	1.0	2.6
Percent Population	6.7	3.8	0.1	1.4	12.0	39.3	
Oregon	1.8	0.8	0.4	0.8	3.8	0.7	2.0
Percent Population	1.2	0.6	0.6	1.7	4.1	39.8	
Pennsylvania	7.1	0.2	0.1	0.4	7.8	0.4	1.1
Percent Population	8.6	0.1	0.2	0.4	9.3	39.9	
Rhode Island	10.8	0.6	0.1	1.2	12.7	1.4	5.5
Percent Population	2.4	0.1	0.3	0.7	3.5	40.8	
South Carolina	17.0	0.6	0.0	0.2	17.8	0.6	2.7
Percent Population	30.4	0.1	0.1	0.4	31.0	41.4	
South Dakota	0.2	3.8	0.0	0.3	4.3	1.0	2.0
Percent Population	0.3	4.7	0.2	0.5	5.7	37.2	
Tennessee	12.4	0.2	0.1	0.1	12.8	0.5	1.6
Percent Population	15.8	0.0	0.1	0.4	16.3	41.3	

Table 1. -- Apprentices and Population by U.S. and State, 1976 (Continued)

States	Black	Indian	Asian	Spanish	Total Minority	Women 4/	Percent Women Entrants
Texas	8.6	1.8	0.2	14.5	35.1	1.1	2.6
Percent Population	12.5	0.2	0.2	18.4	31.3	38.8	
Utah	0.8	15:	0.4	5.0	7.7	0.2	0.8
Percent Population	0.7	1.0	0.7	4.2	6.6	38.8	
Vermont	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.2	0.2	2.1	3.0
Percent Population	0.2	0.0	0.1	0.5	0.8	40.5	
Virginia	11.1	0.1	0.2	0.4	11.8	5.0	12.0
Percent Population	18.5	0.1	0.3	1.1	20.0	38.8	
Washington	7.3	2.2	1.1	2.2	12.8	1.5	4.1
Percent Population	2.1	0.9	1.3	2.1	6.4	37.9	
West Virginia	7.0	0.1	0.1	0.1	7.2	1.4	1.4
Percent Population	3.8	0.1	0.1	0.3	4.3	35.4	
Wisconsin	3.1	0.9	0.1	0.9	5.0	3.7	9.5
Percent Population	2.9	0.4	0.2	0.9	4.4	40.3	
Wyoming	0.5	1.0	0.7	6.6	8.8	0.8	2.1
Percent Population	0.6	1.5	0.3	5.7	8.1	37.2	

27 states are below the percent Blacks in the population of the state. Nationally, the percent Black apprentices are below their percent in the population.

All other minorities have percent apprentices nationally that are at or above their percent in the population. Only three states are below the percent Indians in their state--27 states are below for Spanish. Only 8 states are at or above national average on women. Only 9 states are at or above national average of new apprentices.

G. Selection of a Trade

According to the latest available data from BAT for January through June, 1977, there were 4,395 women apprentices, representing 1.4% of all apprentices (254,968). An examination of the number of women employed in apprenticeship indicates that women are making only very small gains, numerically or proportionately. The gains, in fact, are so small that if women are ever to be fairly represented in the skilled crafts, their entry into apprenticeship programs must be greatly accelerated. Although certain skilled trades have been wont to "blanket-in" individuals who have not completed their apprenticeship, this type of access has not been available to minorities or women. If women are to gain access, apprenticeship seems to be the only method available. Therefore, solutions for expanding the number of women apprentices must be sought.

One approach that can be taken is to examine the various types of apprenticeable trades to determine whether certain trades offer greater opportunities for employment than others.

In 1976, there were about 46,000 apprenticeship programs operated by about 18,000 sponsoring organizations. These programs were training about one-quarter of a million apprentices in about 400 occupations. Ninety-five percent of all apprentices are in 53 apprenticeable occupations. Only 5% of the apprentices are trained in the remaining 350 occupations. 1/

Of the 4,395 women apprentices in the latest (1977) BAT report, 35%, more than one-third, are in eleven classifications (listed below). Women have been fairly successful at participating in some classifications of these trades. Because of this participation, these trades have a "neutral" image.

Although these eleven trades represent 5% of all apprentices, they represent 35% of all women apprentices. Thirteen percent of the appren-

---

1/ U.S. Department of Labor, Bureau of Apprenticeship and Training. Apprenticeship Action Data for January-De-ember 1975 obtained through the State National Apprentice Reporting System (SNAPS), Washington, D.C., November 15, 1976.

tices in these classifications are women. These trades have not been included in our study, since women have had the least difficulty entering them. However, many of these apprenticeships give evidence of being segregated in the internal labor market. That is, under the same or very similar titles there are apprenticeships that have been traditionally held by women, and those traditionally held by men. Such segregation tends to be hidden by the overall reporting. If an effort were made to

	Number of Women	Percent Women	Number of Apprentices
Barbers and beauticians	681	56.4	1,208
Bookbinders/bindery workers	126	16.8	753
Compositors	102	12.2	853
Cooks and bakers	168	10.6	1,587
Electronic technicians	134	8.5	1,581
Industrial technicians	83	10.8	769
Lithographers/photo-engineers	38	3.9	963
Medical/dental technicians	71	9.5	749
Optical workers	44	7.6	579
Press operators	30	1.5	1,962
Printers and publishing workers	121	4.8	1,099
	1,530	12.7	12,103

break this internal occupational segregation, it is possible that more women would be able to find an apprenticeship opportunity. However, the printing trades are declining occupations, and although jobs are still available, they are becoming fewer and many persons skilled in the printing trades are employed in occupations below the skill level for which they have been trained. It seems foolhardy to recommend to women that they should seek training in those classifications where job opportunities are small to non-existent.

The twelve trades in the table below represent 65% of all apprentices and 35% of all women apprentices, but only 0.9% of all apprentices in these classifications are women. These 12 occupations are the major construction and manufacturing apprenticeships.

	Number of Women	Percent Women	Number of Apprentices
Auto and related	26	0.3	8,223
Bricklayers	14	0.2	6,657
Carpenters	271	0.8	33,437
Electrical workers (N.E.C.)	121	2.0	6,196
Electricians	237	0.8	31,135
Machinists	245	1.6	15,237
Painters	144	2.4	6,057
Plumbers	36	0.2	13,138
Pipefitters	172	1.3	16,850
Sheetmetal workers	57	0.5	10,753
Tool and diemakers	172	0.2	7,677
Structural steel-workers	18	0.2	10,906
	1,514	0.9	166,265

It is on these major trades, each with more than 6,000 apprentices, that this study has focused. In these trades women are least represented, and there is the greatest opportunity for expanding employment of women.

Additionally, 11 trades listed below with between 2,000 and 6,000 apprentices have 16% of all apprentices and 13% of all women apprentices; 1.5% of apprentices in these trades are women. These are large programs that, except for the butchers, are less well known and are less frequently sought by women. The reason that comparatively few women apply for these large apprenticeable classifications may be that women are not exposed to many of them.

	Number of Women	Percent Women	Number of Apprentices
Boilermakers	11	0.4	3,114
Butchers	196	5.2	3,763
Car repairers	21	0.7	2,834
Cement masons	11	0.4	2,521
Mechanics and repairment	43	1.2	3,652
Sprinkler fitters	1	0.0	2,557
Insulation workers	13	0.6	2,202
Linemen	89	2.2	4,025
Maintenance mechanics	116	2.5	4,626
Millwrights	46	0.9	4,869
Operating engineers	47	0.8	5,810
	594	1.5%	39,973

Millwrights, operating engineers, and boilermakers are apparently not in every woman's vocabulary, and women may have a very vague idea about what people do who are employed in these apprenticeships. Therefore it is important that both the schools and the recruitment programs make themselves better informed about these apprenticeable occupations, and that women have the opportunity to visit job sites, and to become better acquainted with these classifications. These occupations offer good placement opportunities, since there are fewer persons competitively seeking these placements, and they have a small but steady intake very year.

There are 18 small categories that have less than 2,000 members nationally. The represent 8% of all apprentices and 5% of all women apprentices. Only 1% are women. The opportunity for jobs in these classifications will vary by local area, and schools and recruitment programs should investigate their availability in their own local area.

	Number of Women	Percent Women	Number of Apprentices
Drywall installers	17	2.5	674
Aircraft mechanics	14	3.9	389
Draftsmen	51	5.7	893
Molders and coremakers	5	0.8	596
Ornamental ironworkers	0	0.0	285
Patternmakers	10	1.1	931
Radio/TV repairers	11	1.3	829
Airconditioning/refrigeration	8	0.4	1,778
Autobody repairers	4	0.2	1,919
Cabinetmakers	31	1.9	1,666
Office machine services	46	2.5	1,875
Stationery engineers	15	0.9	1,618
Plasterers	4	0.4	1,024
Steamfitters	1	0.1	1,048
Machine setup/operators	7	0.7	1,248
Lathers	3	0.3	1,135
Glaziers	2	0.2	1,174
Floor covers	1	0.1	1,187
	231	1.3	20,500

Part III -- Recommendations

Recommendations

The issues that have been delineated in the present research indicate that significant changes are required to improve the opportunities for women in apprenticeship. Major changes in our schools and our society are necessary so that young girls will have experiences and opportunities to better prepare them to enter a wide variety of occupations including the apprenticeable trades. However, to recommend total changes in the socialization of women in our society, which will take decades to accomplish, is far beyond the scope of our effort here.

Women are not willing to wait for an entirely new generation before there is an opportunity for change. Change must come now to respond to adult women who are presently seeking (or might seek) apprenticeship opportunities. These women are likely to have had limited apprenticeship-related vocational education or work experience, and to have been subject to all of the sex stereotypes and biases in our society. In addition, the men who will select them, work with them, and supervise them, will also have been subject to the same biases and stereotypes, and will have been given less reason or desire to change. However, unless movement occurs now, it will continue to be difficult for the next generation of women to be treated as equals in the skilled market place. Institutional change must occur to accomplish both short-term goals for the adult women, and long-term goals for the next generation.

Our recommendations are addressed to those institutions in which change must occur.

A. Recommendations to School Systems

Recommendations to Schools

- Changes must occur in the schools in order to stop perpetuating traditional roles for women.

- Students should be encouraged to consider employment options other than college. Schools should take greater responsibility for providing assistance to students who are not college bound.

- Women in school need to learn the value of mathematics and physics courses for skilled occupations, as well as professional occupations; all students should be encouraged to take these courses.

- Exposure to the trades should begin in elementary school with tours through plants, and even to construction sites, in cooperation with JAC's.

- The schools should play a major role in assisting students to prepare for apprenticeship; Career Days, therefore, must address both young men and women as early as possible--prior to completing junior high schools, or at the very latest upon entering high school.

- Early in their school years, preferably not later than at the junior high school level, young women as well as young men need to be informed of the career opportunities in the skilled trades and to have opportunities to experiment with a variety of tools. They would then have the time to take the necessary related courses in high school.

- Women generally know less about the skilled trades, but both men and women need much more information on job opportunities in apprenticeship.

- Parents and students should be prepared to fight, if necessary, to assure that students have access to the classes of their choice, particularly non-traditional vocational courses.

School Counselors

- Programs need to be established to help counselors and other school personnel overcome their own conditioned responses based on the sex of a student so that they can provide students appropriate counseling without regard to sex bias. Career counseling should be offered not on the basis of sex, but on the basis of the interests of the individual. The interests identified should not be on the basis of sex stereotyped occupations.

- The staff of the recruitment programs and the JACs should meet on a regular basis with counselors at the junior high, secondary and postsecondary school level to assist them to better understand the complexity of admission to apprenticeship.

- Through career education and counseling, women should be encouraged to learn about the full range of apprenticeable occupations. Some might thereby select trades for which there is less competition that still might coincide with their interests. Early exposure to the trades can spark the interest of women as well as men.

- The women who express an interest in a non-traditional area must be encouraged to explore the area, and given the same guidance in that exploration as a male student.

Teachers

- Teachers may be in a better position than counselors to judge their student's interest and ability and from this vantage point could be more helpful in giving students direction, particularly if the teachers are informed of existing opportunities. For this reason, labor market information should be made available to teachers as well as counselors.

- Programs should be instituted to educate teachers as to the nature of the skills required for a variety of trades. In order to do this, programs could be developed for teachers to work at several plants during the summer on a rotating basis, or at least to spend some time (paid) at job sites.

Physical Development

- Much greater attention should be given to the interrelationships between employment in the skilled trades and physical development.

- Physical development of women should begin in kindergarten. Girls and boys should be encouraged to develop their muscles, and their interests in sports should be supported.

- The team spirit/group activity should be stressed in sports programs so that women will develop the physical capacity equal to the demands of apprenticeship, and will understand the psychological group identity so important to the male world a woman apprentice enters.

- Girls and boys should be encouraged to participate jointly in sports.

Recommendations to Vocational Education

- Schools must stop separating vocational education into male and female categories. Women need the opportunity to take non-traditional vocational education classes, and should be encouraged to do so. These classes would permit them to explore the area to see if they like it, as well as provide them with useful related experience.

- To compensate for previous conditioning, a broad range of courses should be required for all students, so that all students have at least some exposure to the different occupational areas. Mandatory vocational education courses using tools would be beneficial for everyone--even those who do not plan to make a career of it. It would also remove some of the stigma of vocational education courses, and would assist in reducing occupational segregation by sex.

- Programs that provide exposure to a variety of tools and their appropriate terminology should be developed both for students in school and to provide a training resource to women participating in recruitment programs. Women should be encouraged to take courses in shop, mechanical drawing, blueprint reading, auto mechanics, etc., which would improve their ability to pass written apprenticeship examinations.

- Efforts should be made to help prepare interested juniors and seniors in high school for written examinations and oral interviews required for admission to apprenticeship. Weaknesses could be discovered at this stage, and further training offered.

- Vocational education schools should play a larger role in pre-apprenticeship programs by developing and offering special programs for interested applicants, including women.

- Vocational education institutions have been successful in establishing committees designed to provide guidance to vocational education programs on the nature of work to be performed in various jobs. This experience could provide an excellent base for the vocational education department to establish advisory committees, including representatives of the JACs and appropriate companies and unions, to assist the schools in better preparing students for admission to apprenticeship, and to assist them in enabling men and women to pass the apprenticeship examinations

and oral interviews. Additionally, they could feed back information to the students to assure that women were informed about the special and significant problems that they are likely to face in apprenticeship.

Companies and Unions

- Schools should make the effort to establish closer ties with companies and unions, in order to work with them to provide information on apprenticeship to students.

Related Instruction

- Because of their identity with the school system, their regular exposure to the apprentices, and their knowledge of the demands of apprenticeship, related instructors should be utilized to serve as a link between JACs, schools, and women. The related instructor is aware of what his/her students are lacking, knows the demands of apprenticeship and could suggest what curricular changes are needed at the high school level that would be relevant for apprenticeship preparation.

- The central location of related instruction classes which are utilized by most women apprentices could serve as a means of communication among the women either in class or through arrangements made by the related instruction teachers.

Vocational Education Act of 1976

- Utilizing vocational education funds, programs should be described in state plans that provide services to women apprentices including:

  -- counseling, both for those entering and those enrolled in apprenticeship,

  -- bringing successful women into the schools as role models,

-- providing women applicants the opportunity to visit work sites or places of business or industry,

-- providing follow-up support to assist women in finding apprenticeship placements,

-- providing day care services for children of women apprentices in related instruction.

Recommendations to Other Organizations

- Various women's groups, Girl Scouts, Campfire Girls, Church groups, should arrange for job site visitations as part of their programs. Efforts should be made through their national offices to encourage their affiliates to arrange for non-traditional as well as traditional job site visitations which would prove useful in exposing young women to a variety of occupations.

B. Recommendations to JACs, Unions, and Employers To Eliminate Discriminatory Practices

- Variations on the point system should be tried, retaining the advantages of the present system for minority men, but experimenting with points that will assist women to obtain admission to apprenticeship, such as giving points for:
  - -- traditional vocational education
  - -- science and mathematics
  - -- years of postsecondary education
  - -- experience gained informally at home, etc.

- Women should be accepted on a six-month experimental basis, without regard to point system.

- JACs should work with supervisors to eliminate harassment at the work site and keep work sites free of discriminatory practices.

- While the regulations only encourage the establishment of an effective complaint procedure, JACs should assume the responsibility of establishing such procedures in all cases. The anonymity of the complainant should be preserved in any system established.

- JACs should assist in organizing work site assignments to assure that there is more than one woman at each work site (with the assistance of the hiring hall, where appropriate).

- JACs should open oral interviews to the public on a regular basis and should invite observers, unless the individual women request a private oral interview.

- JACs should encourage and facilitate the organization of carpools for its apprentices.

- In programs utilizing the "hunting license," JACs should establish a roster of available apprenticeships, including a notice of when openings will become available; the roster should be readily available to women qualified as apprentices, and to staff of recruitment programs.

Coordination

- The JAC administrator should work closely and continually with women apprentices, journeypersons, employers, the union, the recruitment programs, and others involved in the apprenticeship system; he should see his role as a resource to all groups and be able to move diplomatically among them, rather than being used as a front for any particular group. The recruitment program should assist in helping to achieve this positive environment.

With Recruitment Programs

- JACs should refer all women applicants to recruitment programs prior to their taking the oral interview.

- JACs should assist recruitment programs to improve their service to women so that recruitment programs can assist more women to become accepted into apprenticeship.

- JACs should assume the responsibility of informing the recruitment programs and the women considering entry into apprenticeship about the role of the union, grievance procedures, etc., which could improve their adjustment to apprenticeship.

- The JACs should establish job site visitations for the recruitment program, so that women will have better knowledge of the work and the working conditions of a variety of apprenticeships. This will permit women to judge if they are interested in seeking admission to apprenticeship.

With Schools

- The JACs have expressed a willingness to work with the schools and should do so in order to develop a better ongoing program which would have a greater impact on both minorities and women seeking access to apprenticeships.

- JAC representatives should keep counselors informed of projected job openings in all apprenticeships, current requirements for admissions, and recommended preparation for admission to their union. They should also work with teachers in establishing curricula that might be more relevant to preparing students for apprenticeship.

- The need for coordination between the vocational education schools and the JACs is essential. The problem of inadequate communication between the two has been described as not only a problem for women,but also an important issue that affected men.

Employers

- Apprentices, particularly in the construction industry, should be able to obtain their related instruction between jobs, through four weeks of paid time of related instruction per year. An experimental program should be undertaken to provide funds from each the employers, based on the number of apprentices each employs, to cover the salaries of the apprentices. Related instruction would be provided at any time an apprentice is not employed on a job (construction), on "down time" (manufacturing). For women employed in industries that do not have "down time," four weeks of paid leave a year should be provided, during which time they should be able to complete their classroom requirements.

Recommendations to Industry

- Industry should guarantee women workers recruited from the plant the right to return to their jobs on the line without loss of seniority, if they should fail or not adjust to their apprenticeship within a period of six months.

Recommendations to Unions--Salaries

- In order to attract the best women candidates including women presently working in production jobs who are earning higher wages than a beginning apprentice, a pay differential should be allowed for any person entering apprenticeship from a production job. Using this method, men and women who have been employed at a plant long enough to be earning a salary beyond the wages of an entry apprentice would not be discouraged from accepting an apprenticeship position.

C. Department of Labor (DOL)

Activating DOL's Affirmative Action and Women-in-Construction Regulations

- DOL must utilize its full powers in support of the Executive Order 11246 and the new construction regulations, to assure that companies are monitored, so that they carry out not only the provisions requiring the employment of women as apprentices, but also the elimination of discriminatory practices in the admission to apprenticeship, and in women's working environment after they have been admitted.

Recommendations for Programs and Services

- Fund comprehensive recruitment programs in all major SMSA's to provide services to women both in preparation for, and support after placement in apprenticeship.

- Utilize recruitment programs to train supervisors to perform tasks required under governmental regulations.

- Develop audio-visual materials to be utilized in training sessions for supervisors designed to train supervisors to reduce harassment at work sites and discriminatory activities at work places to comply with new apprenticeship regulations.

- Require DOL-funded preapprenticeship programs to accept qualified women referrals from recruitment programs.

- Develop a program to meet transportation needs of women apprentices.

  -- by developing car pools

  -- by setting up revolving funds to assist women who need to purchase cars to get to apprenticeship sites.

Recommendations for Changes in the Regulations

- Address the issue of the point system.
- Provide anonymity for women filing complaints.
- Make random selection procedures (from pool of qualified applicants) mandatory.
- Disallow removing women from list of apprentices for failure to respond to job assignments at remote work sites, if women are so assigned in a discriminatory fashion.
- Deal directly with the issue of maximum age criteria.

Recommendations for Further Research

- Determine the impact of women's ability to adjust to the problems of apprenticeship by placing more than one woman on a job site.
- Determine the success of paid related instruction four weeks a year (instead of two nights a week) while women are unemployed, during "down time," or for periods on leave.
- Determine whether counseling actually helps applicants and/or apprentices, since there are contrary reports about its usefulness.
- Analyze apprenticeship opportunities among all 400 apprenticeship programs within each SMSA, to identify those apprenticeable trades that women should be encouraged to consider for employment in their local community. Data should be shared with recruitment centers, BAT, etc.

- Evaluate the point system, and if changes are instituted, determine whether women who are selected under experimental programs are effective as apprentices.

- Develop a system of clustering apprenticeships, so that a woman could simultaneously prepare for several apprenticeships thereby improving her opportunity for placement.

- Evaluate the impact of the new regulations.

D. Recommendations for a Model Outreach Program

A model program must address the need for a wide range of services that can respond to the variety of problems women face both in attaining admission to and retention in apprenticeship. There are certain essential components that must be part of a model program. There are other components and services that must be available to the model program, but which the program itself need not administer as part of its activities. A model program must, however, have the funds to purchase and the right to place women into available services that more appropriately are run by other agencies and institutions. The program proposed herein describes the components and activities that must be addressed by a model outreach program.

1. Recruitment

The recruitment of women must take into consideration the variety of women to be served--from the more traditionally-oriented women to the most non-traditional. For this reason, the outreach efforts should be varied. Recruitment will depend on agency referral, self-referral, and referrals by other participants. Informational brochures should be distributed by the outreach programs to employment and training agencies, high schools, postsecondary institutions, and community agencies. Media announcements and articles in the newspapers which have proven very successful for some groups, should be utilized as well. Another successful technique an outreach program should consider is the use of women apprentices and journeypersons as recruiters.

Many of the programs have accepted only highly qualified women who are likely to be admitted thereby providing JACs with an applicant who is competitive while at the same time improving their placement records. Limiting intake in this way will inevitably limit the number of women who enter apprenticeships because the number of highly qualified women with vocational and work experience is very few.

2. The ongoing Program

The ongoing program provided by an outreach program must be designed to serve women employed in other occupations, and women out of the labor force, at home, presumably caring for their children. Neither of these groups of women are in a position to participate in a training program for several hours during the day. Yet these two groups represent three-quarters of all women who apply for apprenticeship. Outreach programs that will accommodate the largest number of women should, therefore, start after working hours, at about 5:30 P.M. and continue to about 8:30 in the evening. To provide the in-depth training and preparation that is needed, the sessions should be held at least three evenings a week with the program extending no less than eight weeks. (It should be designed to continue for an even longer period of time for those women who feel they need further assistance and can participate.) Attendance should be expected at every session, not on a drop-in basis. The programs should provide a variety of services beyond recruitment and counseling. A concentrated effort will be needed to assist women prepare for the application process and to gain in-depth exposure to one or more trades. The ongoing program may not actually have to provide additional supportive services, but all essential services must be available through other agencies on a referral basis to meet the varying needs of the women.

Across the country the major effort by the outreach programs has been to prepare women for the oral interviews, and to a lesser extent for the written examination; in these efforts, the programs have been relatively successful. However, some of the JACs have found problems with the outreach programs, stating that they are not adequately preparing the women for placement. It should be, in part, the responsibility of the outreach program to find out from the JACs precisely where the JACs believe they are failing their women clients, and how their program could be improved to increase the number of women being accepted. The responsibility to improve the quality of service to the women should be shared by the outreach programs and the JACs. It should be the responsibility of the outreach programs to make this cooperation possible, if the JACs are in any sense willing.

By cooperating with the JACs, the Women's Programs will be able to learn more about the apprenticeship system so that they will be able to work better with the JAC coordinators. The absence of both knowledge and rapport between the JACs and the Women's Programs was reported by many JACs. The Women's Programs often expressed hostility toward the JACs. Utilizing the JACs should improve the service they are able to provide women both before and after placement.

Women's Programs should also have some sessions on the role of the union in apprenticeship, and on how to work with the union. The outreach program should invite JAC coordinators and other representatives of the union to meet with the women and explain such things as grievance procedures, the role of apprenticeship, the advantage of union membership, etc., as part of their program.

3. Counseling

Counseling has been and should remain a major component of the services offered by the outreach programs. As part of this counseling service, outreach programs need to be informed about a wide range of apprenticeship opportunities in their local area and be prepared to assist women in considering all their options, and the relative merits of each. The outreach programs should broaden their focus to include as many trades as possible rather than focusing on a single or a few areas.

Group counseling sessions can be utilized to explain to interested women the different types of apprenticeships; how placements are obtained in each of the several different types and the likelihood of gaining admission in each; what the competition is likely to be; and the length of time one may have to wait for the apprenticeship of one's choice. The decision by a woman to seek a particular apprenticeship will thereby have been placed within the context not only of her interest, but also of the likelihood of her being admitted, and how long she will have to wait for an available placement.

The outreach programs should arrange for site visits for the women so that they have the opportunity to observe women apprentices on the job. A role model is seen as very helpful to assist women see themselves as apprentices and to believe that apprenticeship is not unrealistic. If there are no women in a particular trade, at least women should be able to observe a man doing the job so that they have a better sense of what is actually involved in the performance of the specific apprenticeship.

Counseling discussions should follow, not precede, job site visitations. The advantages and disadvantages of pursuing apprenticeship should be presented, providing a balanced picture and allowing the women to discuss the problems on the basis of some observed experience. Women should be informed of the difficulties in apprenticeship before applying, but also assured that the outreach program staff are available to help them in dealing with the problems once they begin their apprenticeship.

4. Preapprenticeship Programs

Women who are unemployed or who have no conflicting responsibilities during the day are in a position to enter an established preapprenticeship program. In order to improve their likelihood of gaining admission to apprenticeship, outreach programs should refer these women to an established preapprenticeship program, particularly if a stipend is available, and if an apprenticeship placement is likely to be available on completion of training. Preapprenticeship programs funded by the DOL to unions or trade associations have not always accepted referrals from Women's Programs and other outreach programs. Either additional programs should be established that will provide preapprenticeship training specifically for women, or DOL-funded programs should be required to accept women referrals as a condition of the receipt of federal funds. Preapprenticeship programs tend to be very selective of participants they will accept; but such programs should be encouraged to expand the number of women they are willing to serve.

The preapprenticeship programs that have designed programs for minority men have been relatively successful, but they have had little experience with women. For this reason, the outreach programs should provide the supportive services for women who are accepted into preapprenticeship programs, and the preapprenticeship programs should be responsible only for training and placement.

If preapprenticeship programs do not exist in the apprenticeship in which a woman is interested, the outreach program should apply to a company which operates its own preapprenticeship program to accept the woman for placement. Funds should be made available to reimburse the company for such placements on a per person basis if it is necessary. Funds to cover such placements should be made available to the outreach program from the Department of Labor (DOL). The outreach program should seek a permanent placement in an apprenticeship programs in one of the smaller companies on completion of the preapprenticeship program.

5. Written Examination

As part of the preparation for the written examination, the outreach program should provide tool recognition and terminology courses or arrange for such courses through a vocational education school or a skill center. These courses would provide the women the opportunity to work with and become familiar with tools. The program should be broadly designed and provide sufficient basic information to serve women applying for a wide range of apprenticeships.

The most frequent complaint of women participating in an outreach program was that they did not get enough job-related training. "It was mostly theory--no hands-on training." Several, but by no means a majority, expressed their concern that the program was generally inadequate or too short; others listed specific shortcomings--not enough vocabulary preparation, not enough time on tools, not enough familiarization with the trade.

Most apprentices would have liked more vocational programs, mathematics, and blueprint reading. Outreach programs should provide all these elements needed by women, or as an alternative, provide for them through a local vocational school or skill center. Arrangements should be made to assure open access to such schools and courses to women referred by outreach programs. The outreach programs should not simply refer women to a vocational school to take courses, but should develop with the women and the schools a series of special cross-cutting courses that will meet the specific needs of the women.

Before determining that women need specific preparation for the written examination, women should have the opportunity to take several practice tests to find out whether they actually need assistance in mathematics or on the general questions. By and large, these areas do not seem to be the critical issues for most women applicants, and therefore, building it in as a major component of an outreach program may be unnecessary. However, even if only a few women need this kind of assistance it should be available to them. Also women who need assistance with the G.E.D. should be referred to an existing program that serves persons who need that assistance. Since the number of women who are interested in apprenticeship who are not high school graduates is very few, this should not have to be replicated at the outreach program.

6. The Oral Interview

The outreach programs have been placing their greatest emphasis on preparing women for the oral interview, and have been successful in using role playing techniques to help the women. They have coached the women to help them present their experience in the best light possible, and have helped them to appear more assertive and self-assured. Some of the outreach programs not only train for the oral interview, but they also monitor it to be certain that no unfair questions are asked, and no discriminatory attitudes are displayed. This practice makes good sense just so long as the JACs do not view it negatively and count it against the women who are

being interviewed. This should be negotiated with each of the JACs in advance.

Women who apply for apprenticeship programs that require an oral interview as part of the admission procedure have the greatest difficulty if they apply without any prior preparation. Without the assistance of an outreach program to evaluate their informal experience, or to assist them in framing responses to the questions that they will probably be asked, they are likely to have great difficulty defending their ability to become successful apprentices. Since this group seems to be having particular difficulties in getting through the oral interview, the JACs should refer all women applicants who pass the written examination to an outreach program prior to the oral interview. The outreach program might also arrange a visit to at least one job site prior to the oral interview, so that the women will have some real perception of what the apprenticeship entails. This would put them in a better position to equate whatever skills they possess to the skills necessary to perform the required tasks.

7. Placements

In most cases, an improved placement system developed by the outreach program would certainly assist women since placement has been a major problem. Although efforts should be made to coordinate the time between completion of an outreach or preapprenticeship program and beginning of apprenticeship training, the apprenticeship system is not likely to change. Improved placement would require control over apprenticeship and would invade the prerogatives of employers and unions.

Women should be encouraged to maintain contact and continue in the outreach program as long as possible even after they have been accepted for apprenticeship, while awaiting placement. The program needs to provide women seeking placement with support and advice in order to reduce the number of the women who become discouraged and seek other permanent

employment. The outreach program should maintain regular contact with the women who have gone through the program in order to be able to quickly identify women who have been prepared for the application process and to reduce the number of women who would have to be hurriedly prepared when apprenticeships do open up.

In addition, material should be developed on clustering of apprenticeships so that if a woman decides to prepare for one apprenticeship and is not accepted, or the selected apprenticeship program does not have openings, she will be in a position to apply for one or more others.

Another way to avoid the disruption and instability caused by erratic apprenticeship openings is for the outreach program to assist women in finding employment in a semi-skilled production job in a company that recruits directly into its preapprenticeship or apprenticeship program from within the plant.

If the JACs do not develop a roster of available apprenticeships for those women who must seek their own placements, the outreach program should be funded to carry out the responsibility. Without such information it may be impossible for a woman to find a placement.

8. Supportive Services

There have been few supportive services available for women other than counseling, yet some of these components are essential if the number of women moving into apprenticeship is to expand.

(a) Childcare

An outreach program for women that will be in operation from 5:30 to 8:30 in the evening would avoid conflicts with their jobs, but many women do not have the resources to find someone to take care of their children during those hours; therefore, assistance with childcare may be

essential. A program that provides care for small children and a re-creation and study program for older children during the evening hours would be very responsive to women's needs. A church group, a central labor body, or other social service agency might assume the responsibility, or the outreach program itself might assume the responsibility. Since women are unlikely to be able to afford the extra cost prior to admission to apprenticeship, the DOL should also fund the childcare center as part of the overall outreach program.

Childcare is a universal problem for the working mother, but it is a unique problem for women apprentices once they are placed. The woman apprentice may be required to work on varying shifts in order to gain the full range of experiences; she may have to work at remote sites; or may be required to attend related instruction classes at night. For very large employers in any city who have a great many women working the off-shift hours, a childcare unit at the plant itself might be appropriate. However, the feasibility of such a unit depends on the size of the plant and the number of children involved. Such an arrangement does not accommodate the problems of the women who have somewhat older children, who may be too old to be brought to a childcare unit, and too young to be left at home alone. Additionally, if the apprentice does not have a car or access to a carpool, transporting a young child to a childcare unit on the swing shift or the midnight shift may be out of the question. The program discussed for participants of an outreach program could also care for children of women in apprenticeship, when the requirements of their apprenticeship make it essential that they be away from home after the usual childcare hours.

The funds to support such a service once the woman is working could be raised by charging all employers to maintain the childcare unit by charging for each apprentice whether a man or a woman). A single unit could be made available to all apprentices and could be operated under the auspices of a community service organization, the local AFL-CIO central body, a church group, or any other cross-cutting group appropriate to the local community.

(b) Transportation

A variety of systems are needed to cover the transportation needs. A major effort should be made to develop carpools with other apprentices and journeypersons. In addition, the DOL might provide a revolving loan fund which would assist women to purchase a car, where it is necessary, so that they are able to reach placement locations that are off the public transportation routes. If the DOL proves unwilling to support such a fund, it is possible that either the unions or employers or a local credit union might provide funds for such purposes; this could be paid for under the Vocational Education Program, if it is included in the State Plan.

(c) The Critical Factors of Physical Development

The physical condition of a woman is not a problem at the time she is seeking admission, but it is essential to most apprenticeships. Women need to learn to balance weights and to utilize all the techniques they can master to make up for their absence of brute strength. This problem is also faced by certain men, but women over twenty years of age are more likely to be out of condition. Certainly, bringing a woman to full physical development, prior to entry into apprenticeship is essential if she is to have a successful apprenticeship.

A physical development component should be part of any outreach program and all women should participate, unless the type of apprenticeship for which a woman is preparing requires no particular physical strength. The program should be designed to bring a woman to her peak of physical strength and tone; it should also teach her how to lift and balance heavy objects, as well as all the tricks of weight distribution. A special program should be developed for this purpose, and the cost of YWCA or Health Club memberships or special equipment should be included in the funding to an outreach program. A regimen for her to follow once she is admitted to apprenticeship should also be designed.

Many apprenticeships require standing for long periods of time, and most require appropriate shoes and dress. Many women are poorly informed about appropriate clothes for the type of work they will be doing. This should also be part of any preapprenticeship training. Examples of appropriate types of shoes, socks, pants, shirts, etc., should be available, and information about where they can be purchased for a reasonable price. Where special gloves or shoes are required that are not available in women's sizes, the national unions should order them in the proper sizes for purchase by women.

9. Services After a Woman Becomes an Apprentice

The emphasis of the programs has been to assist women in gaining admission to apprenticeship, but services that will address the problems that women face after they have been accepted for apprenticeship must also be included.

All women need access to counseling after they start apprenticeship. If there is anything that is apparently universal among apprentices, it is the difficulty that most women have in adjusting to the all-male world they are exposed to once they are admitted to apprenticeship. There should be someone with whom the women can discuss any problems they are having in adjusting to the job. In some cases, the JAC coordinator has been able to serve in this counseling role, but this individual may not always be suited for the task. Therefore, the outreach programs should be funded to provide follow-up counseling services to women who feel the need for it, for the entire time of the apprenticeship.

A variety of methods have been suggested as to how more than one woman can be assigned to a job site, and of various ways of bringing together the women apprentices working in the same plant. The outreach programs should keep a record of where the women apprentices are presently working, and wherever possible, arrange to bring women apprentices together on the job.

Since, in most of the construction trades, assignments are for relatively short periods of time, this may be a very difficult for the outreach programs to undertake. But even if it is very difficult, the outreach program itself should take the initiative of trying to bring the women together either on job sites, in plants, or if necessary, out side of the work situation.

Apprentices who continue to have difficulty with harassment and discriminatory practices from supervisors, fellow workers, placements, etc., should be able to discuss their legal rights, procedures for complaints before grievance committees of the union, etc. Once a complaint by an apprentice has been filed with a governmental agency, and her fellow workers find out about it, her position may become untenable no matter what protection the governmental agencies presumably offer her. For these reasons, the outreach program should be prepared to provide her the advice and assistance she may need.

Outreach programs should also be funded to provide monthly training sessions to assist supervisors, in both the construction industry and others. These sessions should be designed to reduce harassment at the work site and to improve the working relationship between women and supervisors and men apprentices, in order to meet the requirements of the new regulations as described in Government Regulations.

10. Funding

Outreach programs should not be expected to deal with all these problems without being adequately funded. Similar services have been available for a dozen years to assist minority men obtain entry. Programs for women should be equally extensive.

Appendix

Methodology

The purpose of this research was to determine the differences in background and preparation of women who were successful in gaining admission into apprenticeship programs and women who had failed to gain entry.

The Equal Employment Opportunity Commission (EEOC) collects data from every Joint Apprenticeship Council for each Standard Metropolitan Statistical Area (SMSA) nationally that show the number of apprentices, applicants, graduates and dropouts by sex (and race). The latest data available at the time our study began were for 1974. Neither the state apprenticeship councils nor the national offices of the trades maintain the names and address of apprentices and applicants. This information is available only through the local Joint Apprenticeship Councils or Committees (JACs) who sponsor an apprenticeship program. The only alternative source of locating applicants and apprentices were the programs designed to recruit and prepare women for apprenticeship. They would, however, have provided a universe of apprentices and applicants that was limited and somewhat biased by being exclusively the population served by those programs.

1. Sample Selection of Women Apprentices and Applicants

Utilizing the 1974 EEOC-3 data, we selected JACs who had had contact with ten or more women including apprentices, applicants, graduates, and dropouts. The bookbinders and printing pressmen were excluded from selection because women have been successful in being admitted and retained in these trades as indicated in both the EEOC data and the BAT data.

2. Pre-test

As the projected total sample of women apprentices and applicants was relatively small, a field test was conducted to determine the most efficient way of finding the survey population and of obtaining a high response from the women. Two diverse sites were selected for the test, and several methods were chosen to test the efficiency of locating the

women for the survey, as well as for eliciting responses from them. A tentative instrument for the survey was printed for distribution in the pre-test.

Three approaches were used to see which elicited the best response:

(1) Writing a letter to the JAC representative requesting names, addresses, and telephone numbers of women applicants and apprentices;

(2) Telephoning the JAC representative and requesting the information, and

(3) Telephoning and making an appointment with the JAC representative to come in and pick up the information.

The most efficient approach to locating the survey sample proved to be sending an initial letter to the JAC asking that they either send names and addresses to the project staff, or to distribute the questionnaires, and then phoning to find which method was preferred. This method proved to be the least time consuming, and offered the most flexibility to the JAC representative.

3. Distribution of Survey Instrument

Nationally, we were able to identify 84 JACs representing 29 different trades across the country who met the criteria.1/ Each of these JACs was contacted by letter requesting their cooperation in assisting the project to identify and locate the women apprentices and applicants (see Figure 1).

The JACs were given the option of: (1) providing the project staff with the names and addresses of the women so that the staff could mail out the questionnaires, or (2) mailing the questionnaires in stamped, return addressed envelopes that the JAC simply had to address. The latter method was required as an alternative for those JAC's who were willing to cooperate,

1/ Contact with a total of at least ten women: applicants, apprentices, dropouts and graduates.

but were not willing to release names and addresses. This problem was identified during the pre-test, and our method was shifted to accommodate the problem.

Approximately five days after mailing the letter to the JACs, the JACs were contacted by telephone to determine whether they were willing to participate and which method they would like to use. During this phone conversation, project staff determined the regularly scheduled meeting date of the JAC and determined if the JAC would be willing to be interviewed (see Selection of Interviews).

Either the project staff or the JAC mailed out the cover letter and questionnaire to the women apprentices and applicants (see Figure 2). Each questionnaire was coded to identify the city and union of the person to whom it was sent to determine when response was low and to follow-up where necessary. (There was no way to identify the individual women who completed the questionnaire.)

The respondent was provided a stamped addressed envelope for return of the completed questionnaire. The response to question #1 of the instrument identified whether the respondent was an apprentice or an applicant.

4. Response Rate

Of the 84 JACs contacted, 29 agreed to participate. A total of 525 questionnaires were sent, 216 were mailed directly by the project staff, and 309 were forwarded to JACs for them to distribute.

A total of 111 questionnaires were returned, 77 from apprentices and 33 from applicants. An additional five were returned but were not able to be utilized because of incomplete responses. Seventy-eight mailed envelopes were returned because they were undeliverable/addressee unknown.

The difficulty in locating and reaching women apprentices and particularly women applicants is reflected in the small number of responses that were received. Project staff had to rely heavily on JACs to distribute the questionnaires or to provide names and addresses of

women applicants and apprentices. The fact that more than twice as many apprentices responded than applicants could be a reflection of the practices of persons being registered as applicants when they picked up an application blank rather than when they completed and submitted it. They, therefore, would not consider themselves applicants. The age of the women applicants may also have a bearing on the number of responses. Many women were under thirty which is often an age when they move more frequently and change their names when they marry which would not be reflected in the JAC information. Naturally, these facts make mail delivery of the instruments more difficult. We had no way of checking on how many of the instruments were mailed by the JACs themselves.

We recognize that the sample is small and does not represent a statistically significant sample. Therefore, we have utilized the data only as it provides trends or as it highlights ideas that were further substantiated in our interviews.

5. Selection of JACs and Recruitment Programs to be Interviewed

As described earlier, JACs were queried as to their willingness to be interviewed when they were contacted regarding the method of distributing the questionnaires. The JACs interviewed were those with whom the women apprentices and applicants had had contact. Recruitment programs assisting women to prepare for apprenticeship were selected in the same cities as the JACs. A total of 17 JACs and 13 recruitment programs were interviewed nationally. Additionally, selected interviews were conducted with State Division of Apprenticeship Standards, related instructors and women apprentices.

The trades and cities represented appear below:

Trades Represented

Electrician	Welder
Carpenters	Pipefitter
Operating Engineers	Sheetmetal
Painters	Tool and Die
Butchers	Millwright
Masons	Plumbing
Machinist	Machine Repair
	Shipfitters

Cities Represented

Atlanta, Georgia	Groton, Connecticut
Jacksonville, Florida	Washington, D.C.
Pascagoula, Mississippi	St. Louis, Missouri
Flushing, New York	Detroit, Michigan
Denver, Colorado	Flint, Michigan
Cleveland, Ohio	Ypsilanti, Michigan
San Francisco, California	Indianapolis, Indiana
Oakland, California	New York, New York
	Los Angeles, California

Additionally, one-third of all programs among the 84 were subsidiaries of one company. Although we were unable to gain their cooperation, their Assistant Director for Labor Relations did agree to be interviewed and arranged our visiting three JAC offices to conduct interviews.

6. Analysis Techniques

As the survey instruments were returned, data were coded and entered. A straight run was developed and analyzed to determine the type of matrices that could be utilized. Matrices were set up depending on the number of responses, and the size of the cells that could be attained. The matrices were designed to determine some of the demographic characteristics of the women applying for apprenticeship, what their education preparation and work experience had been, how it helped or hindered their application, what specific problems they experienced and solutions they suggested. Each issue was analyzed by whether the women were apprentices or unsuccessful applicants.

Interview reports were developed for each interview conducted based on the responses to the interview questions. The responses of JAC representatives, recruitment program staff, related instructors and apprentices were analyzed for commonalities and differences of responses. (See Figure 3 for Interview Questions.)

FIGURE 1

Rj associates

January 26, 1977

Rj Associates is under contract to the Office of Education, Department of Health, Education and Welfare to conduct a study concerning women's entry into apprenticeship programs. The purpose of this study is: (1) to identify differences in prior education and training between women who have unsuccessfully applied for apprenticeship and those who have been accepted; and (2) to determine what programs are most needed and would be most useful in preparing women for entry into apprenticeship programs.

Presently we are distributing questionnaires to women apprentices and applicants. (A copy of the questionnaire is enclosed for your information.) I am writing to ask your assistance in helping us to identify and locate the women applicants and apprentices with whom your Council has had contact during the past three years. Some of the Joint Apprenticeship Councils we have already contacted have preferred to distribute the questionnaires themselves; we have provided these Councils with the questionnaires in a stamped envelope so that the JAC simply has to address the envelopes. Other Councils have preferred to provide us with the names and addresses of the women apprentices and applicants and we have addressed the envelopes ourselves and mailed out the questionnaires.

We will be contacting you shortly by telephone to determine whether you would prefer for us to mail out the questionnaires or whether you prefer to mail them out directly from your office.

In addition to obtaining the views of women who have been successful and women who have failed to gain admission to apprenticeship programs, we will interview a selected sample of Joint Apprenticeship Councils about the problems women face in obtaining entrance into apprenticeship programs; what training, from their perspective, is most lacking; what deficiencies they see most often in women applicants; and what kind of preparatory training the JACs feel give women the best opportunity to succeed.

Since the national sample of women applicants and apprentices is so small, we would sincerely appreciate your cooperation.

Sincerely yours,
Rj ASSOCIATES, INC.

Roslyn D. Kane

RDK/mjl

163

Roslyn D. Kane
President

1018 Wilson Boulevard, Arlington, Virginia 22209 (703) 524-3360

FIGURE 2

Rj associates

January 1977

Dear Apprentice/Applicant:

Under a contract from the U.S. Office of Education, Rj Associates, a woman-owned consulting firm is undertaking research designed to identify problems women have in gaining admission into apprenticeship. The purpose of the research is to determine what experiences and programs are helpful to women in assisting them to prepare for and then pass their apprenticeship examinations. Hopefully, the research will eventually increase the number of women who successfully gain admission to apprenticeships.

Since you are one of the few women in the United States who have applied for apprenticeship, your participation in the study is the key to its success.

We would like you to fill out the attached questionnaire, which will provide much needed information, and return it to us in the stamped pre-addressed envelope. Your answer will help others to benefit from your experiences.

You are not required to participate in this study, but we would sincerely appreciate your assistance.

Sincerely yours,

Rj ASSOCIATES, INC.

Roslyn D. Kane

Roslyn D. Kane, President
and Project Director

RDK/aif

Enclosure

1018 Wilson Boulevard, Arlington, Virginia 22209 (703) 524-3360

Please answer all questions as indicated.

1. For which apprenticeships have you applied?

Name of Apprenticeship	Date Applied	Answer YES, NO, or Not Required (NR)		
		Were You Accepted?	Did You Pass Written Exam?	Did You Pass Oral Exam?
(a)				
(b)				
(c)				

2. If you took a written or an oral examination, did you have difficulty with any of the following? (Check as many as appropriate.)

(a) ____Math questions

(b) ____Questions on use of tools

(c) ____General questions

(d) ____Oral interview with Joint Apprenticeship Council

(e) Other(s)(Please specify)_____

_____

(f) ____Did not find examination difficult

3. If you took the written examination, indicate how helpful each of the following was to you. (Check one for each item a-f.)

	(1) Very	(2) A Little	(3) Not At All	(4) Did Not Have
(a) Special course to prepare for examination	____	____	____	____
(b) High school vocational training	____	____	____	____
(c) Postsecondary vocational training	____	____	____	____
(d) Strong mathematics background	____	____	____	____
(e) Experience working with tools	____	____	____	____
(f) Other(s)(Describe) _____	____	____	____	____
_____	____	____	____	____

4. Indicate if you had problems in taking the oral examination or interview:

	(1) Major Problem	(2) Minor Problem	(3) No Problem
(a) Felt uncomfortable with the JAC members	____	____	____
(b) Felt insecure about the subject matter being asked	____	____	____
(c) Other(s)(Describe) _____	____	____	____
_____	____	____	____

IF YOU HAVE BEEN ADMITTED TO AN APPRENTICESHIP, PLEASE ANSWER QUESTIONS 5 AND 6.
IF YOU WERE NOT ADMITTED, GO ON TO QUESTION 7.

5. (a) Have you experienced problems since you were admitted to apprenticeship?

☐ Yes ☐ Somewhat ☐ No

(b) If you answered yes or somewhat, what are the problems you have experienced since entering apprenticeship? (Check as many as appropriate.)

(1) ____Difficulty in adjusting to the work

(2) ____Difficulty with related instruction

(3) ____Fellow workers had difficulty adjusting to women

(4) ____Supervisors on the job had difficulty adjusting to women

(5) ____Irregularity of placements

(6) ____Lack of placements

(7) Other(s)(Please specify)_____

_____

_____

(c) Did you discontinue your apprenticeship? ☐ Yes ☐ No

(1) ____Because of any of the problems checked above

(2) Other problem(s)(Please specify)_____

_____

_____

6. What kinds of preparation prior to your start of apprenticeship helped you (or would have helped you) resolve the problems listed above (1-7)? (Check as many as appropriate.)

	Did Help	Would Have Helped
(a) More vocational courses in field or specialty	____	____
(b) More math courses	____	____
(c) Individual counseling	____	____
(d) Group discussion sessions	____	____
(e) Longer pre-apprenticeship programs	____	____
(f) More work with tools	____	____
(g) Other(s)(Please specify)_____	____	____
_____	____	____

7. Education (highest grade completed): _____ Date completed _____

8. What high school program did you take? (Check one)

☐ College preparatory ☐ General education ☐ Vocational education

9. If you took a vocational program in high school,

(a) What program did you take? _____

(b) Did you complete it? ☐ Yes ☐ No

10. Do you feel your high school program, whether general, college preparatory, or vocational, helped prepare you for taking your apprenticeship examination?

☐ Yes ☐ A Little ☐ No

11. (a) If your high school program did not help prepare you for the apprenticeship examination, was it because: (For each statement (1-4), place a check in column (1), Math Courses, and/or column (2), Vocational Courses, if the statement applies to your experience in those courses.)

	(1) Math Courses	(2) Vocational Courses
1. Needed more courses in:	____	____
2. Needed more apprenticeship-related courses:	____	____
3. The teaching and/or course content were inadequate:	____	____
4. Other(s)(Describe)_____	____	____
_____	____	____
_____	____	____

(b) How many math and vocational courses did you take in high school? (Enter the number of courses in each.)

☐ Math ☐ Vocational

The number of courses refers to (check one):

☐ Years ☐ Semesters ☐ Quarters ☐ Trimesters

12. (a) Did you attend a postsecondary school? (Please check one.)

1. ☐ No
2. ☐ Yes, a four-year college or university
3. ☐ Yes, a two-year junior college (academic)
4. ☐ Yes, a vocational/technical school (or such a program at a junior college)
5. ☐ Yes, Other(s)(Please specify)_____

_____

(b) If you did not attend postsecondary school, go on to question 15.

(c) If you did, please specify the type of training. _____

_____

_____

13. (a) Did your postsecondary school program help prepare you for the apprenticeship examination, interview, or other application requirements?

☐ Yes ☐ A Little ☐ No

(b) If your postsecondary school program did not help prepare you for the apprenticeship examination, was it because: (For each statement (1-4), place a check in column (1), Math Courses, and/or column (2), Vocational courses, if the statement applies to your experience in those courses.)

		(1) Math Courses	(2) Vocational Courses
1.	Needed more courses in:	____	____
2.	Needed more apprenticeship-related courses:	____	____
3.	The teaching and/or course content were inadequate:	____	____
4.	Other(s) (Describe) _____	____	____
	_____	____	____
	_____	____	____

(c) How many math and vocational courses did you take in postsecondary school? (Enter the number of courses in each.)

☐ Math ☐ Vocational

The number of courses refers to (check one):

☐ Years ☐ Semesters ☐ Quarters ☐ Trimesters

14. Did you participate in an employment and training (manpower) program or any other special program designed to prepare women for admission to apprenticeship (other than secondary and postsecondary school)?

☐ Yes ☐ No

If yes, please specify:

(a) Program name and/or sponsoring agency: _____

(b) How long was the program? _____

(c) Did you complete the program? ☐ Yes ☐ No

Was the program helpful in assisting you prepare for:

	(1) Yes	(2) Somewhat	(3) No	(4) Not Relevant
(d) Your written examination	____	____	____	____
(e) Your oral examination/or interview	____	____	____	____
(f) Would it have been more helpful if it had been longer?	____	____	____	____
(g) Did it include enough skill training?	____	____	____	____

(h) What other components would have been helpful? (Please specify) _____

_____

_____

15. (a) What was the last job you held prior to applying for apprenticeship?

_____

(b) Please give the dates of your employment indicating when you began the job and when it ended. (If still employed, state ending data as present.)

_____

16. Prior to taking your examination(s) for admission to apprenticeship, had you had any experience working with tools other than in a vocational school classroom or a manpower program?

☐ Yes ☐ No

If yes, how did you get the experience? (Check as many as appropriate.)

(a) ☐ At work

(b) ☐ In working around the home/car/boat?

(c) By participating in a hobby group:

1. In school? ☐
2. In community program? ☐
3. Other (Describe) _____

_____

_____

17. Your age: _____

18. Your race:
- ☐ Black/Negro
- ☐ Caucasian/White
- ☐ Hispanic
- ☐ Asian or Pacific Islander
- ☐ American Indian or Alaskan Native

19. Your marital status: ☐ Married ☐ Separated ☐ Single ☐ Widowed ☐ Divorced

20. (a) Number of children: _____

(b) Number of other dependents: _____

21. Having been through the process of applying for apprenticeship, what programs do you feel would be useful to a woman in assisting her to gain admission to apprenticeship? (Check one for each item (a) through (g).)

	(1) Very Useful	(2) Somewhat Useful	(3) Not Useful	(4) Don't Know
(a) Vocational courses in her field of specialty	___	___	___	___
(b) Math courses	___	___	___	___
(c) Individual counseling	___	___	___	___
(d) Group discussions	___	___	___	___
(e) Pre-apprenticeship program	___	___	___	___
(f) Experience with tools	___	___	___	___
(g) Other(s) (Please specify) _____				
_____	___	___	___	___
_____	___	___	___	___

When you have completed the questionnaire, tear off the cover letter, fold the questionnaire in thirds, insert it in the pre-addressed envelope, and mail directly to:

Rj Associates, Inc.
1018 Wilson Boulevard
Arlington, VA 22209

You will need no stamps for the mailing.

Thank you for your help.

JAC Interviews

1. Have you observed any differences in the women who apply for apprenticeship, and the men who apply?

2. (a) Have most of the women who apply for admission taken a course to prepare for their apprenticeship examination? If yes, was it a high school course, postsecondary, or manpower program?

   (b) Have most of the men who apply for admission taken a course to prepare for their apprenticeship examination? If yes, was it a high school course, postsecondary, or manpower program?

3. Have you accepted any women apprentices? How many?

4. Have you observed any differences between the women applicants who do not pass the examination, and the women whom you accept for apprenticeship? If there is a difference, what do you think is the cause of the difference?

5. What kinds of preparation would you advise a young woman to take in order to be able to pass your examination?

6. For those women who fail the apprenticeship examination, do most fail the written, or the oral interview?

   (a) What specific problems do they have with the written examination?

   (b) What specific problems do they have with the oral interview?

7. Of the women who have been accepted for apprenticeship, do they have more problems on the job than do your men apprentices? If yes, what particular kinds of problems:

   (a) Handling the tools

   (b) Developing skills

   (c) Doing heavy work

(d) Adjusting to their supervisors

(e) Adjusting to their fellow workers

(f) Others

8. Do they have problems with their related instructions?

9. What age range are your women apprentices? Your women applicants? Your men apprentices? Your men applicants?

10. Other problems of significance.

RECRUITMENT PROGRAM INTERVIEW

1. Do you have more applicants than you can accept?

   (a) If no, how do you identify, reach, encourage the participation of women?

   (b) If yes, how do you decide whom you will accept?

2. For how long do the women remain in your program?

   (a) Do most women who enter complete the program?

   (b) Describe the components of your program

3. What kind of success do women who participate in your program have in gaining access to apprenticeship?

   (a) If their admission rate has not been as good as the program would like, to what do you attribute the problem?

   (b) What components, if any, would you like to add to your programs?

   (c) Would you like to extend your program a longer period of time?

4. Have the women who enter your program had any relevant previous experience (at work, vocational programs, hobbies, etc.)? If yes, describe.

5. How do you think the women who are accepted for apprenticeship differ from those who are not accepted?

   (a) Describe any differences you perceive.

   (b) What, if anything, could be done to improve the situation for the applicants who are not accepted?

6. Do you have any contact with the women in your program after they have been accepted for apprenticeship?

   (a) If yes, are they having any problems during apprenticeship?

   (b) If they are, describe the types of problems.

(c) What kinds of programs should be instituted to eradicate the problems they are having?

(d) (If appropriate), who should run these programs?

7. How old are your women participants (age range)?

(a) Does their age make any difference in their success rate of being accepted?

(b) Does their age make any difference in their success as apprentices?

ADDITIONAL QUESTIONS FOR RECRUITMENT PROGRAMS

AS REQUESTED BY WOMEN'S BUREAU

1. Determine size of staff, length of program, curriculum being utilized (was it adapted for this program or merely lifted from some place else)?

2. Determine if and why women go into and/or do better at particular occupations?

3. Extent to which programs designed for minorities have been adopted for women with no redesign.

4. Are efforts made to work with supervisors and fellow workers to prevent harassment? What do they do if a woman is having problem on the job?

5. To what extent are supportive services needed (after a woman is on the job)?
   What childcare facilities they are using?

6. Extent to which there is interaction between JAC, related instruction and manpower program?

7. Determine who runs the manpower program, who funds it?

8. Who is passing the written examination but not the oral? Why?

9. How do women learn about apprenticeship programs?

10. What efforts have JACs made to recruit women?
    Where do they go?